Grade 8: Module 4:
Overview
In this module, students analyze arguments and the evidence used to support arguments to determine whether sufficient evidence has been used and whether the evidence is relevant in support of the claim an author or speaker is making. They then research to gather evidence to make their own spoken and written arguments. Students will read Michael Pollan’s *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (930L), a literary non-fiction text about where food comes from and about making decisions about what food to buy and eat. They build background knowledge about what happens to food before it gets to the consumer, and the different choices the consumer can make when buying food while analyzing Michael Pollan’s arguments and the evidence he uses to support his claims. In Unit 2, students engage in a robust research project in which they further investigate the consequences of each of the food chains and the stakeholders affected in those food chains. To help students grapple with this issue, they use a decision-making process called “Stakeholder Consequences Decision-Making” (see the end of this document for details). This process will help students understand the implications of various choices, and will scaffold their ability to determine, based on evidence and their own values, to take a position on which food chain they would choose if they were trying to feed everyone in the US. Students finish the module by writing a position paper explaining which of Michael Pollan’s food chain they would choose to feed the US and why, and creating a poster stating their position. **This task addresses NYSP12 ELA Standards RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.1a, W.8.1b, W.8.1c, W.8.1d, W.8.1e and W.8.9.**

### Guiding Questions And Big Ideas

- Which of Michael Pollan’s food supply chains would best feed the US?
- How do we make decisions about what we eat?
- What journey does food take before it gets to your plate?
- Has the author or speaker used sufficient relevant evidence and sound reasoning to support his or her claim?
- *The food we buy comes to us from various different routes and processes. We can make more informed decisions about what food to buy when we understand those processes and the stakeholders affected by the food choices we make.*

### Performance Task

This performance task gives students a chance to share their best reading, writing, and thinking about the question: “Which of Michael Pollan’s food supply chains would best feed the United States?” Students will use a powerful excerpt of their position paper, visual components, and text features to create a poster that shows their claim as well as the evidence they used to support their claim. These posters will be displayed around the classroom, with students having the opportunity to do a Gallery Walk of one another’s work. **This task addresses NYSP12 ELA Standards RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.9, and W.8.9b.**
Content Connections

This module is designed to address English Language Arts standards as students read literature and informational text about the Second Sudanese Civil War. However, the module intentionally incorporates Social Studies Practices and Themes to support potential interdisciplinary connections to this compelling content. These intentional connections are described below.

Big ideas and guiding questions are informed by the New York State Common Core K-8 Social Studies Framework:

Unifying Themes (pages 6–7)
• Theme 4: Geography, Humans, and the Environment: The relationship between human populations and the physical world (people, places, and environments); impact of human activities on the environment; interactions between regions, locations, places, people, and environments.
• Theme 9: Science, Technology, and Innovation: Applications of science and innovations in transportation, communication, military technology, agriculture and industrialization.

Social Studies Practices, Geographic Reasoning, Grades 5–8:
• Descriptor 2: Describe the relationships between people and environments and the connections between people and places (page 58).
• Descriptor 3: Identify, analyze, and evaluate the relationship between the environment and human activities, how the physical environment is modified by human activities, and how human activities are also influenced by Earth’s physical features and processes.

Social Studies Practices, Gathering, Using, and Interpreting Evidence, Grades 5-8:
• Descriptor 1: Define and frame questions about events and the world in which we live and use evidence to answer these questions.
• Descriptor 2: Identify, describe, and evaluate evidence about events from diverse sources (including written documents, works of art, photographs, charts and graphs, artifacts, oral traditions, and other primary and secondary sources).
• Descriptor 4: Describe and analyze arguments of others.
• Descriptor 6: Recognize an argument and identify evidence that supports the argument; examine arguments related to a specific social studies topic from multiple perspectives; deconstruct arguments, recognizing the perspective of the argument and identifying evidence used to support that perspective.
**CCS Standards: Reading—Informational Texts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.2. Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including its relationship to supporting ideas; provide an objective summary of the text.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Self-select text to develop personal preferences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Establish and use criteria to classify, select, and evaluate texts to make informed judgments about the quality of pieces.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.2.</th>
<th>I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>I can determine a theme or the central idea throughout the text (including its relationship to supporting ideas).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>I can objectively summarize informational text.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.4. Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including figurative, connotative, and technical meanings; analyze the impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone, including analogies or allusions to other texts.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RI.8.4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.6. Determine an author’s point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RI.8.6.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.8. Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; recognize when irrelevant evidence is introduced.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RI.8.8.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RI.8.9a. Read, annotate, and analyze informational texts on topics related to diverse and non-traditional cultures and viewpoints.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RI.8.9a.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
English Language Arts Outcomes

**C.8 Standards: Writing**

- **W.8.1.** Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.
  - a. Introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically.
  - b. Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant evidence, using accurate, credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text.
  - c. Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
  - d. Establish and maintain a formal style.
  - e. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.

- **W.8.4.** Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Grade-specific expectations for writing types are defined in standards 1–3 above.)

- **W.8.5.** With some guidance and support from peers and adults, develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach, focusing on how well purpose and audience have been addressed.

- **W.8.7.** Conduct short research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question), drawing on several sources and generating additional related, focused questions that allow for multiple avenues of exploration.

**Long-Term Learning Targets**

- I can write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.
  - a. I can introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically.
  - b. I can support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant evidence, using accurate, credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text.
  - c. I can use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
  - d. I can establish and maintain a formal style.
  - e. I can provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.

- I can produce clear and coherent writing that is appropriate to task, purpose and audience.

- With support from peers and adults, I can use the writing process to ensure that purpose and audience have been addressed.

- I can conduct short research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question).
  - I can use several sources in my research.
  - I can generate additional research questions for further exploration.
## English Language Arts Outcomes

### CCS Standards: Writing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can gather relevant information from a variety of sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can use search terms effectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can evaluate the credibility and accuracy of each source.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can quote and paraphrase others’ work while avoiding plagiarism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can use a standard format for citation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W.8.8. Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources, using search terms effectively; assess the credibility and accuracy of each source; and quote or paraphrase the data and conclusions of others while avoiding plagiarism and following a standard format for citation.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can gather relevant information from a variety of sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can use search terms effectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can evaluate the credibility and accuracy of each source.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can quote and paraphrase others’ work while avoiding plagiarism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can use a standard format for citation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W.8.9. Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b. Apply grade 8 Reading standards to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; recognize when irrelevant evidence is introduced”).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can use evidence from informational texts to support analysis, reflection and research.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2012 Expeditionary Learning, New York, NY. All Rights Reserved.

NYS Common Core ELA Curriculum • G8:M4: Overview • June 2014 • 5
## CCS Standards: Speaking and Listening

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SL.8.2. Analyze the purpose of information presented in diverse media and formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) and evaluate the motives (e.g., social, commercial, political) behind its presentation.

- **a.** Use their experience and their knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively.

### SL.8.3. Delineate a speaker’s argument and specific claims, evaluating the soundness of the reasoning and relevance and sufficiency of the evidence and identifying when irrelevant evidence is introduced.

- **a.** I can use their experience and their knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively.

### SL.8.4. Present claims and findings, emphasizing salient points in a focused, coherent manner with relevant evidence, sound valid reasoning, and well-chosen details; use appropriate eye contact, adequate volume, and clear pronunciation.

- I can present claims and findings in a focused, coherent manner (use relevant evidence, sound reasoning and well-chosen details).

### SL.8.5. Integrate multimedia and visual displays into presentations to clarify information, strengthen claims and evidence, and add interest.

- I can integrate multimedia components and visual displays in a presentation to clarify information, strengthen claims and to add emphasis.

### SL.8.6. Adapt speech to a variety of contexts and tasks, demonstrating command of formal English when indicated or appropriate.

- I can adapt my speech for a variety of contexts and tasks, using formal English when indicated or appropriate.
### CCS Standards: Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CCS Standards: Language</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • **L.8.4.** Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words or phrases based on grade 8 reading and content, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.  
  b. Use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).  
  c. Consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.  
  d. Verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary). | • I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. |
| • **L.8.6.** Acquire and use accurately grade-appropriate general academic and domain-specific words and phrases; gather vocabulary knowledge when considering a word or phrase important to comprehension or expression. | • I can accurately use 8th grade academic vocabulary to express my ideas.  
• I can use resources to build my vocabulary. |

### Central Texts


2. Students conduct internet research. See Unit 2 overview for details.
### Week at a Glance

#### Unit 1: Analyzing Author's Purpose and Evaluating Claims in *The Omnivore's Dilemma*

**Weeks 1-3**

- **Begin *The Omnivore’s Dilemma***
- **Analyze *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*** for author’s purpose and for how the author responds to conflicting viewpoints and evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Instructional Focus</strong></th>
<th><strong>Long-Term Targets</strong></th>
<th><strong>Assessments</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text (RI.8.2)</td>
<td>- Mid-Unit Assessment: Analyzing Author’s Purpose in Speech and Text (RI.8.6, SL.8.2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats. (SL.8.2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation. (SL.8.2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **Evaluate Michael Pollan’s claims in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*** for sound reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.
- **Practice advocating persuasively and speaking and listening skills.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Instructional Focus</strong></th>
<th><strong>Long-Term Targets</strong></th>
<th><strong>Assessments</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text (RI.8.2)</td>
<td>- End of Unit 1 Assessment: Evaluating Claims and Advocating Persuasively (RI.8.8, RI.8.9a, W.8.9b, SL.8.2, SL.8.3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week</td>
<td>Instructional Focus</td>
<td>Long-Term Targets (continued)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weeks 1-3, continued</td>
<td>• I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)</td>
<td>• I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)</td>
<td>• I can read, annotate, and analyze informational texts on topics related to diverse and nontraditional cultures and viewpoints (RL.8.9a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can apply grade 8 Reading standards to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; recognize when irrelevant evidence is introduced”) (W.8.9a)</td>
<td>• I can think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively (SL.8.2a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)</td>
<td>• I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Week at a Glance

## Unit 2: Researching Consequences and Stakeholders of Michael Pollan’s Four Food Chains

**Weeks 3-5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instructional Focus</th>
<th>Long-Term Targets</th>
<th>Assessments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Analyze each of Michael Pollan’s food chains for consequences.</td>
<td>• I can conduct short research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question). (W.8.7)</td>
<td>• Mid-Unit 2 Assessment: Research Simulation (W.8.7, W.8.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Research further the consequences of each of Michael Pollan’s food chains using other resources than <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and determine the stakeholders.</td>
<td>• I can use several sources in my research. (W.8.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can generate additional research questions for further exploration. (W.8.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can gather relevant information from a variety of sources. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use search terms effectively. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can evaluate the credibility and accuracy of each source. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can quote and paraphrase others’ work while avoiding plagiarism. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use a standard format for citation. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Practice speaking and listening skills in preparation for a presentation.</td>
<td>• I can present claims and findings in a focused, coherent manner (use relevant evidence, sound reasoning and well-chosen details). (SL.8.4)</td>
<td>• End of Unit 2 Assessment: Position Speech: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would best feed the United States? (SL.8.4, SL.8.5, SL.8.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use effective speaking techniques (appropriate eye contact, adequate volume and clear pronunciation). (SL.8.4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can integrate multimedia components and visual displays in a presentation to clarify information, strengthen claims and to add emphasis. (SL.8.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can adapt my speech for a variety of contexts and tasks, using formal English when indicated or appropriate. (SL.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week</td>
<td>Instructional Focus</td>
<td>Long-Term Targets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Unit 3: Writing a Position Paper: Which of Michael Pollan’s Food Chains Would You Choose to Feed the US?** | • Analyzing a model position paper to determine criteria.  
• Building a draft position paper, piece by piece, in which a claim is made to answer the question: Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains would you choose to feed the US? | • I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for an analysis of an informational text. (RI.8.1)  
• I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text (RI.8.2)  
• I can write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence. (W.8.1)  
• I can introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically. (W.8.1a)  
• I can support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant evidence, using accurate, credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text. (W.8.1b) | • Mid-Unit Assessment: Draft Position Paper (RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.1a, W.8.1b, W.8.1e, W.8.9, L.8.4, L.8.4b, L.8.4c, L.8.4d) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week</th>
<th>Instructional Focus</th>
<th>Long-Term Targets (continued)</th>
<th>Assessments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weeks 6-8, continued</td>
<td>• I can provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented. (W.8.1e)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can produce clear and coherent writing that is appropriate to task, purpose and audience. (W.8.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• With support from peers and adults, I can use the writing process to ensure that purpose and audience have been addressed. (W.8.5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can gather relevant information from a variety of sources. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use search terms effectively.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can evaluate the credibility and accuracy of each source. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can quote and paraphrase others’ work while avoiding plagiarism. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use a standard format for citation. (W.8.8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use evidence from informational texts to support analysis, reflection and research. (W.8.9)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week</td>
<td>Instructional Focus</td>
<td>Long-Term Targets (continued)</td>
<td>Assessments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weeks 6-8, continued</td>
<td>• Revise and edit draft position paper ready to publish.</td>
<td>• I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede). (L.8.4b)</td>
<td>• End of Unit 3 Assessment: Final Draft of Position Paper and Reflection on Writing the Position Paper (RI.8.1, W.8.1c, W.8.1d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech. (L.8.4c)</td>
<td>• Final Performance Task: Published Position Paper: Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains would you choose to feed the US? Why? (RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.1a, W.8.1b, W.8.1c, W.8.1d, W.8.1e, W.8.9).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary). (L.8.4d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• I can accurately use 8th grade academic vocabulary to express my ideas. (L.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• I can use resources to build my vocabulary. (L.8.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation and Materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In advance, read the article about the SCDM (Stakeholder Consequences Decision-Making) process to build your own background knowledge about it. You can download the article, “Learning to Make Systematic Decisions,” at the following URL:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://education.nationalgeographic.com/education/media/learning-make-systematic-decisions/?ar_a=1">http://education.nationalgeographic.com/education/media/learning-make-systematic-decisions/?ar_a=1</a></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This article is not used with students during the module, but it provides some examples of how students have used this process in a science curriculum. Also, note that in this module students are not using the entire SCDM process; they will be learning only the Cascading Consequences and Stakeholders charts.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 8: Module 4:
Assessment Overview
| Final Performance Task | **Visual Representation of Position Paper**  
This performance task gives students a chance to share their best reading, writing, and thinking about the question: “Which of Michael Pollan’s food supply chains would best feed the United States?” Students will use a powerful excerpt of their position paper, visual components, and text features to create a poster that shows their claim as well as the evidence they used to support their claim. These posters will be displayed around the classroom, with students having the opportunity to do a Gallery Walk of one another’s work. This task addresses NYSP12 ELA Standards RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.9, and W.8.9b. |
| --- | --- |
| Mid-Unit 1 Assessment | **Analyzing Author’s Purpose in Speech and Text**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS L.8.4, L.8.4b, L.8.4c, L.8.4d, RI.8.6, and SL.8.2. There are two parts to this assessment. In Part 1, students analyze the speaker’s purpose in a speech and the motives behind the medium the speech is presented in. In Part 2, students determine the meaning of words and analyze Michael Pollan’s purpose in a new excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. They also identify conflicting viewpoints put forward in the excerpt and describe how Michael Pollan responds to those viewpoints. In both Parts 1 and 2 of the assessment, students record their thinking on graphic organizers. |
| End of Unit 1 Assessment | **Evaluating Claims and Advocating Persuasively**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS RI.8.8, RI.8.9a, W.8.9b, SL.8.2, and SL.8.3. There are two parts to this assessment. In Part 1, students evaluate the claims in a speech and a new excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning, relevant evidence, and irrelevant evidence. Students record their thinking for this part of the assessment on graphic organizers. In Part 2 of the assessment, students advocate persuasively to answer this question in a Fishbowl: Which of the four meals you were invited to choose from at the beginning of the unit would you choose to feed your family? Why? Students prepare notes using what they have learned about each of Michael Pollan’s food chains and the four meals so far to help them advocate persuasively and respond to a counterclaim made by another student as they advocate persuasively. |
| Mid-Unit 2 Assessment | **Research Simulation**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS W.8.7 and W.8.8. In this assessment, students apply the research skills they have been learning throughout the unit to answer research questions about two new research texts. They paraphrase research, choose search terms, cite sources, and determine the credibility and accuracy of research sources. |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| End of Unit 2 Assessment | **Position Speech: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would best feed the United States?**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS SL.8.4, SL.8.5, and SL.8.6. Students present a position speech to answer the question: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would best feed the United States? They state a claim and provide two reasons for making that claim based on the consequences and affected stakeholders they have identified for each food chain throughout the unit. They select evidence to support their reasons, and they provide a counterclaim and respond to it. |
| Mid-Unit 3 Assessment | **Draft Position Paper: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would best feed the United States?**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS W.8.1, W.8.1a, W.8.1b, and W.8.1e. Students draft a position paper to answer the question: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chain would you choose to feed the United States? Their position paper should contain a claim, two reasons for making that claim, and evidence supporting each of the reasons. It should also include a counterclaim and a response to that counterclaim. Students use their position speech from the End of Unit 2 Assessment as a basis for their position paper. |
| End of Unit 3 Assessment | **Final Position Paper: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would you choose to feed the United States?**  
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.1c, W.8.1d, and W.8.9. Students write a final draft of their position paper to answer the question: Which of Michael Pollan’s four food chains would you choose to feed the United States? |
Grade 8: Module 4: Performance Task
Summary of Task

- This performance task gives students a chance to share their best reading, writing, and thinking about the question: “Which of Michael Pollan’s food supply chains would best feed the United States?” Students will use a powerful excerpt of their position paper, visual components, and text features to create a poster that shows their claim as well as the evidence they used to support their claim. These posters will be displayed around the classroom, with students having the opportunity to do a Gallery Walk of one another’s work. **This task addresses NYSP12 ELA Standards RI.8.1, W.8.1, W.8.9, and W.8.9b.**

Format

A visual representation of position paper on large paper or poster board.
Students will include their claim, reasons, and evidence from their position paper.
Students will plan their visual representation using a template.
Final visual presentations will be shared in a Gallery Walk.

Standards Assessed through This Task

- **RI.8.1.** Cite the textual evidence that most strongly supports an analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.
- **W.8.1.** Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.
  a. Introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically.
  b. Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant evidence, using accurate, credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text.
  c. Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
  d. Establish and maintain a formal style.
  e. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.
- **W.8.9.** Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.
  b. Apply grade 8 Reading standards to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; recognize when irrelevant evidence is introduced”).
Student-Friendly Writing Invitation/Task Description

- Your task is to create a visual representation of your argument from your position paper. To do so, you will use your claim, your reasons, and at least three of your pieces of evidence. You will then select images that represent your key pieces of evidence and organize them on a page or poster, using either chart paper and markers or a computer. You will share your performance task with the rest of the class in a classroom Gallery Walk at the end of this unit.

Key Criteria for Success (Aligned with NYSP 12 ELA CCLS)

Below are key criteria students need to address when completing this task. Specific lessons during the module build in opportunities for students to understand the task, plan their visual representation, and share their final product.

Your visual representation of the position paper will include:
- Your claim that you made in your position paper
- The reasons you used to support your claim
- Evidence from your position paper that supports your reasons and claim
- Images to support your argument
- An organizational structure that is easy to read and makes it easy to follow your argument
- Domain-specific vocabulary
**Options for Students**

- Students will create their posters individually. They will primarily base their visual representation on their position paper; however, they may also look back at their researcher’s notebooks, Cascading Consequences charts, and Stakeholder charts.
- Students might have a partner to assist as they work on their visual representations, but the final version will be an individual’s product.
- Student visual representations might be laid out differently.
- Students may draw their images rather than use existing images.
- Students could participate in a Hosted Gallery Walk, in which they move around the room in a group and, when they come to their visual representation, explain it to other students in their group.

**Options for Teachers**

- Students may share their visual representations with their own class, with other classes in the school, or with parents or other adults in a community center or public library.
- Students may create a digital visual representation. These could be posted on an internal school Web site or, with parental permission, on a publicly accessible Web site.
### Resources and Links

- [http://search.creativecommons.org/](http://search.creativecommons.org/) (a site to search for images with licenses to reuse)

### Central Text and Informational Texts


Various research sources.

