

Tri-State Quality Review Rubric for Lessons & Units: ELA/Literacy (Grades 3-5) and ELA (Grades 6-12) – Version 5

Grade: Literacy Lesson/Unit Title:

Overall Rating:

I. Alignment to the Depth of the CCSS	II. Key Shifts in the CCSS	III. Instructional Supports	IV. Assessment
<p><i>The lesson/unit aligns with the letter and spirit of the CCSS:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Targets a set of grade-level CCSS ELA/Literacy standards. ▪ Includes a clear and explicit purpose for instruction. ▪ Selects text(s) that measure within the grade-level text complexity band and are of sufficient quality and scope for the stated purpose. (i.e., presents vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose, and other qualitative characteristics similar to CCSS grade-level exemplars in Appendices A & B) <p><u><i>In addition, for units:</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Integrates reading, writing, speaking and listening so that students apply and synthesize advancing literacy skills. ▪ (Grades 3-5) Builds students’ content knowledge and their understanding of reading and writing in social studies, the arts, science or technical subjects through the coherent selection of texts. 	<p><i>The lesson/unit addresses key shifts in the CCSS:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Reading Text Closely: Makes reading text(s) closely, examining textual evidence, and discerning deep meaning a central focus of instruction. ▪ Text-Based Evidence: Facilitates rich and rigorous evidence-based discussions and writing about common texts through a sequence of specific, thought-provoking, and text-dependent questions (including, when applicable, questions about illustrations, charts, diagrams, audio/video, and media). ▪ Writing from Sources: Routinely expects that students draw evidence from texts to produce clear and coherent writing that informs, explains, or makes an argument in various written forms (notes, summaries, short responses, or formal essays). ▪ Academic Vocabulary: Focuses on building students’ academic vocabulary in context throughout instruction. <p><u><i>In addition, for units:</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increasing Text Complexity: Focuses students on reading a progression of complex texts drawn from the grade-level band. Provides text-centered learning that is sequenced, scaffolded and supported to advance students toward independent reading of complex texts at the CCR level. ▪ Building Disciplinary Knowledge: Provides opportunities for students to build knowledge about a topic or subject through analysis of a coherent selection of strategically sequenced, discipline-specific texts. ▪ Balance of Texts: Within a collection of grade level units a balance of informational and literary texts is included according to guidelines in the CCSS (p. 5). ▪ Balance of Writing: Includes a balance of on-demand and process writing (e.g., multiple drafts and revisions over time) and short, focused research projects, incorporating digital texts where appropriate. 	<p><i>The lesson/unit is responsive to varied student learning needs:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Cultivates student interest and engagement in reading, writing, and speaking about texts. ▪ Addresses instructional expectations and is easy to understand and use. ▪ Provides <i>all</i> students with multiple opportunities to engage with text of appropriate complexity for the grade level; includes appropriate scaffolding so that students directly experience the complexity of the text. ▪ Focuses on challenging sections of text(s) and engages students in a productive struggle through discussion questions and other supports that build toward independence. ▪ Integrates appropriate supports in reading, writing, listening and speaking for students who are ELL, have disabilities, or read well below the grade level text band. ▪ Provides extensions and/or more advanced text for students who read well above the grade level text band. <p><u><i>In addition, for units:</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Includes a progression of learning where concepts and skills advance and deepen over time. ▪ Gradually removes supports, requiring students to demonstrate their independent capacities. ▪ Provides for authentic learning, application of literacy skills, student-directed inquiry, analysis, evaluation, and/or reflection. ▪ Integrates targeted instruction in such areas as grammar and conventions, writing strategies, discussion rules, and all aspects of foundational reading for grades 3-5. ▪ Includes independent reading based on student choice and interest to build stamina, confidence, and motivation; indicates how students are accountable for that reading. ▪ Uses technology and media to deepen learning and draw attention to evidence and texts as appropriate. 	<p><i>The lesson/unit regularly assesses whether students are mastering standards-based content and skills:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Elicits direct, observable evidence of the degree to which a student can independently demonstrate the major targeted grade level CCSS standards with appropriately complex text(s). ▪ Assesses student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students. ▪ Includes aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines that provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance. <p><u><i>In addition, for units:</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Uses varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre, formative, summative, and self-assessment measures.
<p align="center">Rating: 3 2 1 0</p>	<p align="center">Rating: 3 2 1 0</p>	<p align="center">Rating: 3 2 1 0</p>	<p align="center">Rating: 3 2 1 0</p>

