

9.4.1

Lesson 24

Introduction

In this lesson, students are introduced to the process of drafting an evidence-based argument essay. Over the course of the next five lessons (9.4.1 Lessons 24–29) students draft, revise, and edit an essay in response to the following question: Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that goods are ethically produced? This prompt encourages students to engage in cross-textual analysis between the ideas presented in *Sugar Changed the World* and the arguments presented in the supplementary texts they have read throughout this module.

Students begin the process of constructing an outline for their argument essay guided by the Argument Outline Tool. Students determine a central claim in response to their End-of-Unit Assessment question, drawing upon the arguments that they have been delineating and evaluating in supplemental texts in this module. Students then work with the Argument Outline Tool to identify and organize claims and counterclaims that support the central claim they have developed. Students identify one piece of evidence from the texts they have read in this module that supports each claim and counterclaim. Students complete their Argument Outline Tool in this lesson, in which they identify the strengths and limitations of the claims and counterclaims they have identified through analysis of the evidence that supports them.

For homework, students craft a first draft of the introduction to clearly state the central claim of their argument essay.

- ① The process of drafting, revising, and reviewing the End-of-Unit Assessment essay may require additional class time. Ensure that there is enough time in the process that all students have access to teacher review and feedback. Depending on the resources available, consider planning for students to spend time in a computer lab during the drafting and revision process.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.1.a, b	<p>Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. Explore and inquire into areas of interest to formulate an argument.</p> <p>a. Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.</p> <p>b. Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, supplying evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience’s knowledge level and concerns.</p>
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.4	Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.
W.9-10.5	Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach, focusing on addressing what is most significant for a specific purpose and audience.
W.9-10.9	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>Student learning is assessed via the Argument Outline Tool. The tool is assessed for the strength and organization of claims and evidence to support the central claim, and the analysis of the connections between evidence.</p> <p>i This assessment will be evaluated using the 9.4 Rubric and Checklist.</p>
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <p>i See the Model Argument Outline Tool for High Performance Responses.</p>

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.*
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.*

*Because this is not a close reading lesson, there is no specified vocabulary. However, in the process of returning to the texts, students may uncover unfamiliar words. Teachers can guide students to make meaning of these words by following the protocols described in 1E of this document http://www.engageny.org/sites/default/files/resource/attachments/9-12_ela_prefatory_material.pdf.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<p>Standards & Text:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: W.9-10.1.a, b, W.9-10.4, W.9-10.5, W.9-10.9 Text: <i>Sugar Changed the World</i> and all supplementary module texts: “Globalization” (http://go.worldbank.org/V7BJE9FD30), “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” (www.law.fordham.edu), “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for Our Cheap Clothes?” (www.cnn.com), and “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream” (http://www.nytimes.com/2009/01/15/opinion/15kristof.html?_r) <p>Learning Sequence:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Introduction to the Writing Process Organization and Outline Argument Outline Tool and Assessment Introduction Instruction and Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% 15% 30% 30% 10%

Materials

- Student copies of the 9.4 Rubric and Checklist (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 14)
- Student copies of the Argument Outline Tool (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 14)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and assessed standard for this lesson: W.9-10.1.a, b. Explain that in this lesson students begin the process of drafting an evidence-based argument essay and complete an outline of their essay guided by the Argument Outline Tool. This tool guides students to determine a central claim in response to the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt, drawing upon the arguments that they have been delineating and evaluating in supplemental texts in this module. Students then identify and organize supporting claims and counterclaims, and identify evidence from module texts that supports these claims.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

ⓘ Display the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that goods are ethically produced? Provide evidence from *Sugar Changed the World* and at least two additional texts in your response.

- ▶ Students follow along.

ⓘ **Differentiation Consideration:** It may be helpful to allow time for students to discuss the prompt or share their initial reactions and questions in pairs.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their focus standard to their text. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson’s AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text from the previous lesson’s homework.