**Note:** Additional informational texts listed in each separate Unit Overview document.
The list below includes texts with a range of Lexile® text measures about food sustainability. It is imperative that students read a high volume of texts at their reading level in order to continue to build the academic vocabulary and fluency demanded by the CCLS. Note that districts and schools should consider their own community standards when reviewing this list. Some texts in particular units or modules address emotionally difficult content.

It is imperative that students read a high volume of texts at their reading level in order to continue to build the academic vocabulary and fluency demanded by the CCLS.

Where possible, texts in languages other than English are also provided. Texts are categorized into three Lexile measures that correspond to Common Core Bands: below grade band, within band, and above band. Note, however, that Lexile measures are just one indicator of text complexity, and teachers must use their professional judgment and consider qualitative factors as well. For more information, see Appendix 1 of the Common Core State Standards.

**Common Core Band Level Text Difficulty Ranges:**
(As provided in the NYSED Passage Selection Guidelines for Assessing CCSS ELA)
- Grade 4–5: 740–1010L
- Grade 6–8: 925–1185L

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author And Illustrator</th>
<th>Text Type</th>
<th>Lexile Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lexile text measures in Grade 4–5 band level (&lt;740L-925L)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>Alexandra Fix (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>630*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoiding Hunger and Finding Water</td>
<td>Andrew Langley (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seeds of Change</td>
<td>Jen Cullerton Johnson (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeding the World</td>
<td>Sarah Levete (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>890</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Lexile based on a conversion from Accelerated Reading level
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author And Illustrator</th>
<th>Text Type</th>
<th>Lexile Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lexile text measures within Grade 6 band level (925L-1070L)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Word of Mouth: The Food You Eat</em></td>
<td>Nancy Rogers Bontempo (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Food</em></td>
<td>Paul Mason (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>970*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Do you Know Where Your Food Comes From?</em></td>
<td>Neil Morris (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>980*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dairy: From the Farm to Your Table</em></td>
<td>Brian Hanson Harding (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1060*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lexile text measures within Grade 6–8 band level (925L–1185L)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Feeding Relationships</em></td>
<td>Ann Fullick (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>930*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>From Farm to Table</em></td>
<td>Richard Spilsbury (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1120*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>What’s Cooking? The History of American Food</em></td>
<td>Silvia Whitman (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Feeding the World</em></td>
<td>Anne Rooney (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1120*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author And Illustrator</td>
<td>Text Type</td>
<td>Lexile Measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexile text measures above band level (over 1185L)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food: Ethical Debates in What We Eat</td>
<td>Jim Kerr (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1190*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and Farming</td>
<td>Jen Green (author)</td>
<td>Informational</td>
<td>1240</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Web Sites for Research**


**Suggested Articles for Research**

- “Food around the World,” in *Junior Scholastic* (Vol. 113, Issue 15), May 9, 2011.
Unit 1: Analyzing Author’s Purpose and Evaluating Claims in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

In this unit, students analyze authors’ and speakers’ purposes and evaluate the claims they make. Students begin reading the Young Readers Edition of Michael Pollan’s *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (930L), a high-interest literary nonfiction text about where food comes from and how it gets to our plate. As they read the text, they are involved in a study of the author’s purpose and how to determine what that is. At the same time, they analyze videos of speeches and interviews on the same topic of food and how it gets to our plate in order to analyze a speaker’s purpose. In the second half of the unit, students move on to analyze authors’ and speakers’ claims and whether they use relevant and sufficient evidence and sound reasoning to support their claims. They also read and listen for the use of irrelevant evidence.

**Guiding Questions and Big Ideas**

- What journey does food take before it gets to your plate?
- What is the author’s purpose? Why did they write that?
- Has the author or speaker used sufficient relevant evidence and sound reasoning to support his or her claim?
- Understanding diverse points of view helps us live in an increasingly diverse society.
- When putting forward an argument, you need to provide relevant and sufficient evidence to support your claims.
## Mid-Unit 1 Assessment

**Analyzing Author’s Purpose in Speech and Text**
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS L.8.4, L.8.4b, L.8.4c, L.8.4d, RI.8.6, and SL.8.2. There are two parts to this assessment. In Part 1, students analyze the speaker’s purpose in a speech and the motives behind the medium the speech is presented in. In Part 2, students determine the meaning of words and analyze Michael Pollan’s purpose in a new excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. They also identify conflicting viewpoints put forward in the excerpt and describe how Michael Pollan responds to those viewpoints. In both Parts 1 and 2 of the assessment, students record their thinking on graphic organizers.

## End of Unit 1 Assessment

**Evaluating Claims and Advocating Persuasively**
This assessment centers on NYSP12 ELA CCLS RI.8.8, RI.8.9a, W.8.9b, SL.8.2, and SL.8.3. There are two parts to this assessment. In Part 1, students evaluate the claims in a speech and a new excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning, relevant evidence, and irrelevant evidence. Students record their thinking for this part of the assessment on graphic organizers. In Part 2 of the assessment, students advocate persuasively to answer this question in a Fishbowl: Which of the four meals you were invited to choose from at the beginning of the unit would you choose to feed your family? Why? Students prepare notes using what they have learned about each of Michael Pollan’s food chains and the four meals so far to help them advocate persuasively and respond to a counterclaim made by another student as they advocate persuasively.
Content Connections

This module is designed to address English Language Arts standards as students read about the topic of food sustainability in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. However, the module intentionally incorporates Social Studies practices and themes to support potential interdisciplinary connections to this compelling content. These intentional connections are described below.

**Big ideas and guiding questions are informed by the New York State Common Core K–8 Social Studies Framework:**

**Unifying Themes (pages 6–7)**

- Theme 4: Geography, Humans, and the Environment: The relationship between human populations and the physical world (people, places, and environments); impact of human activities on the environment; interactions between regions, locations, places, people, and environments.
- Theme 9: Science, Technology, and Innovation: Applications of science and innovations in transportation, communication, military technology, navigation, agriculture, and industrialization.

**Social Studies Practices, Geographic Reasoning, Grades 5–8:**

- Descriptor 2: Describe the relationships between people and environments and the connections between people and places (page 58).
- Descriptor 3: Identify, analyze, and evaluate the relationship between the environment and human activities, how the physical environment is modified by human activities, and how human activities are also influenced by Earth’s physical features and processes.

**Social Studies Practices, Gathering, Using, and Interpreting Evidence, Grades 5–8:**

- Descriptor 1: Define and frame questions about events and the world in which we live and use evidence to answer these questions.
- Descriptor 2: Identify, describe, and evaluate evidence about events from diverse sources (including written documents, works of art, photographs, charts and graphs, artifacts, oral traditions, and other primary and secondary sources).
- Descriptor 4: Describe and analyze arguments of others.
- Descriptor 6: Recognize an argument and identify evidence that supports the argument; examine arguments related to a specific social studies topic from multiple perspectives; deconstruct arguments, recognizing the perspective of the argument and identifying evidence used to support that perspective.

**Texts**

This unit is approximately 3 weeks or 15 sessions of instruction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lesson 1</td>
<td>Building Background Knowledge: What IS the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway?</td>
<td>• I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of</td>
<td>• I can find the gist of pages 1–4 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</td>
<td>• Gist annotated on sticky notes</td>
<td>• Things Close Readers Do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>literary text. (RI.8.1)</td>
<td>• I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)</td>
<td>• Answers to text-dependent questions</td>
<td>• Teammates Consult protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• I can read grade-level literary texts proficiently and independently. (RI.8.10)</td>
<td>• I can participate in discussions about the text with a partner, small group, and</td>
<td>• Exit ticket</td>
<td>• Gallery Walk protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the whole class.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Lesson 2

### Lesson Title
Reading for Gist and Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Industrial Food Chain

### Long-Term Learning Targets
- I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of literary text. (RI.8.1)
- I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
- I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)
- I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)
  1. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).
  2. I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.
  3. I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).

### Supporting Targets
- I can find the gist of pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can read closely to answer questions about pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.

### Ongoing Assessment
- Gist annotated on sticky notes
- New vocabulary on word-catcher
- Answers to text-dependent questions

### Anchor Charts & Protocols
- Teammates Consult protocol
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lesson 3</td>
<td>Analyzing Author’s Purpose: Industrial Food Chain</td>
<td>• I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6) &lt;br&gt; • I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6) &lt;br&gt; • I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)</td>
<td>• I can describe Michael Pollan’s purpose on page 25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. &lt;br&gt; • I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used on page 25 and explain how he responds to them.</td>
<td>• Food Chain graphic organizer &lt;br&gt; • Author’s Purpose graphic organizer</td>
<td>• Author’s Purpose &lt;br&gt; • Teammates Consult protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson</td>
<td>Lesson Title</td>
<td>Long-Term Learning Targets</td>
<td>Supporting Targets</td>
<td>Ongoing Assessment</td>
<td>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Lesson 4 | Reading for Gist, Answering Text-Dependent Questions, and Determining Author’s Purpose: Industrial Food Chain | • I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)  
• I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)  
• I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)  
• I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)  
• I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)  
  b. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).  
  c. I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.  
  d. I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary). | • I can find the gist of pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them. | • Gist annotated on sticky notes  
• New vocabulary on word-catcher  
• Answers to text-dependent questions  
• Author’s Purpose graphic organizer | • Teammates Consult protocol |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Lesson 5** | Reading for Gist, Answering Text-Dependent Questions, and Determining Author’s Purpose: Industrial Organic Food Chain | • I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)  
• I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)  
• I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)  
• I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)  
• I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8) | • I can find the gist of pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.  
• I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them. | • Gist annotated on sticky notes  
• New vocabulary on word-catcher  
• Answers to text-dependent questions  
• Author’s Purpose graphic organizer | • Teammates Consult protocol |
| **Lesson 6** | Analyzing a Speaker’s Purpose and Motives of a Media Excerpt | • I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats. (SL.8.2)  
• I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation. (SL.8.2) | • I can describe the purpose of a speaker.  
• I can evaluate the motives of a media presentation. | • Food Chain graphic organizer  
• Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer | • Teammates Consult protocol |
### Lesson 7

**Lesson Title**: Mid-Unit Assessment: Analyzing Author’s Purpose in Speech and Text

**Long-Term Learning Targets**
- I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)
- I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)
- I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats. (SL.8.2)
- I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation. (SL.8.2)
- I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)
  - I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).
  - I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.
  - I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).
- I can describe the purpose and motives of the speech by Birke Baehr and Michael Pollan on pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints in pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and explain how Michael Pollan responds to them.

**Supporting Targets**
- Mid-Unit 1 Assessment

**Ongoing Assessment**
- Mid-Unit 1 Assessment

**Anchor Charts & Protocols**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lesson 8 | Reading for Gist and Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Local Sustainable Food Chain | • I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)  
• I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4) | • I can find the gist of pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*.  
• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*. | • Food Chain graphic organizer  
• Gist annotated on sticky notes  
• New vocabulary on word-catcher  
• Answers to text-dependent questions | • Teammates Consult protocol |
| Lesson 9 | Evaluating an Argument: The Polyface Local Sustainable Farm | • I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)  
• I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)  
• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)  
• I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.3)  
• I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)  
• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8) | • I can evaluate two arguments for the same claim to identify which is the strongest.  
• I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.  
• I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text. | • Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166 | • Teammates Consult protocol  
• Think-Pair-Share protocol |
| Lesson 10 | Reading for the Gist and Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Hunter-Gatherer Food Chain | • I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)  
• I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4) | • I can find the gist of pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*.  
• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*. | • Food Chain graphic organizer  
• Gist annotated on sticky notes  
• New vocabulary on word-catcher  
• Answers to text-dependent questions | • Teammates Consult protocol |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lesson 11 | Evaluating an Argument: The Joy of Hunting | • I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)  
• I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)  
• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8) | • I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.  
• I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text. | • Food Chain graphic organizer  
• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245 | • What Makes a Strong Argument?  
• Teammates Consult protocol |
| Lesson 12 | Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively: Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl | • I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)  
• I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a) | • I can develop a claim about which food chain I would choose to feed my family—local sustainable or hunter-gatherer—and support it with evidence.  
• I can advocate persuasively about my claim. | • Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of *Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too*  
• Students’ comments regarding how to develop a claim  
• Developing a Claim graphic organizer | • Advocating Persuasively Criteria  
• Peer Critique protocol  
• Fishbowl protocol |
| Lesson 13 | Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl: Practice | • I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)  
• I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a) | • I can advocate persuasively for either local sustainable or hunter-gatherer to feed my family. | • Developing a Claim graphic organizer  
• Advocating Persuasively Checklist | • Advocating Persuasively Criteria  
• Peer Critique protocol  
• Fishbowl protocol |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Lesson Title</th>
<th>Long-Term Learning Targets</th>
<th>Supporting Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
<th>Anchor Charts &amp; Protocols</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lesson 14 | End of Unit Assessment Parts 1 and 2: Evaluating Arguments and Claims | • I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)  
• I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)  
• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)  
• I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)  
• I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)  
• I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RL.8.8)  
• I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RL.8.9a) | • I can determine the speaker’s argument and claims and evaluate the reasoning and evidence she has used to support her claim in the interview clip.  
• I can identify irrelevant evidence that the speaker has used in the interview clip.  
• I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient, relevant evidence to support the claim.  
• I can identify irrelevant evidence. | • End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech  
• End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* |  |
| Lesson 15 | Assessment Part 3: Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl | • I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)  
• I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RL.8.9a) | • I can advocate persuasively for one of the four meals Michael Pollan introduces in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. | • End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Developing a Claim (from homework)  
• Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric | • Fishbowl protocol |
Optional: Experts, Fieldwork, and Service

Experts:
- Invite local farmers to discuss their farming methods and how the issues that Michael Pollan discusses affect their food production and their livelihood with the students.
- Invite representatives from grocery stores, including organic and health food stores, to share with students how the issues that Michael Pollan discusses affect their stores and consumers.
- Invite hunters who hunt to feed their families to share their perspective on hunting with the students.

Fieldwork:
- Arrange for a visit to a local grocery store to look at where the produce comes from and the ingredients in different foods.
- Arrange for a visit to a food processing plant to look at what happens to food in a factory.
- Arrange for a visit to farms—for example, a local sustainable farm and an industrial farm—to see how food is produced and to compare the different ways things are done.

Optional: Extensions

- Grow a class garden of basic vegetables and herbs and discuss the different ways to grow food—with or without fertilizers and chemicals. If you have the space and time available, students could grow two gardens—one with and one without fertilizers and chemicals—to compare how those things change how food grows.
This unit includes a number of routines that involve stand-alone documents.
In Lessons 1–13, students read chapters of the text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for homework. As they read, they add to a Food Chain graphic organizer.

1. Reading Calendar

- Students read *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for homework for Lessons 1–13. Each night, they read either a chapter or part of a chapter.
- Consider providing a reading calendar to help students, teachers, and families understand what is due and when. See stand-alone document.

2. Food Chain Graphic Organizer

Students will do a “first read” of chapters of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* each night. They are given a Food Chain graphic organizer for each of Michael Pollan’s four food chains and each night add to the relevant sections of the relevant Food Chain graphic organizer based on the information they have read and the evidence they find.
The calendar below shows what is due on each day. You may modify this document to include dates instead of lessons.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Due at Lesson</th>
<th>Read the chapter/pages below:</th>
<th>Homework and Vocabulary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2             | Pages 4–6 and 9–25            | Read pages 4–6 and 9–25 (“Introducing Corn”) of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Use the strongest evidence from the text to answer the questions:  
  * Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains does the meal you chose at the beginning of the lesson best match?  
  * Why do you think that?  
  **Key vocabulary:** industrial, fertilizers, processed, high-fructose, molecules, carbohydrates, maize, grain, industry, agriculture, agribusiness |
| 3             | Chapter 3                     | Read Chapter 3 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Continue filling in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.  
  **Key vocabulary:** government, chemical, pesticide, hybrid, ecological, fossil fuels, calorie, efficient, subsidies, policy |
| 4             | Chapter 5                     | Read Chapter 5 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Continue to add to your Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s industrial food chain.  
  **Key vocabulary:** feedlot, manure, steer, CAFOs (Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations), bacteria, evolved, rumen, protein, forage, antibiotics |
| 5             | Pages 76–82 and Chapter 10    | Read pages 76–82 and finish filling in the Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain.  
  Read Chapter 10. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.  
  **Key vocabulary (pages 76–82):** obese, diabetes, abundant, consume, supersized  
  **Key vocabulary (Chapter 10):** organic, synthetic, counterculture, corrupt, immoral, environmental, ecology, corporations, principles, monoculture, additives, hippie commune, executive, cooperative, GMO (genetically modified), preservatives, conventional |
| 6             | Chapter 11                    | Read Chapter 11 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and fill in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial organic food chain based on what you have read in Chapters 10 and 11. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.  
  **Key vocabulary:** free-range, automated, ammonia, hormones, nutrients, polyphenols, sustainable |
| 7             | Chapter 12                    | Read Chapter 12 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Begin filling in the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s local sustainable food chain.  
  **Key vocabulary:** sanitation, fertile, recycled |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Day</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Key Vocabulary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Chapter 14</td>
<td>Read Chapter 14 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and continue adding to your Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain.</td>
<td>broiler, parasites, larvae, organism, compost, biological system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pages 161–166 and Chapter 16</td>
<td>Reread pages 161–166 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and identify the claim Michael Pollan makes and the evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence. Read Chapter 16 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and continue to fill in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
<td>economy, society, regulations, humane, diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Chapter 20</td>
<td>Read Chapter 20 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Begin filling in the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s hunter-gatherer food chain.</td>
<td>trophy hunter, sow, sorrow, remorse, organs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pages 240–245 and Chapter 21</td>
<td>Reread pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and identify a claim Michael Pollan makes and any relevant evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence. Read Chapter 21 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and continue to fill in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the hunter-gatherer food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
<td>chanterelle, fungi, decay, morel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Read <em>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance— and Carrots Too</em> by Dr. Mehmet Oz. Complete the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Finish your Developing a Claim ticket and be ready to advocate persuasively in the next lesson’s Fishbowl.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Pages 279-283 (Vote with Your Fork)</td>
<td>Read the Afterword, “Vote with Your Fork” (pages 279—283). Answer this question:</td>
<td>consumer, consciously, CSA (Community Supported Agriculture), mandatory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FOOD CHAIN FOR ____________________________________________

1. **Start:**
   Where does the chain start? Planted seed? In the wild?

2. **Farm:**
   How does it grow? What happens once it is grown? Who does what? How?

3. **After the farm:**
   Where does it go next? Under what conditions?

4. **Transportation:**
   How is it moved from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer?

5. **Outputs:**
   What is produced?
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 1
Building Background Knowledge: What IS the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway?
### Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>RI.8.1</th>
<th>RI.8.2</th>
<th>RI.8.10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of literary text.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can read grade-level literary texts proficiently and independently.</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Supporting Learning Targets

- I can find the gist of pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can use context clues to determine the meaning of “omnivore’s dilemma.”
- I can participate in discussions about the text with a partner, small group, and the whole class.