Tri-State Quality Review Rubric for Lessons & Units: ELA/Literacy (Grades 3-5) and ELA (Grades 6-12) – Version 5

Quality review process for individuals or groups:

Step 1 – Review Materials

- Record the grade and title of the lesson/unit on the recording form; scan to see what the lesson/unit contains and how it is organized
- Read key materials related to instruction, assessment and teacher guidance
- Study and measure the text(s) that serves as the centerpiece for the lesson/unit, analyzing text complexity, quality, scope, and relationship to instruction

Step 2 – Apply Criteria in Dimension I: Alignment

- Identify the grade-level CCSS that the lesson/unit targets
- Closely examine the materials through the “lens” of each criterion
- Individually check each criterion for which clear and substantial evidence is found
- Identify and record input on specific improvements that might be made to meet criteria or strengthen alignment
- Enter your rating 0 – 3 for Dimension I: Alignment

Note: Dimension I is non-negotiable and a rating of 2 or 3 is required for the review to continue. If the review is discontinued, consider giving general feedback to developers/teachers regarding next steps.

Step 3 – Apply Criteria in Dimensions II – IV

- Closely examine the lesson/unit through the “lens” of each criterion
- Record comments on criteria met, improvements needed and then rate 0 – 3

When working in a group, individuals may choose to compare ratings after each dimension or delay conversation until each person has rated and recorded their input for the remaining Dimensions II – IV.

Step 4 – Apply an Overall Rating and Provide Summary Comments

- Review ratings for Dimensions I – IV adding/clarity comments as needed
- Write summary comments for your overall rating on your recording sheet
- Total dimension ratings and record overall rating E, E/I, R, N – adjust as necessary

Step 5 – Compare Overall Ratings and Determine Next Steps

- Note the evidence cited to arrive at final ratings, summary comments and similarities and differences among raters. Recommend next steps for the lesson/unit and provide recommendations for improvement and/or ratings to developers/teachers

Additional Guidance for ELA/Literacy – When selecting text(s) that measure within the grade-level text complexity band and are of sufficient quality and scope for the stated purpose, see *The Common Core State Standards in English Language Arts/Literacy* at www.corestandards.org/ELA-Literacy; and the *Supplement for Appendix A: New Research on Text Complexity as well as Quantitative and Qualitative Measures* at www.achievethecore.org/steal-these-tools/text-complexity. See *The Publishers’ Criteria* for Grades K-2 and the same for Grades 3-12 at www.achievethecore.org/steal-these-tools.

Rating Scales

Note: Rating for Dimension I: Alignment is non-negotiable and requires a rating of 2 or 3. If rating is 0 or 1 then the review does not continue.

Rating Scale for Dimensions I, II, III, IV:

3: Meets most to all of the criteria in the dimension

2: Meets many of the criteria in the dimension

1: Meets some of the criteria in the dimension

0: Does not meet the criteria in the dimension

Descriptors for Dimensions I, II, III, IV:

3: Exemplifies CCSS Quality – meets the standard described by criteria in the dimension, as explained in criterion-based observations.

2: Approaching CCSS Quality – meets many criteria but will benefit from revision in others, as suggested in criterion-based observations.

1: Developing toward CCSS Quality – needs significant revision, as suggested in criterion-based observations.

0: Not representing CCSS Quality – does not address the criteria in the dimension.

Overall Rating for the Lesson/Unit:

E: Exemplar – Aligned and meets most to all of the criteria in dimensions II, III, IV (**total 11 – 12**)

E/I: Exemplar if Improved – Aligned and needs some improvement in one or more dimensions (**total 8 – 10**)

R: Revision Needed – Aligned partially and needs significant revision in one or more dimensions (**total 3 – 7**)

N: Not Ready to Review – Not aligned and does not meet criteria (**total 0 – 2**)

Descriptors for Overall Rating:

E: Exemplifies CCSS Quality – Aligned and exemplifies the quality standard and exemplifies most of the criteria across Dimensions II, III, IV of the rubric.