Activity 3: Introduction to the Writing Process

15%

Remind students that the writing process is *iterative*, much like the research and information writing that they completed in Module 9 Unit 3. Remind students that *iterative* means “repeating,” which means students frequently reassess their work or their thinking in order to improve it. In this unit, students compose a formal evidence-based argument essay. Explain that writing is a process that takes many forms and students can craft their essay through a variety of methods. Though there are many different ways to approach the writing process, they all involve multiple drafts and revisions. Inform students they *draft*, *revise*, *peer review*, and *edit* to create a well-crafted argument essay.

- ① Remind students that *drafting* is “drawing up in written form” and *revising* is “altering something already written or printed, in order to make corrections, improve, or update.” Consider asking students why they might need to revise a draft.

Remind students that the argument essay is informative and persuasive, and is meant to clearly present an argument based on evidence. Advise students to keep in mind that the purpose of writing an argument essay is to support claims in an analysis of a *substantive* topic. Explain that students must develop a central claim and support that claim using relevant and sufficient evidence, valid reasoning, and counterclaims.

- ① For clarity, it may be helpful to review to the explanation of the difference between informative and argument writing in the CCSS Appendix A (p. 23): “Although information is provided in both arguments and explanations, the two types of writing have different aims. Arguments seek to make people believe that something is true or to persuade people to change their beliefs or behavior. Explanations, on the other hand, start with the assumption of truthfulness and answer questions about why or how. Their aim is to make the reader understand rather than to persuade him or her to accept a certain point of view. In short, arguments are used for persuasion and explanations for clarification.”

Remind students that an argument essay has a formal structure: introduction, body paragraphs, conclusion, and works cited page. Inform students that they should focus on each of these parts through the following lessons in order to produce a final argument essay for the End-of-Unit Assessment.

- ▶ Students listen.

- ① Consider drawing students’ attention to their engagement with W.9-10.4 in their consideration of the development, organization, and purpose of their argument essay.

Activity 4: Organization and Outline

30%

Distribute copies of the Argument Outline Tool. Instruct students to gather all of the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tools they have completed in this module. Instruct students to write down the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt at the top of their Argument Outline Tool:

Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that goods are ethically produced? Provide evidence from *Sugar Changed the World* and at least two additional texts in your response.

Explain that the focus of this lesson is for students to establish a central claim that is the basis of their argument and to identify and organize supporting claims and counterclaims from module texts. Students record their thinking on the Argument Outline Tool, which supports students in developing a clear structure for their essay prior to writing.

① In this introductory lesson, students focus on identifying claims, counterclaims, and supporting evidence. Students then analyze the strengths and limitations of the claims, counterclaims, and the supporting evidence in order to complete the Argument Outline Tool in this lesson.

Explain that the argument essay writing process begins by forming a central claim. Inform students that they construct a claim in response to the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt, drawing upon the arguments that they have been delineating and evaluating in supplementary texts in this module. Instruct students to take out the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tools that they have used for each supplementary text in this module, and briefly discuss in pairs the strongest or most interesting central claim that has emerged from their analysis.

- ▶ Students write down the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt and form pairs to discuss possible central claims for their argument essay.

Remind students that they have responded to a similar prompt for their Mid-Unit Assessment. Also inform students that, if necessary, they need to refine the central claim on their Argument Outline Tool into one sentence. For instance, if students find the argument in “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” particularly persuasive, then they might craft the following central claim for their argument essay: “Consumers are responsible for the ethical production of goods.”

① This is not the only central claim that students can support with evidence from “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills.” Students could also argue that businesses are responsible for the ethical production of goods, or that businesses and consumers share equal responsibility for the ethical production of goods. The goal is not for students to repeat the arguments of the supplementary texts verbatim, but for students to construct their own central claim and support it with the claims made in the supplementary texts like “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills.”

- ▶ Students write down their central claim on the Argument Outline Tool.

☛ Student responses vary depending on their chosen argument.

① Consider drawing students’ attention to their engagement with W.9-10.5 in their completion of the Argument Outline Tool, which allows students to develop and strengthen their writing by planning and focusing on addressing what is most significant for a specific purpose and audience.