### Ongoing Assessment

- Gist annotated on sticky notes
- Answers to text-dependent questions
- Exit ticket
# Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Opening</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Entrance Ticket: Please Place Your Order (5 minutes)</td>
<td>• This first lesson is designed to hook students into the book <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets and Reviewing Things Close Readers Do Anchor Chart (5 minutes)</td>
<td>• Please note that this book is just one point of view on this topic, so students should be made aware throughout the unit that Michael Pollan is trying to persuade us to believe what he believes, but that there are opposing points of view on this topic. Remind students that they are not to read this book and believe that everything Michael Pollan says is true; they are to read it through the lens of how Pollan tries to convince the reader of what he says.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Work Time</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Discussion: What Was Your Meal Decision Based On? (5 minutes)</td>
<td>• The lesson begins with students entering the classroom to see that it has been set up like a restaurant. You can decide how to frame this, but some suggestions are as follows: You could stand at the door and seat students in groups as they arrive; and you could set up the tables with napkins, plastic knives and forks, paper placemats, and tablecloths.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Reading for Gist: Introduction of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (Pages 1-4) (10 minutes)</td>
<td>• Students then choose one of four meals to order from the “Specials Board.” The meals on the Specials Board are the four meals that Michael Pollan eats in <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. In the book, each meal represents one of the four food chains—which serve as the book’s organizing principle. It is important to emphasize to students that they are not really going to be served food; it’s just a simulation. By choosing a meal and thinking about how they made that choice, students are beginning to think about what factors go into deciding what to eat. These factors will be explored in greater detail throughout the module.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Introduction of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (Pages 1-4) (15 minutes)</td>
<td>• Do not explain the food chains to students in this lesson; they will be introduced to them for homework.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Closing and Assessment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Exit Ticket: What Is the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway? (5 minutes)</td>
<td>• In advance:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Homework</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Read pages 4–6 and 9–25 (“Introducing Corn”) of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Use the strongest evidence from the text to answer these questions:</td>
<td>• Post Specials Board meal charts for the Gallery Walk. You may want to have three sets of the meal charts and assign different sections of the class to visit each set. (Ex: “Everyone at the back two tables should visit the set of meal posters on the back wall.”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains does the meal you chose at the beginning of the lesson best match?</td>
<td>• Read pages 1–4 of the Introduction to <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>, considering the gist of each paragraph and the answers to the text-dependent questions students will be asked (see supporting materials).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Why do you think that?</td>
<td>• Create triads, groups of three students that will work together to read, think, talk, and write about <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Use intentional grouping. Heterogeneous groups support students in discussing texts and answering questions about texts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Agenda

- Review: Gallery Walk protocol (see Appendix); Teammates Consult protocol (see supporting materials).
- Post: Learning targets; Things Close Readers Do anchor chart (from Module 1, Unit 1, Lesson 14).

### Teaching Notes (continued)

### Lesson Vocabulary

- gist; omnivore, dilemma, modern, food chain (1), feedlot, bellying, trough (3)

### Materials

- Entrance Ticket: Please Place Your Order (one per student)
- Specials Board for the Gallery Walk (new; teacher-created; see supporting materials)
- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition by Michael Pollan (book; one per student)
- Things Close Readers Do anchor chart (from Module 1, Unit 1, Lesson 14; or create a new copy if needed)
- Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)
- Teammates Consult protocol (for teacher reference)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
- Exit Ticket: What Is The Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway? (one per student)
- Homework: Which of Michael Pollan’s Food Chains Does the Meal You Chose at the Beginning of the Lesson Best Match? (one per student)
### Opening

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Entrance Ticket: Please Place Your Order (5 minutes)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Distribute the Entrance Ticket: Please Place Your Order and welcome students to your “restaurant.” Explain the process for “ordering food” and for the Gallery Walk protocol:</td>
<td>• Using entrance/exit tickets gives you a quick check for understanding of the learning target so that instruction can be adjusted or tailored to students’ needs during the lesson or before the next lesson. Pairing entrance tickets with exit tickets allows both teachers and students to track progress from the beginning to the end of the lesson.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. In a moment, you will be invited to get up to read the Specials Board, where four meal choices are posted.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. As you read all four meals, decide which meal you would like to order.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. After you make your decision, return to your seat and place your order by completing your entrance ticket.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• You might need to coach your students about your expectations for safe movement and quiet voices. For example: “As you move from meal to meal, there is no need to engage in side conversations. I expect ‘zero’ voice levels during this time. Also, please move carefully, taking care not to bump into one another.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to walk over to the Specials Board for the Gallery Walk. Once students have viewed the meal charts for 3 minutes, ask them to return to their seats and silently place their order by completing their entrance ticket.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inform students that they will share their orders after they have unpacked the learning targets.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. Unpacking Learning Targets and Reviewing Things Close Readers Do Anchor Chart (5 minutes)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening (continued)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students that learning targets help students know the learning, thinking, and skills that will be the focus of the lesson, and that the learning targets will always be reviewed and checked at the end of the lesson.</td>
<td>• Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to read the first learning target with you: * “I can find the gist of pages 1–4 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</em>”</td>
<td>• Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Circle the word <em>gist</em> and ask students to remind a partner: * “What does it mean to read for the gist?”</td>
<td>• Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cold call students for their responses and listen for them to say that reading for the gist means figuring out what the text is mostly about.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to read the second learning target with you: * “I can use context clues to determine the meaning of ‘omnivore’s dilemma.’”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students that the text for this module is a nonfiction book called <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> by Michael Pollan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Read the last learning target aloud: * “I can participate in discussions about the text with a partner, small group, and the whole class.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explain that reading a difficult text requires a lot of thinking and talking with others. Students will be talking in triads using a new protocol called Teammates Consult. Remind students to be respectful of others by listening to what they have to say, asking polite questions to clarify understanding, and participating in the discussions by offering thoughtful ideas and questions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> is a complex text with difficult vocabulary words. They will need to use all of their strategies for close reading throughout this module.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Review the <em>Things Close Readers Do anchor chart</em> by having students read the items out loud.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explain that today they will focus on getting the gist, rereading, and talking with others about the text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Work Time

**A. Discussion: What Was your Meal Decision Based On? (5 minutes)**

- Ask students to turn and talk to a partner:
  - *“Which meal did you choose at the beginning of the lesson? Why?”*

- Cold call students to share how they made their decision.

- Students may have any number of reasons for why they chose their meal—emphasize that there is no right or wrong answer here. Students may have chosen based on what they like the taste of, or what foods they were familiar with, or because they wanted to try something new.

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - *“What other things might we think about, besides taste, when we decide what to eat or what our family eats?”*

- Select volunteers to share their responses and record the responses on the board. Examples will vary from student to student and might include: taste, cost, how healthy it is, and where the food comes from.

- Distribute *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Explain that how we make decisions about what we eat is an important idea in this book, an idea that we will return to repeatedly throughout the unit.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Consider partnering ELL students who speak the same home language when discussion of complex content is required. This can allow students to have more meaningful discussions and clarify points in their native language.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Time (continued)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Reading for Gist: Introduction of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (Pages 1–4) (10 minutes)</strong></td>
<td>• Hearing a complex text read slowly, fluently, and without interruption or explanation promotes fluency for students: They are hearing a strong reader read the text aloud with accuracy and expression, and are simultaneously looking at and thinking about the words on the printed page. Be sure to set clear expectations that students read along silently in their heads as you read the text aloud.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Tell students that they are going to read pages 1–4 of the Introduction for the gist. Ask them to read along silently as you read the first paragraph aloud. As with other read-alouds, remember that the purpose is to read the text slowly, fluently, and without interruption. Don’t stop to address comprehension or vocabulary issues, as these will be addressed later and stopping would interrupt the flow of the text.</em></td>
<td>• Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ask students to reread the first paragraph and to Think-Pair-Share:</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*“What is the gist of the first paragraph? What is this paragraph mostly about?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Listen for them to explain that Michael Pollan didn’t think or worry about where his food came from before he began writing this book.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Model annotating the paragraph on a <strong>sticky note</strong> and sticking it in the margin.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Pair students up and invite them to work together to reread each paragraph and discuss the gist with their partner before recording the gist of the paragraph on a sticky note. Tell students that in pairs they will find the gist of the rest of the paragraphs up to the end of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> section on page 4.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it on their sticky note.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C. Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Introduction of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (Pages 1–4) (15 minutes)

- Tell students they are now going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.
- Post the triads and invite students to get with the rest of their triad. Display and distribute **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma***.
- Tell students that they will be using a new protocol called Teammates Consult to help them share their thinking. The protocol makes sure that everyone in the group contributes ideas and holds all students accountable for answering the questions. Make it clear that students are to leave their pencils in the pot in the center of their table until they are told to take them out to write, as this is a key part of the protocol.
- Read the first question out loud:
  * “How did the author, Michael Pollan, make decisions about what to eat before he began working on this book? How do you know?”
- Explain that now students are going to do a **Teammates Consult protocol** which involves rereading the appropriate section of the text, thinking about what the answer is, and discussing it with their group for 3 minutes to come to an agreement about how to best answer the question.
- After 3 minutes, cold call a few groups to share their answer. Explain that after the first question, groups won’t be sharing their answers with the whole class. The first one is being done together to make sure everyone knows what to do.
- Listen for students to say that Pollan decided what to eat based on what tasted good and that the last line of the first paragraph says just that.
- Explain that when you say, “Teammates, write,” all students are to remove their pencils from the cup and write the answer to the question in their own words on their own paper. As you say, “Teammates, write,” model writing the answer on the displayed handout.
- Repeat the process for each question, but after the first question you don’t need to model recording the answer each time on the displayed copy, as students should understand how to fill out the organizer after it has been modeled with the first question.
- Circulate to assist students in answering the questions (refer to **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*** *(answers, for teacher reference)*. Ask questions to encourage students to refer to the text:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
<th>Work Time (continued)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Text-dependent questions can be answered only by referring explicitly to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.</td>
<td>C. Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Introduction of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (Pages 1–4) (15 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards”: small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”</td>
<td>• Tell students they are now going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Post the triads and invite students to get with the rest of their triad. Display and distribute <strong>Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em></strong>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tell students that they will be using a new protocol called Teammates Consult to help them share their thinking. The protocol makes sure that everyone in the group contributes ideas and holds all students accountable for answering the questions. Make it clear that students are to leave their pencils in the pot in the center of their table until they are told to take them out to write, as this is a key part of the protocol.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Read the first question out loud:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* “How did the author, Michael Pollan, make decisions about what to eat before he began working on this book? How do you know?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Explain that now students are going to do a <strong>Teammates Consult protocol</strong> which involves rereading the appropriate section of the text, thinking about what the answer is, and discussing it with their group for 3 minutes to come to an agreement about how to best answer the question.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• After 3 minutes, cold call a few groups to share their answer. Explain that after the first question, groups won’t be sharing their answers with the whole class. The first one is being done together to make sure everyone knows what to do.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Listen for students to say that Pollan decided what to eat based on what tasted good and that the last line of the first paragraph says just that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Explain that when you say, “Teammates, write,” all students are to remove their pencils from the cup and write the answer to the question in their own words on their own paper. As you say, “Teammates, write,” model writing the answer on the displayed handout.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Repeat the process for each question, but after the first question you don’t need to model recording the answer each time on the displayed copy, as students should understand how to fill out the organizer after it has been modeled with the first question.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Circulate to assist students in answering the questions (refer to <strong>Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 1–4 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em></strong> <em>(answers, for teacher reference)</em>. Ask questions to encourage students to refer to the text:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Building Background Knowledge: What IS the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Time (continued)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out to that answer in the text?”</strong></td>
<td><strong>• Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Refocus the group. Ask students to discuss this question in their triads:</strong></td>
<td><strong>• Allow students to grapple with a complex text before explicit teaching of vocabulary.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “What do you think the word dilemma means?”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Select volunteers to share their responses. Listen for students to say that a dilemma is a problem.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “What kind of problem might a dilemma might be?”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Cold call students for their responses. Listen for them to say that it is a problem that requires a choice; it is a problem with a complicated solution.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “How does Pollan define omnivore in the text?”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Listen for them to explain that being an omnivore means eating “plants, meat, mushrooms—just about anything.”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Tell students that the word omnivore has the root “vore,” which means “one who eats,” and the prefix “omni,” which means “all,” so an omnivore is “one who eats everything.” Tell students that a carnivore is “one who eats meat.”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Ask students to discuss in triads:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “What do you think ‘herbivore’ means?”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Select volunteers to share their responses. Listen for them to explain that a herbivore is “one who eats plants.”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Ask:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• “What is the meaning of the title of the book, The Omnivore’s Dilemma?”</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>• Cold call students to share their thinking with the whole group. Listen for them to say that because we are omnivores, we can eat anything, plants or meat or anything in the supermarket. Since we can eat anything, our dilemma is that we have to figure out what to eat.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Closing and Assessment

**A. Exit Ticket: What Is the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway? (5 minutes)**
- Reread the second learning target out loud.
  - “I can use context clues to determine the meaning of ‘omnivore’s dilemma.’”
- Distribute the Exit Ticket: What Is The Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway? and ask students to answer the question.
- Collect these exit tickets to assess students’ understanding of the book’s title.
- Distribute Homework: Which of Michael Pollan’s Food Chains Does the Meal you Chose at the Beginning of the Lesson Best Match?

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Using exit tickets allows you to get a quick check for understanding of the learning target so that instruction can be adjusted or tailored to students’ needs during the lesson or before the next lesson.

### Homework

- Read pages 4–6 and 9–25 (“Introducing Corn”) of The Omnivore’s Dilemma. Use the strongest evidence from the text to answer the questions:
  - Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains does the meal you chose at the beginning of the lesson best match?
  - Why do you think that?
Entrance Ticket: Please Place Your Order

Directions: Order one of the four meals posted on the Specials Board by checking the box next to the meal’s number. Then explain why you chose this meal.

☐ Meal 1
☐ Meal 2
☐ Meal 3
☐ Meal 4

Why did you choose this meal?

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Directions: On 12 pieces of chart paper, create three separate charts of each of the four meals.

Meal 1
McDonald’s cheeseburger
Large fries
Large Coke

Meal 2
Roasted organic chicken
Roasted organic veggies (yellow potatoes, purple kale, and red winter squash)
Steamed organic asparagus
Spring mix salad
Organic ice cream with organic blackberries

Meal 3
Brined and applewood-smoked barbecue chicken
Roasted sweet corn
Rocket (arugula) salad
Chocolate soufflé

Meal 4
Fava bean toasts and Sonoma boar pâté
Egg fettuccine with power fire morels, braised leg, and grilled loin of wild Sonoma pig
Wild East Bay yeast levain
Local garden salad
Text-Dependent Questions:
Pages 1–4 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

Name:  
Date:  

I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of literary text.  
(RI.8.1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. How did the author, Michael Pollan, make decisions about what to eat before he began working on this book? How do you know?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. In Paragraph 2, the author states that he decided what to eat based on what tasted good until he “had the chance to peer behind the curtain of the modern American food chain.” Based on what you can figure out about these key vocabulary words, explain what he means.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Cite specific details from the text that describe the potato farm.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. In the first paragraph on page 3, the author writes: “I was driving through a <em>feedlot</em>, with tens of thousands of animals <em>bellying</em> up to a concrete <em>trough</em> that ran along the side of the highway for what seemed like miles.” Using context clues, what do these words mean? What do these words help the reader understand about where hamburgers come from?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. At the top of page 4, it says: “That’s the dilemma—we can eat anything, but how do we know what to eat?” Based on context clues, what do you think this word means? What does the author’s use of the word help us to understand about the book’s title?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. In the last paragraph on page 3, Pollan says that an omnivore eats “plants, meat, mushrooms—just about anything.” Based on the context clues in this paragraph and the following paragraph, what is the omnivore’s dilemma?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What can you infer about Pollan’s purpose in writing this book? What makes you think so?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Students sit facing each other in triads.
2. A cup is placed in the center of each team’s work space. Students begin by placing their pencils/pens in the cup.
3. The teacher reads the first question and says:
   * “Teammates, consult.”
4. With the pencils still in the cup, students reread the appropriate section of text and take turns sharing their ideas and answers to the question. Students discuss the answers and then come to consensus on the answer to the question.
5. After 3–5 minutes of discussion (decide how much time is needed based on the complexity of the question and your observations while circulating), the teacher says:
   “Teammates, write.”
6. At this point, all students remove their pencils from the cup and write the answer to the question in their own words on their own paper.
7. When the students are finished recording their answers, the steps are repeated with the remaining questions.
### Questions & Notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. How did the author, Michael Pollan, make decisions about what to eat before he began working on this book? How do you know?</td>
<td>He decided what to eat based on what tasted good. He says this in the last line of the paragraph.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. In Paragraph 2, the author states that he decided what to eat based on what tasted good until he “had the chance to peer behind the curtain of the modern American food chain.” Based on what you can figure out about these key vocabulary words, explain what he means.</td>
<td>He investigated where food comes from in our country today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Cite specific details from the text that describe the potato farm.</td>
<td>The potato farm: Is 15,000 acres Is divided into circles each with an irrigation machine to give water, fertilizer and pesticides to the plants The machines were controlled by computers in a control room. There is a shed where potatoes are stored until the chemicals in them fade so that they are safe to eat.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 4. In the first paragraph on page 3, the author writes: “I was driving through a feedlot, with tens of thousands of animals bellying up to a concrete trough that ran along the side of the highway for what seemed like miles.” Using context clues, what do these words mean? What do these words help the reader understand about where hamburgers come from? | A feedlot is where many animals like cows are fed. Bellying means moving toward. A trough is something that holds food.  
This sentence helps the reader understand that cows used to make hamburgers are kept in a very large, crowded space called a feedlot. |
| 5. At the top of page 4, it says: “That’s the dilemma—we can eat anything, but how do we know what to eat?” Based on context clues, what do you think this word means? What does the author’s use of the word help us to understand about the book’s title? | Based on context clues, it sounds like a dilemma is a problem. Maybe the title means that we have a problem about deciding what to eat. He wants to figure out how we should solve the dilemma and figure out what to eat. |
| 6. In the last paragraph on page 3, Pollan says that an omnivore eats “plants, meat, mushrooms—just about anything.” Based on the context clues in this paragraph and the following paragraph, what is the omnivore’s dilemma? | Because we are omnivores, we can eat anything: plants or meat or anything in the supermarket. Since we can eat anything, our dilemma is that we have to figure out what to eat. |
| 7. What can you infer about Pollan’s purpose in writing this book? What makes you think so? | Pollan wrote the book to “solve the omnivore’s dilemma” by telling people where food comes from so they can make good decisions about what to eat. I think this because he talks about the food we eat, where it comes from, and how to make decisions about what to eat. |
Exit Ticket:
What Is the Omnivore’s Dilemma Anyway?

Name: 

Date: 

Based on the reading and discussion in today’s class, what is the meaning of the title of the book, *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*? Your answer should be at least three complete sentences.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Homework:
Which of Michael Pollan’s Food Chains Does the Meal You Chose at the Beginning of the Lesson Best Match?

Name:

Date:

Which of Michael Pollan’s food chains does the meal you chose at the beginning of the lesson best match? Why do you think that? Use evidence from the text to support your claim.
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 2
Reading for Gist and Answering Text-Dependent Questions: Industrial Food Chain
Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of literary text. (RI.8.1)
I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)
I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)
   a. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).
   b. I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.
   c. I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).

Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can find the gist of pages 22–25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
<td>• Gist annotated on sticky notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 22–25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
<td>• New vocabulary on word-catcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Answers to text-dependent questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda</td>
<td>Teaching Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Opening</td>
<td>• In this lesson, students begin to study the industrial food chain suggested by Michael Pollan. They have already read most of the first two chapters for homework.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Page 5 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (6 minutes)</td>
<td>• Students are introduced to a Food Chain graphic organizer that they will be using throughout the unit to organize their thinking on where the food begins in the chain and how it gets to us at the end of the chain. Model how to fill out these organizers, as students will be organizing their thinking on these at home as they read <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>• Reading for the gist and identifying unfamiliar vocabulary in Work Time A could take longer than the allocated 15 minutes depending on your students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work Time</td>
<td>• In advance: Read pages 22–25 (from “I Plant Corn”) considering the gist of each paragraph and the answers to the text-dependent questions students will be asked (see supporting materials).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 22–25 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (15 minutes)</td>
<td>• Post: Learning targets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 (12 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Introducing Food Chain Graphic Organizer (5 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Closing and Assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Continue Filling Out Food Chain Graphic Organizer (5 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Homework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Read Chapter 3 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma. Continue filling out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Lesson Vocabulary
- gist; regular, quadrupled, kernels, Pioneer Hi-Bred 34H31, agribusiness, hybrid, traits, disease-resistant, bushel, quadrupled, yields, genetically, organism, genes, DNA, bonanza, patent, corporation, reckless

### Materials
- *The Omnivore's Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Specials Board meal charts (from Lesson 1)
- Entrance Ticket: Meal and Food Chain Match (one per student)
- Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout (one for display)
- Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)
- Word-catcher (one per student and one for display; double sided)
- Dictionaries (enough for students to be able to reference them quickly while reading)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma* (one per student)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (one per student and one for display)
A. Engaging the Reader: Page 5 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (6 minutes)

- Be sure students have their text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind students that for homework they read pages 4–6 and 9–25. Remind the class of the four food chains that Michael Pollan introduces on page 5.
- Focus students’ attention on the definitions of each of the food chains, and remind them of the four meals on the Specials Board meal charts that they were introduced to at the beginning of the previous lesson.
- Distribute Entrance Ticket: Meal and Food Chain Match.
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share before recording their response to the following on their entrance ticket:
  * “Each of these meals comes from a different food chain. Based on the description of each food chain, how would you match them up? Which meal do you think comes from which food chain? Why do you think that?”
- Collect these entrance tickets and explain to students that they will revisit them at the end of the unit to see if they still agree with the way they have matched them up.