E/I: Approaching CCSS Quality – Aligned and exemplifies the quality standard in some dimensions but will benefit from some revision in others.

R: Developing toward CCSS Quality – Aligned partially and approaches the quality standard in some dimensions and needs significant revision in others.

N: Not representing CCSS Quality – Not aligned and does not address criteria.

12.2.1 Lesson 3

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue their analysis of Bhutto’s speech, “Ideas Live On,” paying particular attention to how Bhutto develops central ideas in paragraphs 24–28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”), in which Bhutto calls on her audience to choose democracy in the upcoming elections. Students work in pairs to read paragraphs 24–28, analyzing how the conclusion develops central ideas that were introduced earlier in the speech. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How do paragraphs 24–28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

For homework, students reread Bhutto’s speech and respond to the following question: How do Bhutto’s choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech? Also for homework, students read the first three sentences of Henry David Thoreau’s essay, “Civil Disobedience,” and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes toward government.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.11-12.9.b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i> , presidential addresses]”).
L.11-12.5.a	Demonstrate understanding of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings. a. Interpret figures of speech (e.g., hyperbole, paradox) in context and analyze their

Comment [CK1]: This is big; we know that, right? Less is more at the lesson level. Notice that it’s okay to acknowledge that a lesson will deal meaningfully with standards that it doesn’t assess. You shouldn’t assess all the standards in every lesson. Pick one (or 2 if it makes very good sense), and focus on those. Here, the assessed standard is around central ideas. Look at how other standards still pop up throughout the lesson.

	role in the text.
--	-------------------

Assessment

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How do paragraphs 24–28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify two central ideas in Bhutto’s speech (e.g., the exercise of power; the relationship between the individual and the state.).
- Identify how Bhutto uses paragraphs 24–28 to refine central ideas (e.g., Bhutto uses the final paragraphs of her speech to refine the central ideas of the exercise of power and the relationship between the individual and the state. In paragraph 24, Bhutto lists many of the problems facing Pakistan and states that they “cannot be solved through the model of a rentier military class.” Bhutto’s criticism of the military government refines the idea of the exercise of power that Bhutto introduces earlier in the speech. By pointing out the failure of the military government, Bhutto reinforces her statement in paragraph 2 that the exercise of power through military strength is “no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation” and her proposal that a nation’s greatness is determined by “the strength of the intellect” instead. In paragraph 26, Bhutto again rejects the exercise of power through the military and calls instead for the exercise of power by the people in order to establish “regional peace as well as internal stability.” This rejection develops the idea that the exercise of military power profits from and encourages conflict. Bhutto’s criticism of military power builds on her explanation in paragraph 18 of how and why the military government uses “a crisis or a threat” to gain power. Bhutto also uses the final paragraphs of her speech to refine the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state. In paragraph 27, Bhutto calls Pakistan a “fractured, bleeding society” and suggests that democracy will support “the people’s dreams, hopes and aspirations” (par. 27). Bhutto’s view of democracy supports the idea that the relationship between the individual and the state should be one in which the state represents the individual and invests in the needs of the individual. This view is clear in Bhutto’s earlier statement that the government should invest in its citizens’ education so that it can provide “more opportunity for individuals trained to take advantage” of global economies (par. 8).).

Comment [CK2]: What makes this work is both that you’ve developed a prompt AND thought about what a good answer is. Doing this really helps guide the development of the lesson—you can scaffold/build toward that. Remember: focus your efforts and energy. No lesson, excerpt, or activity can explore every nuance of every text. You are ALWAYS making instructional choices about what to address/leave out. Take a look at the choices this lesson makes as you explore it. What doesn’t the lesson deal with?