Explain that there are a variety of ways to organize an argument essay. Explain that students should introduce and organize their claims, counterclaims and evidence in a way that establishes clear relationships (reasoning) between all these elements. Display the following claims and counterclaims:

- Central Claim: Consumers bear the responsibility for the ethical production of goods.
- Supporting Claim A: Consumers who buy cheap clothes support the exploitation of the workers who make these cheap clothes.
- Supporting Claim B: Consumers have an ethical responsibility to seek out and buy ethically produced goods, even if it costs more.
- Counterclaim C: Consumers with low incomes need access to inexpensive goods.
- Counterclaim D: Consumers are not aware of the situation in other countries and are therefore not responsible for unethical production.

Explain to students that a strong argument essay begins by establishing the central claim of the argument, then supporting this central claim with additional specific claims based in textual evidence (like the claims made in the supplemental texts students have been reading throughout the module). Effective argument writing traces the relationship between these claims and corresponding counterclaims.

- ① Consider having students brainstorm examples for the central claim, supporting claims, and possible counterclaims rather than providing the above examples.

Ask students:

Which supporting claim corresponds with which counterclaim and why?

- ☛ Supporting Claim A and Counterclaim D go together because they are opposing views on the same topic. Supporting Claim B and Counterclaim C go together because they are alternate claims related to the same topic.
- ① Students have had direct instruction on introducing and organizing claims, counterclaims, and evidence (W.9-10.1.a, b) in Lesson 10, and should be familiar with evaluating the relationship between claims and counterclaims.

Instruct students to discuss in pairs possible supporting claims and corresponding counterclaims that support their central claim.

- ① Remind students that their claims and counterclaims should be supported with textual evidence. Student discussion should be based on the text-evidence collection they have completed throughout this module on their Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tools.
 - ▶ Students discuss possible supporting claims, counterclaims, and supporting evidence in pairs.

- ① The organizational structure in this lesson is not meant to be prescriptive but rather to model a way to potentially organize an argument essay. If students require more explicit modeling or instruction around the organization of argument essays, consider providing additional resources and graphic organizers to help students structure their claims and evidence.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion. Ask pairs to briefly share the results of their discussion.

Instruct students to independently copy onto their Argument Outline Tool the supporting claims and counterclaims they identified. Remind students that the purpose of this outline is to have a clear plan for their argument essay and to consolidate all of their evidence. Instruct students to select the strongest evidence to support their claim.

- 🗨 See the Model Argument Outline Tool for possible student responses.

Explain that the portion of the outline they have completed is the frame for the essay's introduction (which introduces the central claim) and the body (which presents the claims, counterclaims, and evidence that support the central claim). Inform students that they complete their analysis of the evidence that supports these claims and counterclaims in this lesson.

- ① Consider reminding students that completion of the Argument Outline Tool helps them keep track of evidence they are to use later in the End-of-Unit Assessment, which focuses on the development of an argument. Completion of the tool supports students' engagement with W.9-10.9, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.

Activity 5: Argument Outline Tool and Assessment

30%

Inform students that their Argument Outline Tool serves as this lesson's assessment. They are assessed on their central claim, their identification of three supporting claims and counterclaims with one piece of evidence for each claim, and their brief analysis of the evidence and reasoning that supports each claim. Inform students that the 9.4 Rubric and Checklist guides the evaluation of this assessment, and students should refer to their checklists while completing their Argument Outline Tool.

- ▶ Students independently work on their Argument Outline Tool.
- ① Students do not need to fill out the "Conclusion" portion of the tool, as they return to this tool in subsequent lessons to develop and draft their conclusion.
- ① The Argument Outline Tool serves as the assessment for this lesson.

Activity 6: Introduction Instruction and Closing

10%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to draft the introduction of their argument essay. Direct students to the substandard W.9-10.1.a on their 9.4 Rubric and Checklist. Remind students to reference this checklist as they are drafting their introduction.

- ▶ Students examine the checklist for substandard W.9-10.1.a.

Pose the following question for class discussion:

What do you know about an introduction based on the work you have done in the past?

☞ Student responses may include:

- An introduction is the first part of an essay.
- The introduction should tell the reader the central claim of the essay.
- It can also be the “hook” that grabs readers’ attention.
- The introduction should be a high-level overview of the essay and not include all of the smaller details in the essay.