B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  * “I can find the gist of pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma.*”
  * “I can read closely to answer questions about pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma.*”
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “We have read to find the *gist* many times before. When you read to find the gist, what are you doing?”
  * Listen for students to explain that they are reading to find out what the text is mostly about and to see how the text is structured.
  * “What is the purpose of reading closely to answer questions about a text?”
- Listen for students to explain that it deepens their understanding of the meaning of the text.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes students accountable for completing homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which children have not been completing their homework.
- Using entrance/exit tickets allows you to get a quick check for understanding of the learning target so that instruction can be adjusted or tailored to students’ needs during the lesson or before the next lesson. Pairing entrance tickets with exit tickets allows both teachers and students to track progress from the beginning to the end of the lesson.
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Time</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 22–25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (15 minutes)</strong></td>
<td>• Hearing a complex text read slowly, fluently, and without interruption or explanation promotes fluency for students: They are hearing a strong reader read the text aloud with accuracy and expression, and are simultaneously looking at and thinking about the words on the printed page. Be sure to set clear expectations that students read along silently in their heads as you read the text aloud.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus students on the description of the industrial food chain on page 5. Invite students to read that food chain again, as that will be the focus of the next few lessons.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students they are going to read pages 22–25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> for the gist. Remind them that they should have already done a first read of these pages for homework.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Display the <strong>Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout</strong>. Explain that the questions on this document can help students to read texts closely because by questioning a text using these questions, it will help them to gain a deeper understanding of it. Tell students that in this lesson, they are going to look at the Questioning Texts row of the chart.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “Which of these questions do you think will help guide our reading so we can get the gist of pages 22–25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Listen out for and encourage students toward all the Topic, Information, and Ideas questions. (What is this text mainly about? What information or ideas does the text present? What details stand out to me as I read?) Highlight/check-mark those questions on the displayed copy of the document.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students that they are going to reread from the “I Plant Corn” section for the gist. Ask them to read along silently as you read the first paragraph aloud. As with other read-alouds, remember that the purpose is to read the text slowly, fluently, and without interruption. Don’t stop to address comprehension or vocabulary issues, as these will be addressed later and stopping would interrupt the flow of the text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “What is the gist of this first paragraph? What is this paragraph mostly about?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Listen for them to explain that it is mostly about soybeans and how they are a big crop in the industrial food chain.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Model annotating the paragraph on a <strong>sticky note</strong> and sticking it in the margin.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Display and distribute the <strong>word-catcher</strong>. Tell students that where possible you would like them to read around unfamiliar words, looking for context clues to figure out what they mean; however, if they can’t figure it out from the context, encourage them to use a <strong>dictionary</strong>. Model how to fill out the word-catcher using a dictionary with the word “processed,” paraphrasing the dictionary definition on the word-catcher.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Work Time (continued)**

- Tell students that if they still aren’t sure what the word means after looking for context clues and looking in the dictionary, they should leave the Definition column blank to be discussed with the whole group later.

- Pair students up and invite them to work together to find the gist and record unfamiliar words on their word-catchers for the rest of the paragraphs up to the end of page 25.

- Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it in the margin.

- Invite students to pair up with a different student to compare what they wrote for their gist statements and to help each other with any unfamiliar vocabulary they haven’t been able to figure out the meaning of.

- Refocus the whole group and invite them to share any unfamiliar vocabulary words they found on pages 22–25 along with the definition. Where students were unable to work out the definition from the context or find it in a dictionary, encourage other students to assist them with the definition. Ensure that a student verifies that meaning in a dictionary. To keep things moving, if no one else knows what the word means, tell students what it means.

- Be sure to address these words, as students may struggle with them: kernels, Pioneer Hi-Bred 34H31, agribusiness, hybrid, traits, disease-resistant, bushel, quadrupled, yields, genetically, organism, genes, DNA, bonanza, patent, corporation, reckless.

- Remind students to record new words on their word-catcher.

- Explain that many words we use today have Greek and Latin origins, either in the root of the word and/or in the affixes, and that becoming familiar with some of these can help us figure out the meaning of unfamiliar words. Ask students:

  * "What is an affix?"

- Select volunteers to share their response with the whole group. Listen for students to explain that an affix is something added to the beginning or end of a word to change the meaning. Provide an example: The suffix "ant" means "a person who," so the word “applicant” means “a person who applies.”

- Focus students on the word *regular* on page 23. Explain that the “reg-” part of *regular* means straight. So when Michael Pollan says "regular kernels" on page 23, he means straight kernels or normal kernels, rather than something different or modified.

**Meeting Students’ Needs**

- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language. Consider allowing students to grapple with a complex text before explicit teaching of vocabulary. After students have read for the gist, they can identify challenging vocabulary for themselves. Teachers can address student-selected vocabulary as well as predetermined vocabulary upon subsequent encounters with the text. However, in some cases and with some students, pre-teaching selected vocabulary may be necessary.

- Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.
**Work Time (continued)**

- Focus students on the word *quadrupled* on page 24. Ask:
  * Can you spot the root of this word? What does it mean?*
- Cold call students for their responses. Listen for them to explain that the root is “quad-”, which means four.

**B. Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 (12 minutes)**

- Tell students that now they are going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.
- Distribute **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma***.
- Tell students they are going to work through the questions on this handout. Ask students to get into the triads they worked with in the previous lesson. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol from yesterday in which they spend time reading and discussing and coming to an agreement about an answer before they all pick up their pens to write. Make it clear that it is now the responsibility of the triad to manage this protocol—you will not be telling them when to discuss and when to pick up their pens.
- Model how to use details in the text by asking students to work through the first question with you. Refer to the answer on the **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)**.
- Circulate to assist students. Ask questions to encourage them to refer to the text:
  * “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out to that answer in the text?”
- Invite students to pair up with someone from another triad to discuss and compare their answers. Invite students to revise their answers if they think it is necessary based on what they see in the answers of the person they are working with.

**Meeting Students’ Needs**

- Text-dependent questions can be answered only by referring explicitly to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.
- Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”
- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Work Time (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>C. Introducing Food Chain Graphic Organizer (5 minutes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Display and distribute the <strong>Food Chain graphic organizer</strong>. Remind students that Michael Pollan calls these “food chains.” Give students 2 minutes to read through the descriptors for what they are to record in each link of the chain. Ask students to discuss in triads:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “What do you think you are going to record in each link of the chain? Why?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Select volunteers to share their triad discussion with the whole group. Point to the first link on the displayed organizer, “Start.” Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “So in this lesson, we have started to look at the industrial food chain. From what you have read so far, where do you think this food chain begins?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Listen for students to explain that it begins with corn seed, which the farmer buys from a seed company and then plants to grow.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Model writing “Industrial” at the top of the handout and recording quick notes in the first link on the displayed Food Chain graphic organizer. Invite students to do the same. Tell students that they will continue filling this out as they read more about the industrial food chain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- When reviewing the graphic organizers or recording forms, consider using a document camera to display the document for students who struggle with auditory processing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Providing models of expected work supports all students, especially challenged learners.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Closing and Assessment

### A. Continue Filling Out Food Chain Graphic Organizer (5 minutes)

- Invite students to work in their triads using the Teammates Consult protocol to continue filling out more links on their Food Chain graphic organizer. Make it clear that they still have a lot more to read about the industrial food chain, so they should not expect to finish the organizer until the beginning of Lesson 5.

## Homework

- Read Chapter 3 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*. Continue filling out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.
**Entrance Ticket:**
Meal and Food Chain Match

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food Chain</th>
<th>Meal</th>
<th>Why Do You Think That?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Industrial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Organic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Sustainable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter-Gatherer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Guiding Questions 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Approaching the text</th>
<th>I am aware of my purpose(s) for reading:</th>
<th>I take note of information about the text:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Reading closely begins by considering my specific purposes for reading and important information about a text. | • Why am I reading this text?  
• In my reading, should I focus on:  
  • The content and information about the topic?  
  • The structure and language of the text?  
  • The author’s view? | • Who is the author?  
• What is the title?  
• What type of text is it?  
• Who published the text?  
• When was the text published? |

From Odell Education’s “Reading Closely for Details: Guiding Questions” handout. Used by permission.
II. Questioning Texts
Reading closely involves:
1) initially questioning a text to focus my attention on its structure, ideas, language, and perspective, then 2) questioning further as I read to sharpen my focus on the specific details in the text.

I begin my reading with questions to help me understand the text.

**Structure:**
- How is the text organized?
- How do the text’s structure and features influence my reading?

**Topic, Information, and Ideas:**
- What is this text mainly about?
- What information or ideas does the text present?
- What details stand out to me as I read?

**Language:**
- What key words or phrases do I notice as I read?
- What words or phrases are critical for my understanding of the text?
- What words and phrases are repeated?

**Perspective:**
- What is the author thinking and saying about the topic or theme?
- Who is the intended audience of the text?

I pose new questions while reading that help me deepen my understanding.

**Structure:**
- Why has the author structured the sentences and paragraphs this way?

**Topic, Information, and Ideas:**
- What information/ideas are presented at the beginning of the text?
- What information/ideas are described in detail?
- What do I learn about the topic as I read?
- How do the ideas relate to what I already know?

**Language:**
- What words and phrases are powerful or unique?
- What do the author’s words cause me to see or feel?
- What words do I need to know to better understand the text?

From Odell Education’s “Reading Closely for Details: Guiding Questions” handout. Used by permission.
### III. Analyzing Details
Reading closely involves thinking deeply about the details I have found through my questioning to determine their meaning, importance, and the ways they help develop ideas across a text.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I analyze the details I find through my questioning.</th>
<th>Analyzing and connecting details leads me to pose further text-based questions that cause me to reread more deeply.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Patterns across the text:</strong> What details, information, and ideas are repeated throughout the text? How do details, information, or ideas change across the text?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Meaning of Language:</strong> Why has the author chosen specific words or phrases?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Importance:</strong> Which details are most important to help me understand the text? Which sections are most challenging and require closer reading?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationships among details:</strong> How are the details I find related in ways that build ideas and themes? What does the text leave uncertain or unstated? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Odell Education’s “Reading Closely for Details: Guiding Questions” handout. Used by permission.
Word Catcher

Name: 

Date: 

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I can cite text-based evidence that provides the strongest support for my analysis of literary text. (RI.8.1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What reasons does Pollan give for his claim that corn “succeeded so well”?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How did farmers like George Naylor’s grandfather get their seed?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why don’t they do that anymore?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What is so great about these new hybrid seeds? How do they help the farmer?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. How is genetically modified corn seed created? Why is it better than the hybrid seed?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Text-Dependent Questions
Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. Why do farmers like George Naylor refuse to grow GMO crops?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What do you think “GMOs are a reckless experiment with the natural order of things” means?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Text-Dependent Questions

Pages 22–25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Answers for Teacher Reference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What reasons does Pollan give for his claim that corn “succeeded so well”?</td>
<td><em>Because there are “dozens of varieties,” and it is easy for us to breed “new types of corn to fit our needs.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How did farmers like George Naylor’s grandfather get their seed?</td>
<td><em>They grew it—they kept some of their crop to plant for next season.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why don’t they do that anymore?</td>
<td><em>Seed companies came up with hybrid corn seeds that resist disease and produce a lot of corn, but the seeds the corn crop produces aren’t very good, so farmers have to buy new seeds from the seed company to plant every year.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What is so great about these new hybrid seeds? How do they help the farmer?</td>
<td><em>The hybrid seeds produce a lot more corn—four times as much corn as the non-hybrid seed. The hybrids also have thicker stalks and root systems, which makes them stand upright, making them easier to harvest with large machines.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. How is genetically modified corn seed created? Why is it better than the hybrid seed?</td>
<td><em>It is created in a laboratory by adding genes, which don’t come from corn plants, to corn DNA. These seeds grow even more corn than the hybrid.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Why do farmers like George Naylor refuse to grow GMO crops?</td>
<td><em>Because they think GMO crops are “a reckless experiment with the natural order of things.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What do you think “GMOs are a reckless experiment with the natural order of things” means?</td>
<td><em>It means that GMO crops are not natural and could go wrong in the future.</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Inputs: What resources are used to grow the food (crops and animals)?

2. Growing (crops and animals): Describe where the food grows. What does it look like? What happens to make the food grow? How is the food harvested?

3. After the Harvest: Where does it go next? How is it processed?

4. Transportation: How is it moved from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer?

5. Consumers: What is the product they get? How does it impact them?

6. Unintended Outputs: Besides the actual food, what else is produced?

Additional Information

Food Chain for ____________________________
Analyzing Author’s Purpose: Industrial Food Chain
### Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)
I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)

### Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can describe Michael Pollan’s purpose on page 25 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
<td>• Food Chain graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used on page</td>
<td>• Author’s Purpose graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 and explain how he responds to them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Created by Expeditionary Learning, on behalf of Public Consulting Group, Inc.
© Public Consulting Group, Inc., with a perpetual license granted to Expeditionary Learning Outward Bound, Inc.

NYS Common Core ELA Curriculum • G8:M4:U1:L3 • June 2014 • 1
### Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 3 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (6 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Time</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Mini Lesson: Introduction to Author’s Purpose (8 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (22 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Closing and Assessment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Sharing: Author’s Purpose Graphic Organizer (7 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Homework</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Read Chapter 5 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Continue to add to your Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s industrial food chain.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In this lesson, students are introduced to the idea of author’s purpose by considering the purpose of different kinds of text. Ensure that students recognize that some texts have more than one purpose and that different parts of the same text can have different purposes too.
- Students are introduced to the Author’s Purpose graphic organizer, which will be used in the mid-unit assessment. In this lesson, you partially fill it out as a model and students finish filling it out in their triad. In subsequent lessons, students will gradually become more independent at filling out this organizer in preparation for the mid-unit assessment. Please note that as this is the first lesson in which students use this organizer, they may need additional time to fill it out. Please adjust the time accordingly.
- For homework, students read a chapter of the text. Note that as this is a long and quite complex text, students will not read every chapter. The most engaging chapters that are the most relevant to the standards have been selected for the students to read.
- In advance: Read page 25 and the answer key for the Author’s Purpose graphic organizer to familiarize yourself with what students will be doing and the answers you will be guiding them toward (see supporting materials).
- Post: Learning targets
## Lesson Vocabulary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Food Chain graphic organizer (begun in Lesson 2; one per student and one to display)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Different types of text: a novel; an informational text (for example, an encyclopedia); song lyrics, a poetry book, or a journal; and <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (one of each type of text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Author’s Purpose anchor chart (new; teacher-created)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (one per student)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Opening

#### A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 3 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (6 minutes)

- Be sure students have their text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind students that for part of their homework they were to read Chapter 3 and continue filling out their Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s industrial food chain.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. Add student ideas to the Food Chain graphic organizer that you began filling out with the class in the previous lesson. See the **Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)** to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on what they hear from other people in their triad.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes students accountable for completing homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which students have not been completing their homework.

### B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  - “I can describe Michael Pollan’s purpose on page 25 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
  - “I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used on page 25 and explain how he responds to them.”
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - “What does ‘Michael Pollan’s purpose’ mean? What do you think you are you going to be doing to achieve that learning target?”
- Listen for students to explain that they are going to determine why he wrote that page in the book.
  - “What does conflicting mean?”
  - “What is ‘conflicting evidence and viewpoints’?”
- Listen for students to explain that conflicting means it goes against, and that it is evidence and viewpoints that go against Michael Pollan’s.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
A. Mini Lesson: Introduction to Author’s Purpose (8 minutes)

- Tell students you will be displaying several different types of text. First, show them a novel. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “Why does an author usually write a novel like this? What is the purpose of the text?”
- Listen for them to explain that novels are usually to entertain the reader and to help them escape into other worlds away from their own. Ensure that students recognize that they may also inform/teach the reader something at the same time as entertaining them. For example, a novel set at a certain time in history, like the Civil War, may inform the reader of real facts and information about that time/event in history. Start an Author’s Purpose anchor chart and add:
  - To entertain/help the reader to escape
  - To inform/teach
- Show students an informational text (for example, an encyclopedia). Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “Why does an author write an informational text like this? What is the purpose of the text? What is the author trying to do?”
- Listen for students to explain that an informational text informs and teaches the reader about the topic of the book. Some students may suggest that informational texts can be entertaining as well as informative. If so, ask them to provide an example that has led them to suggest that. As “inform/teach” has already been added to the anchor chart, it doesn’t need to be added again.
- Next, show students song lyrics, a poetry book, or a journal. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “Why does an author write song lyrics/a poetry book/a journal like this?”
- Listen for students to explain that an author writes it to express his or her feelings. Record on the Author’s Purpose anchor chart:
  - To express themselves/their feelings.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Consider partnering ELL students who speak the same home language when discussion of complex content is required. This can allow students to have more meaningful discussions and clarify points in their native language.
- Anchor charts provide a visual cue to students about what to do when you ask them to work independently. They also serve as note-catchers when the class is co-constructing ideas.
### Work Time (continued)

- Finally, show students *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Ask them to Think-Pair-Share:

- Listen for students to explain that it is an informational text, so Pollan wrote it to inform and teach people, but also to persuade them to think carefully about the foods they buy, by presenting arguments. Record on the Author’s Purpose anchor chart:
  - To persuade the reader.

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - “So what is the difference between an informational text and a text to persuade the reader by arguing a point? How do you know whether a text is purely informational to inform and teach or whether it is trying to persuade you by presenting an argument? If you were writing an argument to persuade someone of something, what would it look like?”

- Listen for students to explain that a purely informational text contains just facts that don’t persuade you to believe anything in particular, whereas a persuasive argument contains a claim supported by evidence. Make it clear that sometimes the evidence to support a claim can be facts, but those facts are presented with a claim so we know it is an argument.

- Add details to the Author’s Purpose anchor chart:
  - To inform/teach with facts and information
  - To persuade the reader by presenting arguments with a claim and evidence and reasoning to support the claim; this evidence is sometimes facts

### B. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (22 minutes)

- Invite students to get into triads. Remind them that as they just discussed, some parts of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* contain facts and information to inform/teach you about where your food comes from and what happens to it, some parts try to persuade you to eat a certain way or to not eat certain foods, and some parts do both at once. Explain that today they will analyze an excerpt on page 25 to determine the author’s purpose.

- Display and distribute **Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer**. Invite students to spend 2 minutes reading the graphic organizer.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.
### Work Time (continued)

- Ask students:
  - “What do you notice?”
  - “What do you wonder?”
- Focus the class on Part 2 of the organizer. Ask students to discuss in triads:
  - “What is a conflicting viewpoint or conflicting evidence?”
- Listen for students to explain that a conflicting viewpoint or evidence goes against what Michael Pollan believes.
  - “Why might Michael Pollan present viewpoints or evidence that goes against his own in his writing?”
- Students may struggle with this and may need guiding toward the idea that he would use conflicting viewpoints and evidence to have something to argue against, so that we understand what the other points of view are and why we shouldn’t believe/trust them. Guide students to understand that a claim with evidence is a result of careful critical thinking and deep knowledge about something that is complicated, and that a good writer researches his subject carefully and learns a lot about it. He does not make a claim until he has real, true evidence to support it. Part of that is recognizing differing opinions and reasoning from them.
- Ask students to read page 25 with the questions on the Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer in mind.
- Ask them to discuss in their triads:
  - “What is the author’s purpose on page 25? Is it to entertain? Is it to inform? Is it to persuade? Is it more than one of those things?”
  - “How do you know? Is Michael Pollan giving us just facts? Or is he making a claim and supporting it with evidence? Or is he doing both?”
  - “What is he saying about seed companies here? Does he make you think they are good or bad? How?”
  - “Which details from the text can you use to support your claim?”
- Invite students to help you to partially fill out the first three boxes of the Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer. Model filling out only one detail from the text in the How Do You Know? box. See the Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference) for a suggestion of how to model filling it out. Invite students to work in triads to finish filling out the first three boxes on their graphic organizer using the model as a starting point. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol in which they discuss and come to an agreement about what to write before they all pick up their pens to write at the same time.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- When reviewing the graphic organizers or recording forms, consider using a document camera to display the document for students who struggle with auditory processing.
- Providing models of expected work supports all students, especially challenged learners.
- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
Work Time (continued)

- Focus students’ attention on Part 2 of the organizer. Ask students to discuss in their triads:
  * “What claim is Michael Pollan making here?”
  * “What evidence does he use to support his claim?”