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • rentier (n.) – person whose income consists primarily of fixed unearned amounts, such as rent or bond interest • enjoined (v.) – directed or ordered to do something • consensus (n.) – general agreement or concord; harmony • fractured (adj.) – broken • revive (v.) – restore from a depressed, inactive, or unused state; bring back • aspirations (n.) – goals or objectives desired
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None.
Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None.

Comment [CK3]: Remember: vocabulary is best taught in context when possible; AND remember that you can't teach everything. Identify what you think are the high impact words and determine whether they are things students need to work out for themselves, or whether it's best just to provide the word and move on. You'll see here that this particular lesson does not include specific vocabulary instruction in the form of word work. These are always judgment calls. Make yours as you look at this. Can you see a good question to build around one of these words?

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<p>Standards & Text:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: RI.11-12.2, W11-12.9.b, L.11-12.5.a • Text: "Ideas Live On" by Benazir Bhutto, paragraphs 24–28 <p>Learning Sequence:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Quick Write 5. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 15% 2. 10% 3. 35% 4. 35% 5. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 1) (optional)
- Copies of “Civil Disobedience” for each student. The paragraphs in this version of “Civil Disobedience” are already numbered.

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

15%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.2. In this lesson, students read and analyze paragraphs 24–28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”), noticing how Bhutto uses the conclusion of her speech to support central ideas in the text. Students engage in evidence-based discussions in pairs and as a class before completing a writing assignment that requires them to consider how paragraphs 24–28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied a focus standard to their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) texts. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson’s AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts from the previous lesson’s homework.

Comment [CK4]: This activity (and the homework accountability one that follows) are part of the routine setting for this curriculum.

Instruct students to take out their responses to the previous lesson’s homework assignment. (Select a central idea from paragraphs 1–3 other than the one you wrote about in class, and explain how Bhutto develops this idea in paragraphs 11–23.) Instruct students to share their responses in pairs.

🗨 Student responses may include:

- Bhutto develops the idea of the exercise of power by demonstrating the negative effects that have resulted from Pakistan not making the shift from exercising power through the military to exercising power through intellectual strength. She explains that the future of Pakistan depends on “the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources” (par. 11) and goes on to describe how military rule has damaged each of these systems. Bhutto states the military rulers have “little incentive to build peace ... restore security ... or allow the empowerment of the people” (par. 18). She says that “justice has systematically been undermined by the military rule” (par. 16) and that the military rule has resulted in an economic system “addicted to aid” (par. 21). Bhutto’s examples show that the exercise of power through “military strength” has damaged Pakistan and that the country should shift to the exercise of power through “the strength of the intellect” (par. 2).
- Bhutto develops the idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by expanding on the statement that “the investment in an individual, through education and health, will determine the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3). In paragraph 11, Bhutto asserts that the “future” of Pakistan “depends on the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources.” She goes on to explain how building systems that support individuals will benefit the state. Bhutto provides a critique of the military government, explaining that Pakistan’s problems, including an “increase in poverty, are directly related to the prolonged period of military domination of our society” (par. 14). In paragraph 18, Bhutto points out that Pakistan’s economic system prevents “the empowerment of the people” and instead requires “subjugating [the people] through militias or abuse of state power.” Noting the large amounts of money that foreign countries give Pakistan, Bhutto protests that the funds have “not improved the lives of our people” and says, “We have a right to ask why this money has not translated into poverty eradication” (par. 22). Bhutto’s critique of the military government in paragraphs 11–23 demonstrates her belief that the state should invest in individuals rather than exploit and subjugate them.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

35%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

- ① If necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider using a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout this lesson:

What are the important ideas in this passage?

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 24–28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definitions of *rentier*, *enjoined*, *consensus*, *fractured*, *revive*, and *aspirations*.

- ① Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the group.
 - ▶ Students write the definitions of *rentier*, *enjoined*, *consensus*, *fractured*, *revive*, and *aspirations* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

How does Bhutto use figurative language to develop a central idea in paragraphs 24–27? (L.11-12.5.a)

- ☛ Student responses should include:
 - In paragraph 25, Bhutto says that to achieve progress Pakistan should ensure “that the light of justice spreads throughout the dark corners of the country.” Her metaphor compares justice to a light and suggests that just as light dispels darkness, so justice will dispel inequity in Pakistan. Bhutto’s words recall her claim that justice under Pakistan’s military government is “elusive” (par. 15). The metaphor supports the central idea of the exercise of power by advancing Bhutto’s belief that Pakistan should abandon military rule in order to restore democracy.
 - In paragraph 27, Bhutto refers to the efforts of earlier leaders “to save our people and our land from the dark shadow of military rule which has blotted out the sun of the people’s dreams, hopes and aspirations.” This develops both the central idea of the exercise of power and the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state. Bhutto describes the exercise of power through military strength as “the dark shadow of military rule” (par. 18). She develops the idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by describing the goals of the individual in terms of “the sun of the people’s dreams,

Comment [CK5]: As you look at the activities in the lesson, think about this: how central is the development of good questions to helping students make meaning from text? In other words, how much of the work of lesson building should developing good questions make up?

Comment [CK6]: Do you need this? Maybe not, but you should definitely have thought about it. Many of the questions were designed by asking what answer/statement a student should make about a section of text and then working backward to figure out the best wording of a question.

Read these questions to test this. See if you can see how this might have worked.

hopes and aspirations” (par. 18), emphasizing their value as something that the state should support rather than destroy.

How does Bhutto’s claim in the first sentence of paragraph 26 relate to a central idea in the speech?

☛ Student responses may include:

- Bhutto’s claim, “It is restoration of democracy that can lead to regional peace as well as internal stability,” develops the central idea of the exercise of power. Her claim suggests that Pakistan should reject the exercise of power by the military and choose democracy, the exercise of power by the people, instead. Bhutto points out that military rule, “an army operation in Baluchistan,” is threatening peace in the nation and she advises “disbanding militias” in order to “save our people.” Bhutto’s observation about the army’s activity in Baluchistan further supports her earlier critiques of military rule.
- Bhutto’s claim supports the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by reminding her audience that the state has a responsibility to foster “internal stability,” which would include providing health and education for its individuals.

How does Bhutto use rhetoric to develop a central idea in paragraph 27?

☛ Student responses may include:

- Bhutto makes an appeal to ethos by alluding to the work of historical figures when she asks her audience “to revive the spirit of Quaid e Azam and Quaid e Awam’s struggle to save our people and our land.” Bhutto’s reference to past leaders recalls their efforts to establish democracy and presents Bhutto as a politician who shares their values and continues their work. The references support the central idea of the exercise of power by suggesting that the people should support Bhutto’s efforts to create a government that exercises power through democracy rather than through military rule because this is what Quaid e Azan and Quaid e Awam, well-respected political heroes, would have done.
- Bhutto appeals to her audience’s emotions in order to develop the central idea of the exercise of power by showing how the exercise of power through military strength, in the form of the military government, is harming Pakistan. She uses vivid descriptive language, referring to Pakistan as a “fractured, bleeding society.” Later, when she describes Pakistan’s citizens as “all its sons and daughters,” she uses the metaphor of family to make her audience feel emotionally connected to Pakistan.

Explain that Bhutto’s vivid description and use of metaphor are examples of *appeals to pathos*. Explain to students that an *appeal to pathos* is a rhetorical device that can be defined as an effort to sway the opinion of readers or listeners by appealing to their emotions.

- ① Consider providing students with the following translations: *Quaid e Azam* is Urdu for “Great Leader” and refers to Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Pakistan’s first political leader, and *Quaid e Awam* is Urdu for “People’s Leader” and refers to Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, a former prime minister of Pakistan who resisted military rule and was Benazir Bhutto’s father.
- ① Consider reminding students of their work with *appeals to ethos* in 12.2.1 Lesson 1. An *appeal to ethos* is a rhetorical device in which an author or speaker appeals to a listener or reader’s conscience or sense of what is right or ethical.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding questions:

How do the words Bhutto uses to describe the society and citizens of Pakistan impact the tone of paragraph 27?