① Potential student responses are drawn from the previous instruction of introductions in this curriculum. Refer to 9.1.1 Lesson 15 and 9.3.3 Lesson 2.

Inform students that many of the conventions that they established for an effective introduction in a research paper in 9.3.3 Lesson 2 apply to introductions in argument essays.

Explain that an introduction is the first part of an argument essay. An introduction should be interesting and grab the reader’s attention, give context for the topic of the argument essay, preview what follows, and include the central claim of the argument essay. A good introduction should be one to two paragraphs long. Typically, although not always, the central claim should be the last sentence of the introduction. Explain to students that they should include their strongest claims in the introduction in a clear, organized fashion, but they do not need to include all the evidence that supports the claims—that evidence comes in the body of the argument essay.

Explain that there are many methods for creating an interesting introduction that grabs the reader’s attention. Explain that students can present a problem, question, or interesting fact associated with their argument. Inform students that the rhetorical techniques that they have been analyzing in the supplementary texts in this module (direct address to the audience, alliteration, parallel structure, appeal to authority, and rhetorical questions) are often strong ways of beginning argument writing pieces.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Remind students that this is a first draft, and while they should be focusing on the conventions established for an effective introduction, students receive peer feedback on their introductions in the next lesson (9.4.1 Lesson 25) and continue to edit and refine their writing in later lessons.

Homework

Draft the introduction to your argument essay introduction, including your specific central claim.

Model Argument Outline Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
<p>[Introduction]</p> <p>Question: Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that goods are ethically produced? Provide evidence from <i>Sugar Changed the World</i> and at least two additional texts in your response.</p> <p>Central Claim: Consumers bear the responsibility for the ethical production of goods.</p>					
<p>[Body] Supporting Claim: Consumers who buy cheap clothes are responsible for the exploitation of the workers who make these cheap clothes.</p>			<p>Counterclaim: The U.S. government’s lifting of import quotas is responsible for the exploitation of the workers who make cheap clothes.</p>		
<p>Evidence: “The reason we have fast fashion ...working in safe and legal conditions.” (“How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills,” paragraph 4)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support your claim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this claim? The limitations of this claim?</i></p>			<p>Evidence: “in 2005 the U.S. government lifted quotas on imports... helped fuel the explosion of fast fashion” (“How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills,” paragraph 6)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support the counterclaim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this counterclaim? The limitations of this counterclaim?</i></p>		
<p>Supporting Claim: Consumers have an ethical responsibility to seek out and buy ethically produced goods, even if it costs more.</p>			<p>Counterclaim: Consumers who live on the poverty line need access to inexpensive goods.</p>		
<p>Evidence: “Scafidi and Cline believe consumers would pay a little bit more ...peace of mind knowing that shirt was made by workers treated not just humanely, but fairly?” (“How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills,” paragraph 13)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support your claim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this claim? The limitations of this claim?</i></p>			<p>Evidence: “Especially in a recession, cheap clothing is a welcome industry for many. People in western countries living on the poverty line need to buy clothes for their children.” (“Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?,” paragraph 10)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support this counterclaim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this counterclaim? The limitations of this counterclaim?</i></p>		

<p>Supporting Claim: Consumers should boycott companies that do not make their goods ethically.</p>	<p>Counterclaim: Sweatshops provide important jobs for poor people in poor countries, and boycotts will just make those factories shut down and take away those jobs.</p>
<p>Evidence: “Slave labor was valuable because it produced cheap ... some 400,000 English people stopped buying the sugar that slaves grew and harvested.” (<i>Sugar Changed the World</i>, p. 78)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support your claim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this claim? The limitations of this claim?</i></p>	<p>Evidence: “The best way to help people in the poorest countries isn’t to campaign against sweatshops but to promote manufacturing there.” (“Where Sweatshops are a Dream,” paragraph 14)</p> <p>Reasoning: <i>How does the evidence support this counterclaim?</i></p> <p>Strengths and Limitations: <i>What are the strengths of this counterclaim? The limitations of this counterclaim?</i></p>
<p>[Conclusion]</p>	

From Outline Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.