- Use student responses and the answer key to model how to partially fill out the first two boxes of Part 2. Model filling out only one of the evidence boxes. Point out that some of the details they took from the text in Part 1 could be used again here. Invite students to work in triads to finish filling out the first two boxes of Part 2 on their graphic organizer using the model as a starting point.

- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  * “What conflicting viewpoint or evidence does Pollan use? Remember that conflicting means a viewpoint that goes against his claim and the argument he is making.”

- Students may struggle with this and may need guiding toward the idea that one conflicting viewpoint that Michael Pollan touches on is that GMO corn promises even higher yields and opens up a world of possibilities for the plant. This is a conflicting viewpoint because it implies that the GMO seeds the seed companies are creating produce higher yields, which could mean benefits for the farmer in terms of the amount of corn they can produce, and the higher profit they can make.

- Use student responses and the answer key to model how to fill out the box about conflicting viewpoint and evidence. Invite students to work in triads to fill out that box on their graphic organizer using the model as a starting point.

- Ask students to discuss in their triads:
  * “How has Michael Pollan responded to the conflicting viewpoint or evidence? Has he argued against it? Or has he mentioned it briefly but without many details?”

- Use student responses and the answer key to model how to fill out the box about how Michael Pollan responds to conflicting viewpoint and evidence. Invite students to work in triads to fill out that box on their graphic organizer using the model as a starting point.
### Closing and Assessment

**A. Sharing: Author's Purpose Graphic Organizer (7 minutes)**

- Invite students to pair up with someone else from another triad to share their completed Page 25: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer. Invite them to revise their organizer based on what they see on the other person’s organizer where they think necessary.

#### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Having students pair up with someone else to compare their work can give students the opportunity to gain a deeper understanding, to learn from peers, and to improve their own work as a result.

### Homework

- Read Chapter 5 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- Continue to add to your Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s industrial food chain.
Industrial Food Chain Graphic Organizer: Answers for Teacher’s Reference

**1. Inputs:**
- What resources are used to grow the food (crops and animals)?
  - Pioneer Hi-Bred 34H31 seed from agribusiness company (Ch. 2)
  - Genetically modified seeds (Ch. 2)
  - Weed killer (Ch. 2)
  - Ammonium nitrate fertilizer (Ch. 3)
  - Pesticide (Ch. 3)
  - Fossil fuels for pesticides, tractors, harvesting, drying and transporting (Ch. 3)
  - Corn for cattle feed (Ch. 5)
  - Liquefied fat, protein supplement, liquid vitamins, antibiotic drugs, alfalfa hay and stems and leaves of corn plants (Ch. 5)
  - Mill to grind the corn for cattle feed (Ch. 5)

**2. Growing (crops and animals):**
- Describe where the food grows. What does it look like? What happens to make the food grow? How is the food harvested?
  - Corn grows close together; 30,000 plants per acre (Ch. 2)
  - Harvested with large machines (Ch. 2)
  - Corn farms are very big (Ch. 2)
  - First stage in production of hamburgers: cattle spend first 6 months in a pasture with mother eating a “salad bar of grasses” (Ch. 5)
  - Densely packed animal cities (Ch. 5)
  - Feed mill is in center
  - Dusty from dried up manure

**3. After the Harvest:**
- Where does it go next? How is it processed?
  - Grain elevator buys corn and soybeans (Ch. 3)
  - Farmer brings corn to grain elevator; it is weighed, graded and he is paid (Ch. 4)
  - Some goes to feed lots where it is ground up into animal feed by the feed mill (Ch. 5)

**4. Transportation:**
- How is it moved from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer?

**5. Consumers:**
- What is the product they get? How does it impact them?
  - Grain elevator buys corn and soybeans (Ch. 3)
  - Farmer brings corn to grain elevator; it is weighed, graded and he is paid (Ch. 4)
  - Some goes to feed lots where it is ground up into animal feed by the feed mill (Ch. 5)

**6. Unintended Outputs:**
- Besides the actual food, what else is produced?
  - Corn (Ch. 2)
  - Meat (Ch. 5)
  - People get to eat more meat because it’s cheaper (Ch. 5)
  - High-fructose corn syrup, soda, snack foods, ketchup, mustard, bread, cereal, relishes, crackers, hot dogs, ham (Ch. 7)

**Additional Information**
- The same businesses that create new seed, also sell tools and fertilizer. They also make processed food and other products using cheap corn. (Ch. 3)
- Government is also involved in the chain. It helps keep prices of corn low. (Ch. 3)
- Not an ecological/natural loop in which nitrogen is recycled. That is how it used to be. (Ch. 3)
- Raw materials are turned into a finished product. (Ch. 3)
### Part 1: Author’s Purpose

**Food chain:**

**Page numbers:**

What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

1. 
2. 
3.
**Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence**

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What claim is the author making?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What evidence does the author use to support the claim?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Part 1: Author’s Purpose

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food chain: Industrial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page numbers: 25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To inform and persuade.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.**

*He tries to persuade us that the seed companies make life difficult for farmers by making farmers pay a lot of money each year for hybrid and GMO seeds, even when they are facing hard times. He uses the facts about GMO corn to both inform us about what GMO means and as part of his argument about how seed companies are making life difficult for farmers.*

1. **To inform:** “It is created in a laboratory by adding genes to corn DNA. The new genes don’t come from corn plants. They might come from a bacteria or some other organism.”

2. **To persuade:** “Soon the only way for a farmer to compete was to buy hybrid seed from seed companies. Even if farmers face hard times, the seed companies continue to make money year after year, selling farmers something they used to grow themselves.”

3. **To persuade:** “When Monsanto, or some other corporation, invents a new type of corn, it belongs to them and they can charge farmers for the right to grow it.”
### Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

#### What claim is the author making?
Seed companies make life difficult for farmers by making farmers pay a lot of money each year for hybrid and GMO seeds, even when they are facing hard times.

#### What evidence does the author use to support the claim?

| 1. “Soon the only way for a farmer to compete was to buy hybrid seed from seed companies. Even if farmers face hard times, the seed companies continue to make money year after year, selling farmers something they used to grow themselves.” | “These new GMO seeds could be a bonanza for the seed companies.” | 3. “When Monsanto, or some other corporation, invents a new type of corn, it belongs to them and they can charge farmers for the right to grow it.” |

#### What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?

Michael Pollan uses GMO corn to provide another reason for why the seed companies are bad, but he also mentions the good things about GMO corn that we can infer would be positive for farmers. He says, “Genetically modified corn seed (or GMO, for genetically modified organism) promises even higher yields than hybrid seed.... This opens up a whole new world of possibilities for the plant and its breeders.”

#### How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?

He has mentioned a few good things about GMO corn, but rather than elaborating and providing details about how this could be positive for the farmers, he leads into continuing to explain why the seed companies are bad.
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 4
Reading for Gist, Answering Text-Dependent Questions, and Determining Author’s Purpose: Industrial Food Chain
Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)
I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)
I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)
I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)
   a. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).
   b. I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.
   c. I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).

Supporting Learning Targets

- I can find the gist of pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can read closely to answer questions about pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them.

Ongoing Assessment

- Gist annotated on sticky notes
- New vocabulary on word-catcher
- Answers to text-dependent questions
- Author’s Purpose graphic organizer
## Agenda

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Opening</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 5 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (6 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Work Time</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 47–49 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (12 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 47–49 (10 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Closing and Assessment</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (15 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Homework</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Read pages 76–82 and finish filling out the Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Read Chapter 10. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Teaching Notes

- In this lesson, students work in pairs and triads with less teacher modeling and input to find the gist, answer text-dependent questions, and to determine the author’s purpose and identify conflicting viewpoints and evidence. This is to prepare them for the mid-unit assessment in which they will do this independently.
- Based on the needs of your class, consider adding extra time to work with vocabulary.
- Students may still require a lot of support identifying the conflicting viewpoint or evidence and determining how Michael Pollan has responded to it, as it isn’t obvious.
- In advance: Read pages 47–49 (up to “Steer Number 534”) considering the gist of each paragraph, the answers to the text-dependent questions students will be asked, and the author’s purpose and conflicting evidence and viewpoints (see the answer key for the text-dependent questions and Author’s Purpose graphic organizer in supporting materials).
- Post: Learning targets
# Lesson Vocabulary

- gist, author’s purpose, conflicting evidence and viewpoints; ramrod-straight, prairie, feedlot, manure, steer, government subsidies, subsidizing, fertilizer, resident, densely

# Materials

- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (begun in Lesson 2; one per student and one to display)
- Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference; from Lesson 3)
- Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout (one for display; from Lesson 2)
- Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)
- Word-catcher (from Lesson 2; students may need a new copy if they filled out the one they have)
- Dictionaries (enough for students to be able to reference them quickly while reading)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
- Pages 47–49: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (one per student)
- Pages 47–49: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)
# Opening

## A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 5 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (6 minutes)

- Be sure students have their text, *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind students that for part of their homework they were to read Chapter 5 and continue filling out their **Food Chain graphic organizer** for Michael Pollan’s industrial food chain.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. Use student ideas to add to the displayed Food Chain graphic organizer that you began filling out with the class in the previous lesson. See the **Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)** (from Lesson 3) to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on the class model.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes them accountable for completing the homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which students have not been completing their homework.

## B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

- Invite the class to read the learning targets with you:
  - “I can find the gist of pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma.*”
  - “I can read closely to answer questions about pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma.*”
  - “I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma.*”
  - “I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them.”
- Remind students that they have already seen these learning targets in the previous lessons and of what **gist, author's purpose, and conflicting evidence and viewpoints** mean.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
**A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*** (12 minutes)

- Refocus students on the description of the industrial food chain on page 5. Invite students to read that food chain again to refresh their memory of what it is about.
- Tell students they are going to read pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for the gist. Remind them that they should have already done a first read of these pages for homework.
- Remind students of Topic, Information, and Ideas on the Questioning Texts row of the Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout.
- Tell students that they are going to reread from the beginning of Chapter 5 up to “Steer Number 534” on page 49 for the gist. Remind students to write their annotations of the gist of each paragraph on sticky notes to stick in the margin of the book. Ask them to use their word-catcher to record any new vocabulary. Remind students that if they still aren’t sure what the word means after looking for context clues, they are to look in a dictionary, and if they can’t find the definition there, they should leave the Definition column blank to be discussed with the whole group later.
- Pair students up and invite them to work together to find the gist and record unfamiliar words on their word-catchers for pages 47–49.
- Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it in the margin.
- Invite students to pair up with a different student to compare what they wrote for their gist statements and to help each other with any unfamiliar vocabulary they haven’t been able to figure out the meaning of.
- Refocus the whole group and invite students to share any unfamiliar vocabulary words they found on pages 47–49 along with the definition. Where students were unable to work out the definition from the context or find it in a dictionary, encourage other students to assist them with the definition. Ensure that a student verifies the meaning for the whole class in a dictionary. To keep things moving, if no one else knows what the word means, tell students what it means.
- Students may struggle with the following words, so be sure to address them here: ramrod-straight, prairie, feedlot, manure, steer, government subsidies, subsidizing, fertilizer.
- Remind class members to record new words on their word-catcher.

---

**Meeting Students’ Needs**

- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language. Consider allowing students to grapple with a complex text before explicit teaching of vocabulary. After students have read for the gist, they can identify challenging vocabulary for themselves. Teachers can address student-selected vocabulary as well as predetermined vocabulary upon subsequent encounters with the text. However, in some cases and with some students, pre-teaching selected vocabulary may be necessary.
- Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.
### Work Time (continued)
- Explain that many words we use today have Greek and Latin origins, either in the root of the word and/or in the affixes, and that becoming familiar with some of these can help us figure out the meaning of unfamiliar words.
- Focus students on the word *resident*, specifically the “sid” part of this word, on page 48. Ask:
  * “What word does ‘sid’ sound like?”
- Select volunteers to share their responses. Listen for them to explain that “sid” sounds like “sit.” Tell students that “sid” is Latin and means sit or live. Ask:
  * “So what is a *resident*?”
- Cold call students to share their responses. Listen for them to say that it means someone who lives there.
- Focus students on *densely*, specifically the “dens” part of this word, on page 49. Explain that “dens” is Latin for thick, so *densely* means thickly.

### Meeting Students’ Needs
- Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”
- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Work Time (continued)

**B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 47–49 (10 minutes)**

- Ask students to get into the triads they have been working with since the beginning of the unit. Tell them that now they are going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.

- Distribute **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 47–49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma***.

- Tell students they are going to work through the questions on this handout. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol in which they discuss the answer and come to an agreement before they all pick up their pens at the same time to write the answer on their recording form.

- Circulate to assist students in answering the questions. Ask questions to encourage students to refer to the text:
  
  * “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out to that answer in the text?”

- Invite students to pair up with someone else from another triad to discuss and compare their answers. Invite students to revise their answers if they think necessary based on what they see in the answers of the person they are working with.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Text-dependent questions can be answered only by referring explicitly to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.

- Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
## Closing and Assessment

### A. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (15 minutes)

- Remind students that as they discussed in the previous lesson, different kinds of texts have different purposes. Remind them that some parts of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* contain facts and information to inform/teach you about where your food comes from and what happens to it, some parts try to persuade you to eat a certain way or to not eat certain foods, and some parts do both at once. Explain that today, students are going to analyze pages 47–49 to determine the author’s purpose.

- Distribute **Pages 47–49: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer**. Ask students to reread pages 47–49 keeping the questions on this graphic organizer in mind.

- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  1. “What is the author’s purpose on pages 47–49? Is it to entertain? Is it to inform? Is it to persuade? Is it more than one of those things?”
  2. “How do you know? Is Michael Pollan giving us just facts? Or is he making a claim and supporting it with evidence? Or is he doing both?”
  3. “What is he saying about CAFOs here?”
  4. “Which details from the text can you use to support your claim?”

- Invite students to work in triads to discuss and fill out the first three boxes of Part 1 of their Pages 47–49: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer.

- Move on to focus students’ attention on Part 2 of the organizer. Ask students to discuss in triads:
  1. “What claim is Michael Pollan making here?”
  2. “What evidence does he use to support his claim?”

- Invite students to continue working in triads to discuss and fill out the first two boxes of Part 2 of their Pages 47–49: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Closing and Assessment (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “How has Michael Pollan responded to the conflicting viewpoint or evidence? Has he argued against it? Or has he mentioned it briefly but without many details?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students may struggle with this and may need guiding toward the idea that although Michael Pollan is giving a positive outcome of CAFOs, he is explaining that it comes at a cost.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invite students to continue working in triads to fill out that box on their graphic organizer.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Homework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Read pages 76–82 and finish filling out the Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read Chapter 10. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Why had “the stench of the place been rising for more than a mile?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How often does the corn mill run?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What does the corn mill do?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What does CAFO stand for?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What is the difference between the “old-fashioned” way of raising cattle on small family farms and raising cattle in CAFOs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. According to Michael Pollan, what is bad about raising cattle in CAFOs?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Text-Dependent Questions

Pages 47-49 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Answers for Teacher Reference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Why had “the stench of the place been rising for more than a mile?”</td>
<td><em>The cattle were standing or lying in manure.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How often does the corn mill run?</td>
<td><em>It runs 12 hours a day, seven days a week.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What does the corn mill do?</td>
<td><em>It turns the corn into cattle feed.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What does CAFO stand for?</td>
<td><em>Concentrated Animal Feeding Operation</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What is the difference between the “old-fashioned” way of raising cattle on small family farms and raising cattle in CAFOs?</td>
<td><em>On small family farms, cattle were raised in pastures, eating grass and hay. Cattle that are raised in CAFOs live in densely packed “animal cities” and eat corn.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. According to Michael Pollan, what is bad about raising cattle in CAFOs?</td>
<td><em>The waste from CAFOs causes toxic pollution. The feedlots are breeding grounds for deadly bacteria, which get into our food. Because the animals are forced to eat corn, they are not very healthy and they make us unhealthy.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 1: Author's Purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food chain:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page numbers:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

1. 
2. 
3. 
## Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What claim is the author making?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What evidence does the author use to support the claim?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Part 1: Author’s Purpose**

**Food chain:** *Industrial*

**Page numbers:** 47-49

What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?

*To inform and persuade.*

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

*He tries to persuade us that the old-fashioned, small family farm way of raising cattle in pastures was better than CAFOs because it caused less pollution and fewer health concerns. In doing so, he also informs us of some facts about CAFOs.*

1. **To inform:** “Twelve hours a day, seven days a week, the mill noisily turns America’s river of corn into cattle feed.”

2. **To persuade:** “The waste from CAFOs is a huge source of very toxic pollution. Tons of animal manure are produced with no good way of disposing of it.”

3. **To persuade:** “The feedlots are also breeding grounds for new and deadly bacteria. Some of these bacteria are finding their way into our food.”
Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What claim is the author making?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The old-fashioned, small family farm way of raising cattle in pastures was better than CAFOs because it caused less pollution and fewer health concerns.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What evidence does the author use to support the claim?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. “The old-fashioned way of raising cattle, like the old-fashioned way of growing corn, was on the small family farm. Cattle were raised in pastures, eating grass and hay—the food they naturally eat.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. “The waste from CAFOs is a huge source of very toxic pollution. Tons of animal manure are produced with no good way of disposing of it.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “The feedlots are also breeding grounds for new and deadly bacteria. Some of these bacteria are finding their way into our food.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Michael Pollan provides us with a positive outcome of CAFOs by explaining that because of them, meat is now cheap enough for many of us to eat it three times a day, rather than it being a special treat as it used to be. He says, “Eating meat used to be a special occasion in most American homes. Thanks to CAFOs, meat is now so cheap that many of us eat it three times a day.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Although Michael Pollan is giving a positive outcome of CAFOs, he does so with a sarcastic tone. The “Thanks” at the beginning of the sentence suggests a sarcastic tone, as does the negative sentence after it, “Of course, the American taxpayers have already paid part of the cost by subsidizing corn.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 5
Reading for Gist, Answering Text-Dependent Questions, and Determining Author’s Purpose:
Industrial Organic Food Chain
GRADING 8: MODULE 4: UNIT 1: LESSON 5
Reading for Gist, Answering Text-Dependent Questions,
and Determining Author’s Purpose:
Industrial Organic Food Chain

Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

| I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2) |
| I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4) |
| I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6) |
| I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6) |
| I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8) |

Supporting Learning Targets

- I can find the gist of pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can read closely to answer questions about pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.
- I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them.

Ongoing Assessment

- Gist annotated on sticky notes
- New vocabulary on word-catcher
- Answers to text-dependent questions
- Author’s Purpose graphic organizer
### Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening</th>
<th>Work Time</th>
<th>Closing and Assessment</th>
<th>Homework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Pages 76–82 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (6 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 112–115 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (7 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Sharing Author’s Purpose Graphic Organizers (5 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Read Chapter 11 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and fill out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial organic food chain based on what you have read in Chapters 10 and 11. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 112–115 (10 minutes)</td>
<td>B. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (15 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Teaching Notes

- This is the first in the two-lesson cycle in which students build background knowledge about Michael Pollan’s industrial organic food chain.
- In order to gradually be released to work independently in preparation for the mid-unit assessment, students work in pairs without teacher modeling to find the gist and to answer text-dependent questions.
- In advance: Read pages 112–115 (from “The Birth of Organic Food” to “Hippie Food”) considering the gist of each paragraph, the answers to the text-dependent questions students are asked, and the author’s purpose and conflicting evidence and viewpoints (see the answer key for the text-dependent questions and Author’s Purpose graphic organizer in supporting materials).
- Post: Learning targets.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson Vocabulary</th>
<th>Materials</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| gist, author’s purpose, conflicting evidence and viewpoints; fossil fuels, pesticides, synthetic, corrupt, immoral, DDT, principles, additives | • *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)  
• Food Chain graphic organizer (begun in Lesson 2; one per student and one to display)  
• Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference; from Lesson 4)  
• Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout (one for display; from Lesson 2)  
• Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)  
• Word-catcher (from Lesson 2; students may need a new copy if they filled out the one they have)  
• Dictionaries (enough for students to be able to reference them quickly while reading)  
• Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)  
• Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)  
• Pages 112–115 Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (one per student)  
• Pages 112–115 Author’s Purpose graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)  
• Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 2; new blank copy; one per student) |
## Opening Meeting Students’ Needs

### A. Engaging the Reader: Pages 76–82 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma* (6 minutes)

- Be sure students have their text, *The Omnivore's Dilemma*. Remind students that for homework they were to read pages 76–82 and finish filling out their Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial food chain.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. Use student ideas to add to the Food Chain graphic organizer that you began filling out with the class in the previous lesson. See the Industrial Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference) to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on what they hear from other students.