☛ Student responses should include:

- Bhutto refers to Pakistan as a “fractured, bleeding society” and to the citizens as “all its sons and daughters.”
- Bhutto’s description of Pakistan as “fractured” and “bleeding” establishes a tone of pity and compassion that will prompt the audience to take action.
- Bhutto’s description of the citizens of Pakistan as “sons and daughters” creates a tone of empathy by suggesting that Pakistan is like a large family and that the people and the government should have a relationship of love and respect. This image emphasizes Bhutto’s idea that the exercise of power through military rule in Pakistan is inappropriate for the country and that the need for change is urgent. The image also emphasizes the need for the citizens to respond to the needs of the state, just as children respond to the needs of their parents.

What is the effect on Bhutto’s audience of her reference to historical figures in paragraph 27?

- ☛ By referring to the historical figures of Quaid e Azam and Quaid e Awam, Bhutto prompts the audience to recall their efforts to establish democracy and suggests that the audience should support her position because it is similar to those of respected leaders whose values the people share.

What is Bhutto’s call to action in paragraph 28 and how does it develop central ideas from her speech?

☛ Student responses should include:

- Bhutto calls her audience to “revive the democratic system” instead of continuing with Pakistan’s military rule. In so doing, she develops the central idea of the exercise of power

by calling on the audience to revive “the idea of democracy” (par. 1) and to reject the exercise of power through military rule. Bhutto says that in the 21st century, power is shifting “from the might of armies to the strength of the intellect” and that military strength is “no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation” (par. 2). Instead of promoting the exercise of power by the military, voters should support a democratic system.

- Bhutto’s call to “revive the democratic system” develops the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by emphasizing the idea that the state should invest in the individual: “the investment in an individual ... will determine the quality of our society” (par. 3). According to Bhutto, the democratic system will result in a state that recognizes the “dignity, respect and service of our people” (par. 28) and allows individuals to flourish by participating in the “global community” (par. 4).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Quick Write

35%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How do paragraphs 24–28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.

☛ See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

① Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students’ writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

Activity 5: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to reread Bhutto’s speech and respond to the following question:

Comment [CK7]: This is always your assessment. Look at how the lesson builds to the assessment. How straight is the line?

How do Bhutto’s choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech?

Additionally, distribute copies of “Civil Disobedience” by Henry David Thoreau. Inform students that this essay is the next text in Module 12.2, also on the topic of government, and is by American author Henry David Thoreau.

Instruct students to read the first three sentences of “Civil Disobedience” (from “I heartily accept the motto, — ‘That government is best which governs least’” to “and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient”) and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes toward government.

① Consider reminding students of the alternative End-of-Unit Assessment prompt. Provide the following scaffolding question as an optional Accountable Independent Writing (AIW) assignment:

How does Bhutto explain the role of a citizen?

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Reread Bhutto’s speech and respond to the following question:

How do Bhutto’s choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech?

Read the first three sentences of “Civil Disobedience,” part 1, paragraph 1 (from “I heartily accept the motto, — ‘That government is best which governs least’” to “and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient”) and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes toward government.

Creating Questions for Close Analytic Reading Exemplars: A Brief Guide

1. Think about what you think is the most important learning to be drawn from the text. Note this as raw material for the culminating assignment and the focus point for other activities to build toward.
2. Determine the key ideas of the text. Create a series of questions structured to bring the reader to an understanding of these.
3. Locate the most powerful academic words in the text and integrate questions and discussions that explore their role into the set of questions above.
4. Take stock of what standards are being addressed in the series of questions above. Then decide if any other standards are suited to being a focus for this text. If so, form questions that exercise those standards.
5. Consider if there are any other academic words that students would profit from focusing on. Build discussion planning or additional questions to focus attention on them.
6. Find the sections of the text that will present the greatest difficulty and craft questions that support students in mastering these sections. These could be sections with difficult syntax, particularly dense information, and tricky transitions or places that offer a variety of possible inferences.
7. Develop a culminating activity around the idea or learning identified in #1. A good task should reflect mastery of one or more of the standards, involve writing, and be structured to be done by students independently.



Text-Dependent Question Tips and Fixes for Common Errors

The purpose of this document is to provide you with some strategies for question development and revision. Remember, these are guidelines, not solid rules; your good thinking and knowledge of your students should be the first thing you consider when developing sets of questions about any text.