### B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  - “I can find the gist of pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
  - “I can read closely to answer questions about pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
  - “I can describe the purpose of Michael Pollan in the excerpt from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
  - “I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints Michael Pollan has used and explain how he responds to them.”
- Remind students that they have already seen these learning targets in the previous lessons and of what the *gist, author’s purpose, and conflicting evidence and viewpoints* mean.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes them accountable for completing the homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which students have not been completing their homework.
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
### A. Reading for Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (7 minutes)

- Focus students on the description of the industrial organic food chain on page 5. Invite students to read that food chain again to refresh their memory of what it is about.
- Tell students they are going to read pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for the gist. Remind them that they should have already done a first read of these pages when they read Chapter 10 for homework.
- Remind students of Topic, Information, and Ideas on the Questioning Texts row of the *Reading Closely: Guiding Questions* handout.
- Tell students that they are going to reread from “The Birth of Organic Food” on page 112 to “Hippie Food” on page 115 for the gist.
- Remind students to write their annotations of the gist of each paragraph on sticky notes to stick in the margin of the book. Ask them to use their word-catcher to record any new vocabulary. Remind students that if they aren’t sure what the word means after looking for context clues and looking in the dictionary, they should leave the Definition column blank to be discussed with the whole group later.
- Pair students up and invite them to work together to find the gist and record unfamiliar words on their word-catchers for pages 112–115.
- Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it in the margin.
- Invite students to pair up with a different student to compare what they wrote for their gist statements and to help each other with any unfamiliar vocabulary they haven’t been able to figure out the meaning of.
- Refocus the whole group and invite them to share any unfamiliar vocabulary words they found on pages 112–115 along with the definition. Where students were unable to work out the definition from the context or find it in a dictionary, encourage other students to assist them with the definition. To keep things moving, if no one else knows what the word means, tell students what it means.
- Students may struggle with the following words, so be sure to address them here: *fossil fuels, pesticides, synthetic, corrupt, immoral, DDT, principles, additives.*

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language. Consider allowing students to grapple with a complex text before explicit teaching of vocabulary. After students have read for the gist, they can identify challenging vocabulary for themselves. Teachers can address student-selected vocabulary as well as predetermined vocabulary upon subsequent encounters with the text. However, in some cases and with some students, pre-teaching selected vocabulary may be necessary.
- Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.
Work Time (continued)

- The word “compromise” is particularly important for students to know before the work on conflicting viewpoints and evidence in the next lesson. Remind students to record new words on their word-catcher.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Text-dependent questions can be answered only by referring explicitly to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.

B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 112–115 (10 minutes)

- Invite students to get into the triads they have been working with in this unit. Tell them that now they are going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.

- Distribute **Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 112–115 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma**.

- Tell students they are going to work through the questions on this handout. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol in which they discuss the answer and come to an agreement in their triad before they all pick up their pens to write the answer together.

- Circulate to assist students in answering the questions. Ask questions to encourage students to refer to the text:
  * “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out to that answer in the text?”

- Invite students to pair up with someone else from another triad to discuss and compare their answers. Invite students to revise their answers if they think it’s necessary based on what they see in the answers of the person they are working with.

- Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Work Time (continued)

**C. Determining Author’s Purpose and Conflicting Evidence or Viewpoints (15 minutes)**

- Distribute **Pages 112–115: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer**. Ask students to reread pages 112–115 keeping the questions on this graphic organizer in mind.
- Invite students to work in pairs to fill out their graphic organizer as they did in the previous lesson.
- Circulate to assist students in filling out their organizer. Ask:
  * “What is the author’s purpose for this extract of text? How do you know?”
  * “What details can you find in the text to support your claim about author’s purpose?”
  * “What claim is the author making?”
  * “What evidence does he use to support his claim?”
  * “What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?”
  * “How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?”

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.
### Closing and Assessment

**A. Sharing Author’s Purpose Graphic Organizers (5 minutes)**
- Invite students to pair up with someone from another triad to share their Pages 112–115: Author’s Purpose graphic organizer and to add information or make revisions to their organizer where they think it’s necessary.
- Distribute a new **Food Chain graphic organizer**. Invite students to record “Industrial Organic” at the top of this organizer.

### Meeting Students’ Needs
- Having students pair up with someone else to compare their work can give students the opportunity to gain a deeper understanding, learn from peers, and improve their own work as a result.

### Homework

**Meeting Students’ Needs**
- Read Chapter 11 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and fill out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial organic food chain based on what you have read in Chapters 10 and 11. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What does “organic” mean?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. When did the idea of organic food catch on? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. When was the first Earth Day?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What are organic food co-ops?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What drove the food co-ops out of business?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Why does Michael Pollan call this food chain “industrial organic”??</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Text-Dependent Questions

Pages 112–115 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Answers for Teacher Reference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What does “organic” mean?</td>
<td><em>Grown without the help of fossil fuels, pesticides, or chemical fertilizers</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. When did the idea of organic food catch on? Why?</td>
<td><em>1969, because of Rachel Carson’s book about the dangers of pesticides like DDT and the events in the news that “made people aware of the dangers of pollution”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. When was the first Earth Day?</td>
<td><em>April 1970</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What are organic food co-ops?</td>
<td><em>Neighbors would get together once a week and order organic vegetables from farmers. They had to agree on what to order. Often they bought whatever the local farmers had to offer.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Why does Michael Pollan call this food chain “industrial organic”?</td>
<td><em>It is organic because it is “grown without chemical fertilizers or pesticides,” and it is industrial because “Most organic vegetables in the U.S. are grown in large monoculture farms” and “Most of it is processed and sold by the same industrial food chain as the corn from George Naylor’s farm.”</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Part 1: Author's Purpose

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food chain:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Page numbers:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

---

1. 
2. 
3.
**Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence**

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What claim is the author making?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What evidence does the author use to support the claim?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food chain: Industrial Organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page numbers: 112-115, Michael Pollen

What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?

**To inform and persuade.**

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

*He informs us of how the organic movement was born and that originally, the word “organic” meant a lot more than just how food was grown. It meant a whole way of life, as well as being free from big corporations. He wants to persuade us that some of the current ways of producing organic goes against the original ideals and is actually more industrial than we might think.*

**Evidence:**

1. Inform: “… the environmental movement … was spurred on by … dangers of pesticides like DDT” (113).

2. Inform: “To the young people who founded those first co-ops, the word organic … meant living in harmony with nature instead of trying to control it” (113).

3. Persuade: “But if you look a little closer you’ll see that something has been left behind. The organic food in stores like Whole Foods is organic because it is grown without chemical fertilizers or pesticides. Yet much of it is also industrial” (114).
### Part 2: Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence

If the purpose of the text is to **persuade** you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What claim is the author making?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>That organic food really isn’t organic anymore, at least not in the way it was intended when people first started using that word back in the 1940s. It is more industrial now.</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What evidence does the author use to support the claim?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. “Most organic vegetables in the U.S. are grown in large monoculture farms (farms growing only one crop), far from the people who eat it. Most of it is processed and sold by the same industrial food chain as the corn from George Naylor’s farm” (114).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. “... some organic milk comes from cows on small farm. But most organic milk comes from factory farms” (p. 114).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “... organic beef is often raised in ‘organic feedlots.’ The cows are fed corn just like the cows at Poky, but their feed is organic” (114).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Near the beginning, he provides positives to the way organic food is produced now—organic fruit and vegetables are more widely available and easier to find than they were before. He writes, “Today in the average supermarket there’s a selection of organic fruits and vegetables flown in from all over the world. You can buy your organics at any time of the year, no matter the season. And you don’t have to get a dozen other people to agree on what to buy.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>He goes on to argue against the positives to make his claim that it goes against the original meaning of the word “organic.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 6
Analyzing a Speaker’s Purpose and Motives of a Media Excerpt
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats. (SL.8.2)  
I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation. (SL.8.2)

## Supporting Learning Targets

- I can describe the purpose of a speaker.  
- I can evaluate the motives of a media presentation.

## Ongoing Assessment

- Food Chain graphic organizer  
- Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer

## Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Opening</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 11 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (8 minutes)</td>
<td>• In this lesson, students consider a speaker’s purpose in order to practice SL.8.2 in preparation for the mid-unit assessment in Lesson 7. They watch/listen to a media clip of a speaker and analyze the speaker’s purpose and evaluate the motives of the media.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>• For this lesson you will need to find a media clip of someone speaking with a clear purpose about content relevant to <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Consider using the search terms ‘Industrial Food’ or ‘Industrial Organic Food’ in a search engine or a free video site like Vimeo or YouTube. Please note that media on free media sites often contains advertisements, so please screen your chosen media carefully to ensure content is appropriate before playing it to students.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Work Time</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Listening to a Speech (20 minutes)</td>
<td>• Students watch/listen to the media multiple times to ensure they understand what the speaker is talking about and to take adequate notes to be able to analyze the speaker’s purpose and evaluate the motives of the media.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Analyzing the Speech for Speaker’s Purpose and Evaluating Motives (10 minutes)</td>
<td>• Note that students are introduced to a new graphic organizer in this lesson for speaker’s purpose. This graphic organizer is very similar to the author’s purpose graphic organizer students have been filling out in previous lessons; however, this one contains an additional section about the motives of the media.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Closing and Assessment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Sharing Author’s Purpose Graphic Organizers (5 minutes)</td>
<td>• In advance: Prepare technology to play media. Review the media you are going to play to students in order to determine the speaker’s purpose and the motives of the media.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Homework</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Read Chapter 12 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Begin filling out the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s local sustainable food chain.</td>
<td>• Post: Learning targets.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Lesson Vocabulary

- speaker’s purpose, motives

### Materials

- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 5)
- Industrial Organic Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)
- Media excerpt and the technology to the play the excerpt to the whole group (media source containing a speaker with a purpose; see Teaching Note)
- Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer (one per student and one to display)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 2; new blank copy; one per student)
### Opening

#### A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 11 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (8 minutes)
- Be sure students have their text, *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind students that for homework they were to read Chapter 11 and fill out their Food Chain graphic organizer for the industrial organic food chain.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. See the Industrial Organic Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference) to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on what they hear from other students.

#### B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)
- Ask for volunteers to read aloud the targets for today’s lesson:
  * “I can describe the purpose of a speaker.”
  * “I can evaluate the motives of a media presentation.”
- Remind students of what author’s purpose is and tell them that in a speech or documentary where people are interviewed, like an author in a text, speakers also have a purpose.
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “What does it mean by the motives of a media presentation? What are motives?”
- Select volunteers to share their responses. Listen for them to explain that motives are the reason the medium was made. Provide them with an example: A TV advertisement is made to make people buy a product.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes students accountable for completing the homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which children have not been completing their homework.
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
## Analyzing a Speaker’s Purpose and Motives of a Media Excerpt

### Work Time

**A. Listening to a Speech (20 minutes)**

- Remind students that in previous lessons they analyzed excerpts of Michael Pollan’s *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for author’s purpose. Explain that in this lesson, they will be watching/listening to a media clip of someone speaking and they will analyze it for speaker’s purpose, just as they did with the text. Tell them that as the learning targets suggest, they will then evaluate the motives of the media.

- Explain that they will have the opportunity to watch/listen to the media clip a few times, so the first time they should just listen carefully.

- Play the **media excerpt** once.

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “What did you learn from the clip? What does the speaker say?”

- Cold call students to share their responses with the whole group.

- Display and distribute the **Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer** and focus students’ attention on the box at the top of the organizer, which asks them to take notes for the gist. Remind students that the gist is what it is mostly about, so they will be listening/watching for what the excerpt is mostly about.

- Model listening for the gist by playing a very short excerpt of the media clip and recording some gist notes on the displayed organizer.

- Tell students that they are going to watch/listen to the media clip again and take notes for the gist this time. Play the clip again.

- Ask students to get into their triads to share their gist notes. Invite students to add any information they have missed and to revise any information they may have recorded inaccurately.

- Select volunteers to share their gist notes with the whole group. Record student ideas on the displayed organizer to ensure that students have a complete list of gist notes to refer to in the next section of Work Time.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.

- When reviewing the graphic organizers or recording forms, consider using a document camera to display the document for students who struggle with auditory processing.

- Providing models of expected work supports all students, especially challenged learners.
### B. Analyzing the Speech for Speaker’s Purpose and Evaluating Motives (10 minutes)

- Focus students on the next part of the Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer. Remind them that they filled out something very similar when analyzing Michael Pollan’s text for author’s purpose. Point out that there isn’t a section for conflicting viewpoints or evidence on this organizer. Tell them to ignore the final two boxes about the motives of the media clip for now, as they will address this later.

- Remind students of the Teammates Consult protocol in which they discuss answers and come to an agreement before they all pick up their pens to write at the same time. Ask students to use their gist notes to discuss in their triads:
  * “What is the speaker’s purpose? Is it to entertain? Is it to inform? Is it to persuade? Is it more than one of those things?”
  * “How do you know? Is the speaker giving us just facts? Or is he making a claim and supporting it with evidence? Or is he doing both?”

- Model filling out the first two boxes on the organizer using student responses. Invite students to fill out their organizers at the same time.

- Ask students to use their gist notes to discuss in triads:
  * “How do you know what the speaker’s purpose is? What details from the speech can you use to support your claim?”

- Model filling out only one detail in the “How do you know?” box.

- Invite students to work in triads, following the Teammates Consult protocol to finish filling out the “How do you know?” box on their graphic organizer using the model as a starting point.

- Focus students’ attention on the final box of the organizer, “What are the motives of this media clip?” Ask students to discuss in triads:
  * “Think about the bigger picture and the person who made clip—for example, the director of the movie—rather than just what the speaker is saying. Why do you think was this clip made? What was the director trying to do? What were his/her motives in making it?”
  * “Was it to advertise their company to make you want to buy their products? To make you not want to buy their products? To encourage you to eat a certain way or choose particular foods?”

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.

- Providing models of expected work supports all students, especially challenged learners.
## Work Time (continued)

- Model filling out the first boxes on the organizer using student responses. Invite students to fill out their organizers at the same time.
- Focus students on the final box, “Why do you think that?” Ask them to discuss in triads:
  * “So why do you think that was the motive? What evidence do you have from the clip? Is it just what the speaker said? Is it a camera angle that makes you feel a certain way? Is it music or images that are playing at the same time?”
- It may be useful to replay the clip at this point if students are struggling to determine the motives of the media. The motives will depend on the media excerpt you choose. Examples to guide students include:
  - Positive music, which makes the viewer feel more positive about what is being said, or negative music that has the opposite effect.
  - Positive or negative images played at the same time.
  - Camera angles of someone—for example, zooming in on someone’s face when he or she has a certain facial expression.
- Model filling out only one detail in the “Why do you think that?” box.

## Closing and Assessment

### A. Sharing Speaker’s Purpose Graphic Organizers (5 minutes)

- Pair students up to share their completed Speaker’s Purpose graphic organizer. Invite them to add details they are missing or revise details where necessary.
- Distribute a new **Food Chain graphic organizer**.

## Homework

- Read Chapter 12 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Begin filling out the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s local sustainable food chain.
Industrial Organic Food Chain graphic organizer:
Answers for Teacher Reference

**1. Inputs:** What resources are used to grow the food (crops and animals)?
- No Genetically modified seeds (Ch. 10)
- Natural fertilizers like compost, manure, and fish meal (Ch. 10)
- Fossil fuels for pesticides, tractors, harvesting, drying and transporting (Ch. 10)

**2. Growing (crops and animals):**
Describe where the food grows. What does it look like? What happens to make the food grow?
- Big monoculture farms (grow only one kind of fruit/vegetable) (Ch. 11)
- No petrochemical fertilizers; compost, manures, or fish meal, and/or flowers instead (Ch. 10)
- No chemical weed killers; plows and propane torches instead (Ch. 10)
- Harvested with large machines (Ch. 10)
- Chickens – NO antibiotics (Ch. 11)
- Chickens have a little more room to move around, free-range=access to grass, not
- No Genetically modified seeds (Ch. 10)
- Natural fertilizers like compost, manure, and fish meal (Ch. 10)
- Fossil fuels for pesticides, tractors, harvesting, drying and transporting (Ch. 10)

**3. After the Harvest:**
Where does it go next? How is it processed?
- Food is transported via truck from farm to processing plant (Ch. 10)
- Food travels from processing plant to stores (Ch. 10)
- 4,600 calories of energy for 8 calories of lettuce (Ch. 10)
- Some organic fruits and veggies come via plane from other countries (Ch. 11)
- Processing – using synthetics to add to the food and make it into something else OR cleaning/packaging/produce (Ch. 10, 11)
- Large processing plants (Ch. 10)

**4. Consumers:**
What is the product they get? How does it impact them?
- Consumers get anything from a single organic apple to an organic TV dinner (Ch. 11)
- Consumers feel better eating organic because the food does not contain pesticides or antibiotics
- Organic food may not actually be better for you (Ch. 11)

**5. Consumers:**
What is the product they get? How does it impact them?
- Big monoculture farms (grow only one kind of fruit/vegetable) (Ch. 11)
- No petrochemical fertilizers; compost, manures, or fish meal, and/or flowers instead (Ch. 10)
- No chemical weed killers; plows and propane torches instead (Ch. 10)
- Harvested with large machines (Ch. 10)
- Chickens – NO antibiotics (Ch. 11)
- Chickens have a little more room to move around, free-range=access to grass, not

**6. Unintended Outputs:**
Besides the actual food, what else is produced?
- Pollution from fossil fuel used for farm machinery
- Pollution from fossil fuel used to transport food to/from processing plant (Ch. 11)
- Lifeless soil (Ch. 10, 11)
- Pollution from fossil fuel used for farm machinery
- Pollution from fossil fuel used to transport food to/from processing plant (Ch. 11)
- Lifeless soil (Ch. 10, 11)

**Additional Information**
- Big companies like Cascadian Farms started small, but get bigger so they can stay alive.
- Cascadian is now owned by General Mills
- Labeling and USDA standards made it so that organic companies could use synthetics to make food; this kept organic farms in business (Ch. 10)
# Speaker’s Purpose Graphic Organizer

Media clip

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Use the space below to take notes for gist.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part 1: Speaker’s Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food chain:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source of speech:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**What is the speaker’s purpose or motive for saying what he or she does?**
How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the speech.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What are the motives of this media clip? Why was it made? (To encourage you to buy a product? To encourage you not to buy a product? To inform you about a certain type of food?)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Why do you think that? (Is it just what the speaker said? Is it a camera angle that makes you feel a certain way? Is it music or images that are playing at the same time?)

Provide two pieces of evidence from the clip to support your claim.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Mid-Unit Assessment: Analyzing Author’s Purpose in Speech and Text
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can determine an author’s point of view or purpose in informational text. (RI.8.6)
I can analyze how the author acknowledges and responds to conflicting evidence or viewpoints. (RI.8.6)
I can analyze the purpose of information presented in different media and formats. (SL.8.2)
I can evaluate the motives behind a presentation. (SL.8.2)
I can use a variety of strategies to determine the meaning of unknown words or phrases. (L.8.4)
   a. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek or Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., precede, recede, secede).
   b. I can consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning or its part of speech.
   c. I can verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).

## Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can describe the purpose and motives of the speech by Birke Baehr and Michael Pollan on pages 73–75 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
<td>Mid-Unit 1 Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints in pages 73–75 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and explain how Michael Pollan responds to them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Opening</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>• In Part 1 of today’s assessment, students listen to a speech by 11-year-old Birke Baehr and take notes. A video of the speech can be found here: <a href="http://www.ted.com/talks/birke_baehr_what_s_wrong_with_our_food_system.html#267000">http://www.ted.com/talks/birke_baehr_what_s_wrong_with_our_food_system.html#267000</a>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work Time</td>
<td>• Since Birke Baehr is a child, students likely will find his speech relevant and compelling. After listening to the speech, students complete the Author’s Purpose graphic organizer they practiced in previous lessons in this unit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Mid-Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1: Listening to and Analyzing Speech by Birke Baehr (20 minutes)</td>
<td>• In Part 2 of the assessment, students read a related short excerpt beginning at, “Can you eat more, please?” from pages 73–75 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and take notes. They complete the same Author’s Purpose graphic organizer for this text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Mid-Unit 1 Assessment, Part 2: Analyzing an Excerpt from <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (18 minutes)</td>
<td>• The final activity in the Closing is not part of the assessment. This activity pushes student thinking further in comparing the speech and the excerpt of text, as the two are linked in content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Closing and Assessment</td>
<td>• In advance:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Comparing and Contrasting Speech and Text (5 minutes)</td>
<td>– Prepare the necessary technology to play Birke Baehr’s speech: “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?” (a TED Talk).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Homework</td>
<td>– Create a blank Venn diagram titled “Industrial Food According to Baehr and Pollan” on chart paper or board (for a model Venn diagram, see Appendix).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Read Chapter 14 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> and continue adding to your Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain.</td>
<td>• After this lesson, assess student responses on the mid-unit 1 assessment using the NYS 2-Point Rubric—Short Response.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Lesson Vocabulary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose, motives, conflicting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

## Materials

- Mid-Unit 1 Assessment: Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose Parts 1 and 2 (one per student)
- Birke Baehr’s speech: “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?” (see teaching notes)
- *The Omnivore's Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Mid-Unit 1 Assessment: Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose (answers, for teacher reference)
- NYS 2-Point Rubric—Short-Response (for teacher reference)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 6)

## Opening

### A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

- Remind students that they have been studying speakers’ and authors’ points of view, and how speakers and authors respond to conflicting viewpoints. They will be using these skills to complete today's assessment on author’s purpose.
- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  - “I can describe the purpose and motives of the speech by Birke Baehr and Michael Pollan on pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma*.”
  - “I can identify the conflicting evidence and viewpoints in pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore's Dilemma* and explain how Michael Pollan responds to them.”
- Invite students to turn and talk to a partner about how they have been practicing these learning targets during the first half of this unit.
- Ask students to show a thumbs-up if they feel confident about the targets, a thumb-sideways if they feel somewhat confident, or a thumbs-down if they do not feel confident. Clarify as needed.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
### Work Time

**A. Mid-Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1: Listening to and Analyzing Speech by Birke Baehr (20 minutes)**

- Arrange student seating in an assessment-conducive formation to allow for independent listening, thinking, and writing. Remind students that they have already completed Author’s Purpose graphic organizers for a text passage in an earlier lesson and for a speech in yesterday’s lesson.

- Inform students that they will be using the same graphic organizer for this assessment. Encourage students by telling them their hard work and practice with the author’s purpose will serve them on this assessment.

- Explain that they will first watch, listen to, and take notes on a speech titled “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?”, by an 11-year-old boy named Birke Baehr. Then they will read an excerpt from pages 73–75 of *Omnivore’s Dilemma*. For both the speech and the text, they will complete an Author’s Purpose organizer.

- Distribute **Mid-Unit 1 Assessment: Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose Parts 1 and 2**. Read the instructions for the assessment aloud as students follow along silently. Address any clarifying questions.

- Remind students that as this is an assessment, they are not to discuss their answers with other students—they are to work independently.

- Invite students to begin listening as you play the Birke Baehr’s speech: “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?”, reminding them to take notes about the gist in the box on the first page of the assessment. Once the speech has ended, ask students to wrap up their notes about the gist.

- When students are ready, replay the video clip and instruct them to begin analyzing the author’s purpose of the speech using the organizer on the second page of the assessment.

**Meeting Students’ Needs**

- If students receive accommodations for assessments, communicate with the cooperating service providers regarding the practices of instruction during this study as well as the goals of the assessment.

- For some students, this assessment may require more than the time allotted. Consider providing time over multiple days if necessary.

---

**B. Mid-Unit 1 Assessment, Part 2: Analyzing an Excerpt from The Omnivore’s Dilemma (18 minutes)**

- Focus students on Part 2 of the assessment. Ask them to read pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* beginning at: “Can you eat more please?” Remind them that they do not need to take notes for the gist and that they can refer to the excerpt of the text as much as necessary.

- When they have finished reading the text, ask students to fill out the Author’s Purpose section. Remind them again to look back at the text as needed.

- Make sure students are aware that there is an additional conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence section in Part 2.

- Collect both parts of students’ mid-unit 1 assessment and assess using the Mid-Unit 1 Assessment: Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose (answers, for teacher reference) and NYS 2-Point Rubric—Short-Response.
Closing and Assessment

A. Venn Diagram: Comparing and Contrasting Speech and Text (5 minutes)

- Draw two circles on the board overlapping (Venn Diagram). Write Baehr over one of the circles and Pollan over the other. Remind students that information inside the Baehr circle is unique to the speech. Information inside the Pollan circle is unique to text. Information in the middle section consists of similarities between both Baehr’s speech and the excerpt from Pollan’s book.

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “What information about industrial food was unique to Birke Baehr’s speech?”

- Select volunteers to share their responses. Add students’ comments to the left-hand side of the Venn diagram. Responses could include:
  - Corporations convince kids to eat things that aren’t good for them/the environment.
  - Genetically modified seeds/organisms are “not intended by nature.”
  - GMO food causes health problems.
  - Most of the food we eat has been genetically modified.
  - Most industrial farms use chemical fertilizers in soil, pesticides, and herbicides, which poison our water.
  - Food is irradiated to make it last longer.
  - We have a choice: Pay the farmer or pay the hospital.
  - Kids will eat more fresh food if they are more educated.
  - Think local, choose organic; know your farm, know your food.

- Next, ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “What information about food was unique to the excerpt from the text?”

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.
- When reviewing the graphic organizers or recording forms, consider using a document camera to display the document for students who struggle with auditory processing.
- Providing models of expected work supports all students, especially challenged learners.
Closing and Assessment (continued)

• Select volunteers to share their responses. Add students’ comments to the right-hand side of the Venn diagram. Responses could include:
  – The government helps pay for food corporations’ raw materials.
  – Processing food makes people pay more for it.
  – Companies try to convince us their product is better.
  – Companies add nutrients to foods after taking them away.
  – Resistant starch fills up food without filling up the person.

• Finally, ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * What information about food was in both the speech and the text?*

• Select volunteers to share their responses. Add students’ comments to the center of the Venn diagram. Responses could include:
  – Food corporations profit at the expense of people’s health.
  – Food corporations “add value” to food by making it attractive to consumers.
  – Food corporations are persuasive.

• After completing the Venn diagram, tell students they’ve done some great noticing about the speech and the text. Give specific, positive feedback on comments that seemed particularly insightful. Tell students they will continue to study and use both speech and text to inform and persuade throughout the module.

Homework

• Read Chapter 14 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and continue adding to your **Food Chain graphic organizer** for the local sustainable food chain.
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 1 (SL.8.2)

Name: 
Date: 

Directions for Part 1:
• Listen to Birke Baehr's speech, “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?”, while taking notes in the space provided below. Take notes for the gist so you can remember Baehr’s main points.
• After listening to the speech and finishing your notes, use information from the speech to complete the Speaker’s Purpose section.

Use the space below to take notes for the gist. Record the main claims of the speaker. This will help you when determining his point of view.

Speaker’s Purpose
What is the speaker’s purpose or motive for saying what he or she does?
How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the speech.

1. 
2. 
3. 

What are the motives of this speech? Why was it made? (To encourage you to buy a product? To encourage you not to buy a product? To inform you about a certain type of food?)

Why do you think that? (Is it just what the speaker said? Is it a camera angle that makes you feel a certain way? Is it images or music that are playing at the same time?)

Provide two pieces of evidence from the clip to support your claim.

1. 
2. 
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 2
(L.8.4, L.8.4b, L.8.4c, L.8.4d, RI.8.6, SL.8.2)

Name: ____________________________

Date: ____________________________

Directions for Part 2:
• Read the excerpt “Can You Eat More, Please?” (pages 73–75) from Michael Pollan’s The Omnivore’s Dilemma.
• Answer the questions in the Finding Word Meaning section.
• Use information from the text to complete the Author’s Purpose section. Refer to the text as often as you need to.
• Once you’ve determined author’s purpose, complete the Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence section.

Finding Word Meaning
1. Look at the words inject and infused in the second paragraph on page 74. What common affix do they have?

2. What does this affix mean?

3. What do you think “infused” means?

4. Look in a dictionary to check your answer. What definition does the dictionary give?

5. Were you right?   Yes   No
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 2
(L.8.4, L.8.4b, L.8.4c, L.8.4d, RI.8.6, SL.8.2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author’s Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the author’s purpose for this speech?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.  

2.  

3.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>If the purpose of the text is to convince you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument ...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| What claim is the author making? |
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 2

| What evidence does the author use to support the claim? |
|---|---|---|
| 1. | 2. | 3. |

| What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why? |

| How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints? |
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 1 (SL.8.2) Answers For Teacher Reference

Directions for Part 1:
- Listen to Birke Baehr’s speech, “What’s Wrong with Our Food System?”, while taking notes in the space provided below. Take notes for the gist so you can remember Baehr’s main points.
- After listening to the speech and finishing your notes, use information from the speech to complete the Speaker’s Purpose section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use the space below to take notes for the gist. Record the main claims of the speaker. This will help you when determining his point of view.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Problems with industrial food:**  
  - Corporations convince kids to eat things that aren’t good for them/the environment.  
  - Genetically modified seeds/organisms are “not intended by nature.”  
  - GMO food causes health problems.  
  - Most of the food we eat has been genetically modified.  
  - Most industrial farms use chemical fertilizers in soil, pesticides, and herbicides, which poison our water.  
  - Food is irradiated to make it last longer. |
| **Solutions:**  
  - We have a choice: Pay the farmer or pay the hospital.  
  - Kids will eat more fresh food if they are more educated.  
  - Think local, choose organic; know your farm, know your food. |
**Speaker’s Purpose**

What is the speaker’s purpose or motive for saying what he or she does?

*Birke Baehr’s purpose is to inform and persuade.*

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the speech.

*I know this because Baehr brings up numerous problems with the industrial food system and then concludes with his “solution” to eat local and organic foods instead of processed food.*

1. **To inform:** Baehr states that industrial food companies persuade kids to eat their food using advertising and gimmicks.

2. **To inform:** Baehr states that most of the food we eat is genetically modified or full of pesticides, and is harmful to our health.

3. **To persuade:** Baehr states that we can make an impact by choosing to eat local and organic foods instead of industrial foods.

What are the motives of this speech? Why was it made? (To encourage you to buy a product? To encourage you not to buy a product? To inform you about a certain type of food?)

*I think it was made to encourage people to think about the choices they make with the food they buy and eat.*

Why do you think that? (Is it just what the speaker said? Is it a camera angle that makes you feel a certain way? Is it images or music that are playing at the same time?)

Provide two pieces of evidence from the clip to support your claim.

1. *The supporting visual components emphasize the content of his speech and make us want to think more carefully about the food choices we make. They show data and statistics about our health to encourage us to choose more carefully.*

2. *What he says – the content of his speech encourages us to think about the choices we make. “It seems to me that we can pay the farmer or we can pay the hospital.”*
Mid-Unit 1 Assessment:
Analyzing Author’s and Speaker’s Purpose, Part 1 (SL.8.2) Answers For Teacher Reference

Directions for Part 2:
• Read the excerpt “Can You Eat More, Please?” (pages 73–75) from Michael Pollan’s *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.

• Answer the questions in the Finding Word Meaning section.

• Use information from the text to complete the Author’s Purpose section. Refer to the text as often as you need to.

• Once you’ve determined author’s purpose, complete the Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence section.

Finding Word Meaning
1. Look at the words inject and infused in the second paragraph on page 74. What common affix do they have?

   *In*

   2. What does this affix mean?

   *To put inside or be inside*

   3. So what do you think “infused” means?

   *[Student answers will vary.]*

   4. Look in a dictionary to check your answer. What definition does the dictionary give?

   *[Dependent on dictionary.]*

   5. Were you right? √ Yes ☐ No

   *[Student answers will vary on whether they were right or not.]*
**Author’s Purpose**

What is the author’s purpose for this excerpt of text?

*Michael Pollan’s purpose in this excerpt is to inform and persuade.*

How do you know? Support your answer with at least three details from the text.

*I know this because Pollan outlines the ways the companies “add value” to products that are unhealthy and use advertising to make a lot of money off these products.*

1. **To inform:** Pollan states that “The U.S. government helps pay for raw materials” for food corporations, and that these corporations make more money than farmers.

2. **To persuade:** Pollan says consumers “can be convinced to pay a lot more” for corn products if they have been “turned into a funny shape, sweetened, and brightly colored.”

3. **To persuade:** Pollan points out why companies spend so much on advertising—to “convince” people that they “really have added value to corn and soybeans.”

**Conflicting Viewpoints and Evidence**

If the purpose of the text is to convince you to believe or to do something by presenting an argument ...

What claim is the author making?

*Industrial food companies make a lot of money by using different tactics to get people to buy their unhealthy food.*
What evidence does the author use to support the claim?

| 1. “Processing food allows companies to charge more for it.” | 2. People “can be convinced to pay a lot more for the same corn if it has been turned into a funny shape, sweetened, and brightly colored. The industry calls this ‘adding value.’” | 3. “That’s why food companies spend so much on advertising—to convince us they really have added value to the corn and soybeans.” |

What conflicting viewpoints has the author put forward? Why?

He presents a possible problem the food industry faces: the size of our stomachs.

He says that normal apples are not good enough, and that we need apples that “fight cancer,” “orange juice with calcium,” and “cereal that keeps us from having a heart attack.”

How has the author responded to the conflicting viewpoints?

He describes the ways food companies get around the problem of the size of our stomachs by using advertising and “adding value” to their food.

He suggests that people buy the vitamin-enriched foods because they are tricked into thinking they are really healthier.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Response Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **2 Point** | The features of a 2-point response are  
- Valid inferences and/or claims from the text where required by the prompt  
- Evidence of analysis of the text where required by the prompt  
- Relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text to develop response according to the requirements of the prompt  
- Sufficient number of facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text as required by the prompt  
- Complete sentences where errors do not impact readability |
| **1 Point** | The features of a 1-point response are  
- A mostly literal recounting of events or details from the text as required by the prompt  
- Some relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text to develop response according to the requirements of the prompt  
- Incomplete sentences or bullets |
| **0 Point** | The features of a 0-point response are  
- A response that does not address any of the requirements of the prompt or is totally inaccurate  
- No response (blank answer)  
- A response that is not written in English  
- A response that is unintelligible or indecipherable |

If the prompt requires two texts and the student only references one text, the response can be scored no higher than a 1.
### Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

| I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2) |
| I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4) |

### Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can find the gist of pages 161–166 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</em></td>
<td>Food Chain graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can read closely to answer questions about pages 161–166 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</em></td>
<td>Gist annotated on sticky notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New vocabulary on word-catcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Answers to text-dependent questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Agenda

### Opening
- A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 14 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (6 minutes)
- B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)

### Work Time
- A. Reading for the Gist: Pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (20 minutes)
- B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 161–166 (14 minutes)

### Closing and Assessment
- A. Determining the Author’s Claim (3 minutes)

### Homework
- A. Reread pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and identify the claim Michael Pollan makes and the evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence.
- B. Read Chapter 16 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and continue to fill out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.

## Teaching Notes
- This is the first in the two-lesson cycle in which students build background knowledge about Michael Pollan’s local sustainable food chain.
- In this lesson, to gradually release students to work independently in preparation for the end of unit assessment, they work in pairs without any teacher modeling to find the gist and to answer text-dependent questions.
- In advance: Read pages 161–166 (up to “Letting Chickens be Chickens”), considering the gist of each paragraph and the answers to the text-dependent questions students are asked (see supporting materials for answer key).
- Post: Learning targets.
### Lesson Vocabulary

gist; interns, restoring, broiled, innovations, hitch, bison, egrets, larvae, sanitation, organism.

### Materials

- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (for the local sustainable food chain first distributed in Lesson 6)
- Local Sustainable Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)
- Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout (one for display; from Lesson 2)
- Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)
- Word-catcher (from Lesson 2; students may need a new copy if they filled in the one they have)
- Dictionaries (enough for students to reference them quickly while reading)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 14 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (6 minutes)
- Be sure students have their text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind students they were to read Chapter 14 and continue adding to their Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain for homework.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. See the Local Sustainable Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference) to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on what they hear from other students.

B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)
- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  - “I can find the gist of pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
  - “I can read closely to answer questions about pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
- Remind students they have already seen these learning targets in the previous lessons and of what the *gist* means.

Meeting Students’ Needs
- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes them accountable for completing homework. It also lets you monitor which students have not been completing their homework.
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
# Work Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Reading for the Gist and Unfamiliar Vocabulary: Pages 161–166 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (20 minutes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Focus students on the description of the local sustainable food chain on page 5 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Invite students to read that food chain again to refresh their memories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students they are going to read pages 161–166 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> for the gist. Remind students that they should have already done a first read of these pages when they read Chapter 14 for homework.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students of the Topic, Information, and Ideas on the “Questioning Texts” row of the <strong>Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout</strong>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students that they are going to reread from the beginning of Chapter 14 on page 161 up to “Letting Chickens be Chickens” on page 166 for the gist.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students to write their annotations of the gist of each paragraph on <strong>sticky notes</strong> to stick in the margin of the book. Remind students to use their <strong>word-catchers</strong> to record any new vocabulary, and that if they aren’t sure what the word means after looking for context clues and looking in the <strong>dictionary</strong>, they should leave the definition column blank to be discussed with the whole group later on.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Pair students and invite them to find the gist and record unfamiliar words on their word-catchers for pages 161–166.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it in the margin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to pair up with a different student to compare what they wrote for their gist statements and to help each other with any unfamiliar vocabulary they haven’t been able to figure out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Refocus whole group and invite them to share any unfamiliar vocabulary words they found on pages 161–166, along with the definition. Encourage students to help each other find the definition. If no one knows what the word means, tell students what it means.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Be sure to address words students may struggle with here: <strong>interns, restoring, broiled, innovations, hitch, bison, egrets, larvae, sanitation, organism</strong>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students to record new words on their word-catcher discussed with the whole group later on.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.</strong> Consider allowing students to grapple with a complex text prior to explicit teaching of vocabulary. After students have read for the gist, they can identify challenging vocabulary for themselves. Teachers can address student-selected vocabulary as well as predetermined vocabulary upon subsequent encounters with the text. However, in some cases and with some students, pre-teaching selected vocabulary may be necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Work Time (continued)

B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 161–166 (14 minutes)

• Invite students to get into the triads they have been working with in the previous lessons of this unit. Tell them now that they have the gist of pages 161–166, they will dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.

• Distribute Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 161–166 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.

• Tell students they are going to work through the questions on this handout. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol in which they discuss the answer and come to an agreement in their triad before they all write the answer together.

• Circulate to assist students. Ask questions to encourage them to refer to the text:
  * “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out that answer in the text?”

Meeting Students’ Needs

• Text-dependent questions can be answered only by referring explicitly to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.

• Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say, “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”

• Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Closing and Assessment

A. **Determining the Author’s Claim (3 minutes)**

- Ask students to discuss in their triads:
  
  * “What claim is Michael Pollan making on pages 161–166?”

- Remind students that they may not find this in a single sentence—it may be something that is implied throughout the text. Students who determine the claim can record it on a sticky note. As this is the homework, students who don’t get that far can continue for homework.

### Homework

- Reread pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and identify the claim Michael Pollan makes and the evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence.