Tips

- **Don't try to teach the whole text with a single question.**
When you do this, you have generally created an assessment question, rather than a question designed to scaffold student learning. Stick with small sections and go deep.
- **Don't worry about writing perfect questions first.**
In fact, write bad questions. Write lots of them. In those bad questions are the ideas you find important in your text. Find the great ideas and wordsmith the questions.
- “Head 'em off at the pass” questions are okay.
If there's a very important and difficult section of text, it's okay to ask a very basic question about it, such as: “What's happening here?” or “What did X just do?”. Remember, though, that the purpose of these questions is to scaffold and guide thinking, not to test comprehension. Keep that distinction clear in your head and your questions will be better. Speaking of which....
- **Use the questions in the instructional sequence as scaffolds.**
Keep assessments where they belong—as assessments of learning. The purpose of the types of text-dependent questions we're talking about is not to assess whether students “got it,” it's to help them get it. This seems like an academic distinction, but it's really not. Keep telling yourself that's the purpose of the questions you're writing, and your questions will be better.
- **Get very clear about the answer you want your question to elicit.**
The better you understand this, the better you're able to see the understanding you're trying to help students develop. If you can articulate very clearly what a great answer would be, that can help you design a great question.

Fixes for Common Errors

There are several types of common errors that crop up when you're developing sets of text dependent questions:

- Teaching the Whole Text with a Question
- Doing the Thinking for Students with a Question
- Overusing Lower Order Thinking Questions

Below are a few examples of these errors. These use the text "The Tell-Tale Heart" by Edgar Allan Poe.

Teaching the Whole Text with a Question:

Before: How does Poe develop the idea of obsession in this story?

This is a problematic question on several levels (see the next error for more details), but for now we're just going to focus on the fact that it's an assessment question posing as a scaffold. It's a great culminating question to ask after students have analyzed the story.

After: How does Poe continue to develop the idea of obsession in this paragraph?

Now this question focuses student's attention on a specific piece of text. There are still some problems with it (if students haven't already been asked about what idea Poe is developing, you've just done the thinking for them), but it narrows the focus to a smaller piece of text.

Doing the Thinking for Students with a Question

Before: "Find two examples of how the narrator is acting anxious and frantic in paragraphs 17 and 18."

The work of reading closely is for students to a) determine that the narrator is anxious and frantic and b) determine why. If you give them this question, students are reduced to hunting for evidence of your thinking, not doing theirs, because you have told them the answer. Avoid telling a student what to look for. Better to tell them what to look AT. "...how the narrator is acting anxious" does the thinking work for the students."

After: "What is the effect of Poe's use of punctuation in paragraphs 17 and 18?"

This question scaffolds students to the right place in the text—the punctuation in this paragraph—and asks them to consider its effect. They have to do some digging and thinking to get to the answer, but they can do it. Asking students to look at the "use of punctuation" directs

them to a location and a particular aspect of the writing, but it stops short of telling them what to see when they look there.

Before: “Fear and obsession drive the narrator’s actions in the story. Describe how fear and obsession affect the narrator’s decision to admit his crime.”

As in the example above, students in this scenario have been given the answer—yours. The work is to explain the rightness of someone else’s cognitive work, generally seen as a less than satisfying way to spend time with a text. A better approach is to provide students with questions that allow them to do the digging.

After: What drives the narrator to “admit the deed?”

In this question, the students have to do the thinking of determining why the narrator did what he did, rather than just finding evidence for another person’s analysis. This one could get too literal, so be ready with some additional scaffolding questions. You could ask students to describe how the narrator responds or reacts as the police interrogate him, for example, as a way to direct their attention to the “what” of the question.

Overusing Lower Order Thinking Questions

Before: Find three adjectives Poe uses to describe the narrator in paragraph 1.

This question isn’t asking students to make meaning, nor does it really ask students to do any thinking about the text. It’s just a scavenger hunt. It is an identification question, nothing that requires higher order thinking skills.

After: Why does the narrator choose the words “calmly” and “healthily” when describing how he is going to tell the story?

This tells students what to look at, “calmly” and “healthily,” but it doesn’t tell them what to see. Rather, it asks students to think about the impact of these words, why they are in the text, and what they mean.

Before: What sound ultimately causes the narrator to confess?

This is a lower order thinking question. A student could skim the text and get this answer, but it requires no real thinking about the text. (It could also be seen as an overly leading question.)

After: How do the noises in the final paragraphs affect the narrator?

This question asks students to do two things: identify the noises present in this paragraph—internal, external, real, imagined—and determine their effects on the narrator. This asks students to synthesize information and to do some deep analysis of what they are reading in this moment.

Checklist for Evaluating Question Quality

Text Under Review (include page #s): _____

✓if yes	Criteria:	Comments/Questions/Fixes (refer to specific questions!):
A. Text Dependent: These things must be true of every question in the set. When evaluating questions, discard all questions that get a “no” in Section A		
	A1. Does the student have to read the text to answer each question?	
	A2. Is it always clear to students that answering each question requires that they must use evidence from the text to support their claims? (Standard One should always be in play!)	
B. Important Considerations: These are design factors to keep in mind for the entire question and task set.		
	B1. Do students have an opportunity to practice speaking and listening while they work with these questions and tasks?	
	B2. Do questions include appropriate scaffolding so all students can understand what is being asked (Are the questions worded in such a way that all students can access them)?	
	B3. At tricky or key points in the text are there check-in questions for students to answer so that teachers can check on students’ understanding and use these sections to enhance reading proficiency?	
	B4. Do questions provide an opportunity for students to determine the meaning of academic vocabulary in context? When possible, do some of these questions explore some aspect of the text as well as important vocabulary?	
	B5. Does the mix of questions addressing syntax, vocabulary, structure and other inferences match the complexity of the text?	
C. Text Specific:		
	C1. Are the questions specific enough so they	

	can only be answered by reference to this text?	
	C2. Are the inferences students are asked to make grounded logically in the text (Can they be answered with careful reading rather than background knowledge)?	
D. Organization of the Questions:		
	D1. Do the early questions in the sequence focus on specific phrases and sentences to support basic comprehension of the text and develop student confidence before moving on to more challenging tasks?	
	D2. Are the questions coherently sequenced? Do they build toward gradual understanding of the text's meaning?	
	D3. Do the questions stay focused on the text and only go beyond it to make other connections in extension activities <i>after</i> the text has been explored?	
	D4. If multiple texts/different media are under consideration, are students asked to examine each text closely before making connections among texts?	
E. Culminating Activity or Writing Prompt:		
	E1. Does the culminating task call on the knowledge and understanding acquired through the questions?	
	E2. Does the writing prompt in the culminating task demand that students write to the text and use evidence?	
	E3. Are the instructions to teacher and student clear about what must be performed to achieve proficiency?	
	E4. Is this a task worthy of the student and classroom time it will consume?	

X.X.XX

Lesson XX

Introduction

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
Addressed Standard(s)	

Assessment

Assessment(s)
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • word (n.) – definition
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • word (n.) – definition

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> word (n.) – definition

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: Text: 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% % % % %

Materials

-

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

This is a teacher action

- ▶ This is a student action (SA)
- ▶ This is a student response (SR)
 - This is an SA/SR bullet
- ① This is an instructional note (IN)
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** The words “Differentiation Consideration:” appear in bold text to signify a differentiation consideration, but the subsequent text appears in regular (non-bold) text. There is no *DC* style, so writers use the *IN* style and manually bold the words “Differentiation Consideration:”

This is a differentiation consideration question
 - ▶ This is a differentiation consideration student action
 - ▶ This is a differentiation consideration student response

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Activity 3:

%

Activity 4:

%

Activity 5:

%

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Homework

File: 11.4.1 Lesson 3 Date: XX/XX/14 Classroom Use: Starting 10/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



engage^{ny}

Our Students. Their Moment.

Tool or Handout Title [MODIFY THIS PAGE OR DELETE IF NOT USED]

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Sample Table Header	Sample Table Header	Sample Table Header