- Read Chapter 16 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and continue to fill out your Food Chain graphic organizer for the local sustainable food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.
Local Sustainable Food Chain graphic organizer:
Answers for Teacher Reference

1. Inputs: What resources are used to grow the food (crops and animals)?
   - Meadow grasses (Ch. 12)
   - Sun energy (Ch. 12)
   - Fertilizer: Manure from cows/other animals (Ch. 12)
   - Fossil fuels (Ch. 12)

2. Growing (crops and animals): Describe where the food grows. What does it look like? What happens to make the food grow? How is the food harvested?
   - Chicken (for meat and eggs), beef, turkeys, rabbits, and pigs rotate throughout the farm, feeding on grass and fertilizing the land (Ch. 12)
   - Grass regrows on its own (Ch. 12)
   - Grass is cut into hay for animal feed in winter (Ch. 12)
   - Berries, tomatoes, corn, grapes grow with natural fertilizers from animals (Ch. 12)
   - Meadow grasses (Ch. 12)
   - Sun energy (Ch. 12)
   - Fertilizer: Manure from cows/other animals (Ch. 12)

3. After the Harvest: Where does it go next? How is it processed?
   - Chickens slaughtered on site by Salatin and his workers (Ch. 14)
   - Chicken guts become fertilizer (Ch. 14)
   - Produce are harvested from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer (Ch. 16)

4. Transportation: How is it moved from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer?
   - More profits for the farmers instead of corporations

5. Consumers: What is the product they get? How does it impact them?
   - Food is transported from farms to local markets, families, restaurants and other buyers (Ch. 16)
   - Consumers get anything from fresh fruits and vegetables to eggs and meat
   - What consumers get depends on the season; they can't have what they want all the time (Ch. 16)
   - The consumer needs to know how to cook (Ch. 16)
   - The consumer knows exactly what he/she is buying (Ch. 16)

6. Unintended Outputs: Besides the actual food, what else is produced?
   - Consumers get anything from fresh fruits and vegetables to eggs and meat
   - What consumers get depends on the season; they can't have what they want all the time (Ch. 16)
   - The consumer needs to know how to cook (Ch. 16)
   - The consumer knows exactly what he/she is buying (Ch. 16)

Additional Information
- Polyface Farm is a good example of using a natural cycle of grass and sun energy to create food.
- Sustainable means almost everything is recycled, especially as fertilizer (Ch. 12)
- More profits for the farmers instead of corporations

Created by Expeditionary Learning, on behalf of Public Consulting Group, Inc. © Public Consulting Group, Inc., with a perpetual license granted to Expeditionary Learning Outward Bound, Inc.
I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Why are the pens floorless?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Why are the pens moved 10 feet each day?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why does Joel wait three or four days before moving the chickens to where his cattle have been?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Why does Joel think the “Eggmobile” would be worth it, even if the chickens never laid a single egg?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Why does Joel not buy more chickens when the eggs bring in more money than anything else he sells?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Why are the pens floorless?</td>
<td>“… to allow the birds to get at the grass.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Why are the pens moved 10 feet each day?</td>
<td>To give the chickens “twenty-four hours to eat the grass and fertilize it with their droppings, and then move them onto fresh ground.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“The chicken manure fertilizes the grass, supplying all the nitrogen it needs. But left in one place, the chickens would eventually destroy the soil.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why does Joel wait three or four days before moving the chickens to where his cattle have been?</td>
<td>The chickens don’t seem to like fresh manure and it “gives the larvae a chance to fatten up nicely, the way the hens like them, but not quite long enough to hatch into flies.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Why does Joel think the “Eggmobile” would be worth it, even if the chickens never laid a single egg?</td>
<td>“Because of the chickens, Joel doesn’t have to treat his cattle with toxic chemicals to get rid of parasites.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 5. Why does Joel not buy more chickens when the eggs bring in more money than anything else he sells? | “Because it would throw the system off balance.”  
Too much chicken manure would kill the grass, and Joel would have to buy more cows for the chickens to get their protein from the larvae in cow pats, and then he wouldn’t have enough grass to feed the cows. |
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 9
Evaluating an Argument: The Polyface Local Sustainable
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)
I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)

## Supporting Learning Targets

- I can evaluate two arguments for the same claim to identify which is the strongest.
- I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.
- I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text.

## Ongoing Assessment

- Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166
### Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening</th>
<th>Work Time</th>
<th>Closing and Assessment</th>
<th>Homework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Comparing Two Arguments (10 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Identifying Irrelevant Evidence (8 minutes)</td>
<td>A. Read Chapter 20 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>. Begin filling in the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s hunter-gatherer food chain.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Teaching Notes

- In this lesson, students are introduced to the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer, which will be used in the end of unit assessment. Fill in the graphic organizer to evaluate the argument Michael Pollan puts forth on pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* together with the class to serve as a model for students. In subsequent lessons, students will gradually become more independent at filling in this organizer in preparation for the end of unit assessment.

- Note that students also read another short excerpt of text at the end of the lesson to identify irrelevant evidence in an argument. A new excerpt of text is required to teach this, as there is very little irrelevant evidence in Michael Pollan’s writing. To save time asking students to identify a new claim in a new excerpt of a new text, a short paragraph of the same excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* students have been reading and analyzing since the previous lesson has been rewritten to include irrelevant evidence. This is explained to students to avoid confusion, and it is also a good teaching point as students can compare the actual paragraph of writing to the rewritten paragraph to see how Michael Pollan’s original paragraph is stronger.

- Students may struggle to determine how much is sufficient evidence. Emphasize that sufficient evidence is not just about how much evidence, but the quality of the evidence. For example, one piece of evidence containing data from a research study will be stronger than two pieces of evidence that are opinion-based.

- In advance: Read pages 161–166 and read the answer key for the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer to familiarize yourself with what students will be doing and the answers you will be guiding them toward (see supporting materials).

- Post: Learning targets.
### Lesson Vocabulary

- evaluate, argument, claim, relevant, irrelevant, sound, sufficient

### Materials

- Example of Strong and Flawed Arguments (one per student and one for display)
- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166 (one per student; one for display)
- Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166 (answers, for teacher reference)
- Example of Irrelevant Evidence: Page 162 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Rewritten (one per student; one for display)
- Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 2; one new blank copy per student)
### Opening

**A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)**
- Direct students’ attention to the posted learning targets and invite them to read them with you:
  - “I can evaluate two arguments for the same claim to identify which is the strongest.”
  - “I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.”
  - “I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text.”
- Circle the word *evaluate*. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - “What does ‘evaluate a claim’ mean?”
- Cold call students for their responses. Listen for them to explain that to evaluate an argument and a claim means analyzing them to decide whether the author’s or speaker’s claim seems strong.
- Invite students to turn and talk with a partner about synonyms or other words that could be used in place of the word *evaluate* in the target. Cold call students to share their ideas. Listen for them to say: “judge,” “decide,” “rate,” “assess,” “grade,” etc. Write correct synonyms above the word *evaluate* on the posted target.
- Explain that evaluating something requires a set of criteria. For example, when students are evaluated on a piece of writing, there is a rubric with criteria describing a good essay. Explain that today they will determine the criteria for what makes a strong argument so they can evaluate arguments.
- In the learning targets, put a box around the words *sound reasoning*, *sufficient*, *relevant evidence*, and *irrelevant evidence*. Tell students they’ll spend time defining these terms and then use them to determine whether Michael Pollan makes a strong argument in the section of the text they worked with in Lesson 8.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
A. Comparing Two Arguments (10 minutes)

Tell students today’s lesson focuses on evaluating arguments, or determining whether an author or speaker makes a strong argument. Explain that this is an important reading and thinking skill because in evaluating the argument, they have to think critically about the text. Also, practicing this skill helps them as writers and speakers when they speak and write their own arguments later in the unit and module.

Display and distribute Example of Strong and Flawed Arguments. Invite students to read along silently in their heads as you read both Arguments A and B aloud.

Invite students to discuss in triads:
* “What is the claim the author is making?”

Call on a volunteer. Listen for the claim that “our food should come from nature, not industry.”

Invite students to discuss in triads:
* “Is the evidence in this argument relevant? Does it support the claim?”
* “Is the evidence sufficient? Is there enough of it?”

Cold call students to share their responses. Listen for students to explain that the evidence isn’t sufficient because there aren’t any research-based facts or data and some of the evidence given for this argument is not relevant; for example, people buying chips and soda has nothing to do with food coming from nature or industry.

Invite students to discuss in triads:
* “What about the reasoning? Is it sound reasoning? Think about this passage, ‘Turkey could be from nature or industry, and macaroni and cheese tastes so good, so we better eat food from nature.'”

Select volunteers to share out. Listen for students to explain that the reasoning is not sound because there is no link between the opinion “macaroni and cheese tastes so good” and the claim.

Ask students to discuss in triads:
* “Is it a strong argument? Why/why not?”

Listen for them to say something along the lines of: “No, because it doesn’t make sense,” “it has unrelated supporting details or evidence,” or “it isn’t logical.”

Tell students that now they are going to analyze Argument B. Make it clear that the claim is the same as that in Argument A: “our food should come from nature, not industry.”
### Work Time (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• Ask students to discuss in triads:</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• “How is this argument stronger than the first argument? Think about the use of evidence and reasoning.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cold call students to share responses. Listen for them to explain there is sufficient relevant evidence, and the reasoning is sound. Ask students to provide evidence from the text to support their responses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### B. Identifying the Claim and Relevant Evidence (10 minutes)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• Invite students to reread the learning target:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• “I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 161–166 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| • Be sure students have their text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Distribute the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166. | |
| • Invite students to spend a minute reading the graphic organizer. | |
| • Ask them: | |
| • “What do you notice?” | |
| • “What do you wonder?” | |

| • Tell students that the first step in evaluating an argument is simply identifying the author’s claim and supporting evidence. Make sure students understand that sometimes we must infer what the claim is because the author or speaker doesn’t state it explicitly. | |
| • Ask students to Think-Pair-Share: | |
| • “What is relevant evidence?” | |

| • Select volunteers to share answers whole class. Listen for students to explain that relevant evidence is clearly connected to the claim being made. | |
| • Remind students that for homework, they reread pages 161–166 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, identified a claim that Michael Pollan makes, and flagged supporting evidence. Select volunteers to share their claim and the evidence they flagged. Listen for claims and evidence to be similar to the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166 (answers, for teacher reference) and guide students in that direction. | |
**Work Time (continued)**

- Invite students to record the claim and what they determine to be relevant evidence on their Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer. Make it clear that 1) students may not have as many pieces of evidence as there are boxes, which is fine; and 2) at this stage, students should not yet evaluate the evidence or the argument. They are just to fill in the Claim and Relevant Evidence boxes.

- Circulate and support students as they work. See the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 161–166 (answers, for teacher reference) for a suggestion on how to fill in the organizer. Ask students as you circulate:
  * “Why is that relevant evidence?”

- After 5 minutes of work time, display the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer. Cold call students to share their thinking on the author’s claim and relevant evidence. Use student responses and the answers for teacher reference to model filling in the boxes for claim and relevant evidence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Graphic organizers and recording forms engage students more actively and provide the necessary scaffolding that is especially critical for learners with lower levels of language proficiency and/or learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When reviewing the graphic organizers or recording forms, consider using a document camera to display the document for students who struggle with auditory processing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Providing models of expected work supports all learners, especially challenged learners.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**C. Evaluating an Argument: Sufficient Evidence and Sound Reasoning (15 minutes)**

- Tell students that after identifying the claim and evidence, the next step is to evaluate how well the evidence proves the claim. Let them know it is helpful to ask two questions when determining how well a piece of evidence supports a claim:
  * “Does it connect to the claim?”
  * “Does it offer specific, concrete facts, statistics, or examples?”

- Using the answer key, model thinking through and filling in one of the next row of boxes, “Explain how well this piece of evidence supports the author’s claim.” Invite students to work in pairs to finish filling in this row on their own organizers.

- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  * “What is sufficient evidence?”

- Cold call volunteers to share their responses whole group. Listen for them to explain there is enough evidence to support the claim.

- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  * “So how much evidence is enough?”

- Select students to share their responses. Listen for and guide students to understand there should be more than one piece of evidence, but exactly how much depends on the evidence provided. Students must look across the evidence provided to determine the quality of the evidence and then if there is enough of it.
Work Time (continued)

- Using the answers for teacher reference, model thinking through and filling in the next box, “Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.” Invite students to work in triads to look across the evidence on their graphic organizer and complete the box using the model as a guide. Remind them of the Teammates Consult protocol.
- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  - “What is sound reasoning?”
- Cold call students to share their responses whole group. Listen for them to explain that sound reasoning means the author has clearly explained the connection between the claim, the evidence supporting it, and the choice of evidence makes sense.
- Direct students to look at the “Explain how this piece of evidence supports the author’s claim” row, as this will help them determine how the evidence supports the claim and if there is a clear connection between the evidence and the claim.
- Using the answers for teacher reference, model thinking through and filling in the next box, “Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.” Invite students to work in triads to look across the evidence on their graphic organizer and to complete the final box, using the model as a guide.
- Cold call two or three students to share, correcting misconceptions if they arise.

Closing and Assessment

A. Identifying Irrelevant Evidence (8 minutes)

- Invite students to look at the second part of their graphic organizers, “Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence.” Ask students to discuss in triads:
  - “What is irrelevant evidence?”
- Listen for students to explain that irrelevant evidence is that which doesn’t support the claim or make sense in support of the claim. It may also be evidence that has been deliberately added to mislead the reader or listener.
- Explain to students that good writers and speakers like Michael Pollan use sufficient relevant evidence and sound reasoning to support their claims, but as they have already seen from the interview at the beginning of the lesson, sometimes people also use irrelevant evidence when they are putting forward an argument and making a claim. Explain that now they are going to analyze a short excerpt of text for irrelevant evidence.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Closing and Assessment (continued)

- Tell students this excerpt is a rewritten piece of the Michael Pollan excerpt they have been reading and analyzing in the previous two lessons. Explain that this will help because they have already identified a claim in this excerpt, which will help them see why Michael Pollan’s actual writing is a good example of a strong argument.

- Ask students to close their *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* books. Display and distribute **Example of Irrelevant Evidence: Page 162 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma Rewritten** and read it aloud as they follow along silently in their heads.

- Remind students that they have already figured out a claim that they think Michael Pollan is making in this excerpt (something similar to: “Local sustainable farming is good for the land and for the chickens and cows the farm raises”), so now they will work in triads using the Teammates Consult protocol to identify irrelevant evidence in this excerpt of text and record it on Part 2 of their organizers.

- This is a very short piece of text, so students should need no more than 5 minutes to identify the irrelevant evidence and record it on their organizers.

- Cold call students to share the irrelevant evidence whole group. Refer to the answers for teacher reference to guide them toward appropriate answers and invite them to revise their graphic organizers accordingly.

- Cold call students to share the irrelevant evidence whole group. Refer to the answers for teacher reference to guide them toward appropriate answers and invite them to revise their graphic organizers accordingly.

- Invite students to review the original paragraph on page 162 of their books. Ask students to discuss in triads:
  - “How is the rewritten excerpt different from the original? How is Michael Pollan’s better?”

- Select volunteers to share their responses whole group. Listen for students to explain that Michael Pollan gives a brief description of what broiler chickens are, but then continues to discuss the chicken pens rather than providing irrelevant evidence about the broiler chicken industry.

- Distribute new **Food Chain graphic organizers** for homework.

### Homework

- Read Chapter 20 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Begin filling in the Food Chain graphic organizer for Michael Pollan’s hunter-gatherer food chain.
Example of Strong and Flawed Arguments

Name:

Date:

Argument A (example of a flawed argument)
Our food should come from nature, not industry. The food industry makes me angry. The people who run it are bad people who just want to make money. When I went to the grocery store today, I noticed so many people buying chips and soda. We don’t want to end up obese, so we better eat food from nature.

Argument B (example of a strong argument)
Our food should come from nature, not industry, for several reasons. Getting food from nature does not damage the world. For example, my pig’s place in the forest would soon be taken by another pig and the cherry tree would bear fruit again next year. Also, there are no hidden costs to food that comes from nature. For example, you don’t have to pay for manure from feedlots to be hauled away. Food from industry costs each and every one of us: in government spending, in pollution, in global warming, and in our health. Finally, food from nature is better for our bodies. Eating meat from cows that were fed grass is much healthier for us than eating meat from cows that were fed corn.
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)

**Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Speaker’s Claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 4</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 5</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
## Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.

Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.

## Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence

What irrelevant evidence did the author/speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.
Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Speaker’s Claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local sustainable farming is good for the land and for the chickens and cows the farm raises.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p. 162 “It was hard to believe this hillside had ever been the gullied wreck Joel had described at dinner. One type of farming had destroyed the land. Now another type of farming was restoring it.”</td>
<td>p. 163 “Joel moves the chickens every day for the same reason he moves the cows every night. The chicken manure fertilizes the grass, supplying all the nitrogen it needs. But left in one place, the chickens would eventually destroy the soil.”</td>
<td>p. 164 “Every night the hens climb the little ramp into the safety of the coop and Joel latches the door behind them. In the morning he moves them to a fresh pasture.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**
- **This piece of evidence is a specific example of how sustainable farms are good for the land.**
- **This piece of evidence provides another example of how local sustainable farming is good for the land because it explains how the land would be destroyed if it were different.**
- **This explains how the chickens are well cared for because it explains how they are safe at night.**
### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 4</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 5</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| p. 165
“It seems the chickens don’t like fresh manure, so he waits three or four days before bringing them in—but not a day longer. “Three days is ideal,” he explained. “That gives the larvae a chance to fatten up nicely, the way hens like them ...”
| p. 165
“Because of the chickens, Joel doesn’t have to treat his cattle with toxic chemicals to get rid of parasites.”
| Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:
This piece of evidence explains how he gives the hens what they like, which supports the idea that local sustainable farming is good for the animals.
| Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:
This piece of evidence explains how he doesn’t need to give the cows toxic chemicals, which supports the idea that local sustainable farming is good for the animals.

---

**Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.**
Pollan did provide sufficient evidence to prove his claim. He doesn’t use any research-based facts, but he did use at least five examples of how local sustainable farming is good for the land and how it follows the natural cycle. These examples are detailed enough to prove his claim.

**Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.**
His reasoning was sound because he explained how his evidence supported his claim. For each piece of evidence, he connected it to being good for the environment or being the same as the natural cycle.
Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence

What irrelevant evidence did the author/speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.

The author provides irrelevant evidence about the broiler chicken industry and how much chicken is consumed in the U.S. It says, “The United States has the largest broiler chicken industry in the world and 17 percent of the broiler chickens produced here are exported to other countries. Americans consume more chicken than anyone else in the world and it is the number one source of protein in the United States.” This evidence might be interesting, but it is not linked at all to the claim that local sustainable farming is good for the land and for the cows and chickens raised for production.
Fifty of these pens were spread out across the damp grass. Each was 10 feet by 12 feet wide and 2 feet high, with no floor. Inside each one were 70 broiler chickens. The United States has the largest broiler chicken industry in the world and 17 percent of the broiler chickens produced here are exported to other countries. Americans consume more chicken than anyone else in the world and it is the number one source of protein in the United States. The broiler chicken pens are floorless to allow the birds to get at the grass.
**Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)**

I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can find the gist of pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</em></td>
<td>• Food Chain graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can read closely to answer questions about pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</em></td>
<td>• Gist annotated on sticky notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• New vocabulary on word-catcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Answers to text-dependent questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GRADE 8: MODULE 4: UNIT 1: LESSON 10
Reading for the Gist and Answering Text Dependent Questions:
Hunter-Gatherer Food Chain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Opening</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 20 of <em>The Omnivore's Dilemma</em> (6 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work Time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reading for the Gist: Pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore's Dilemma</em> (20 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 240–245 (14 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Closing and Assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Determining the Author's Claim (3 minutes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Homework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reread pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore's Dilemma</em> and identify a claim Michael Pollan makes and any relevant evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Read Chapter 21 of <em>The Omnivore's Dilemma</em> and continue to fill in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the hunter-gatherer food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• This is the first in the two-lesson cycle in which students build background knowledge about Michael Pollan's hunter-gatherer food chain.
• In this lesson, to gradually release students to work independently in preparation for the end of unit assessment, students work in pairs without any teacher modeling to find the gist and to answer text-dependent questions.
• In advance: Read pages 240–245 (up to “Things as They Are”), considering the gist of each paragraph and the answers to the text-dependent questions students are asked (see supporting materials for answers for teacher reference).
• Post: Learning targets.
**Lesson Vocabulary**

- gist; flank, embankment, prosciutto, wholly, crest, remorse, carcass, rig, hide

**Materials**

- Food Chain graphic organizer (from Lesson 9; for the hunter-gatherer food chain)
- Hunter-Gatherer Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference)
- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout (one for display; from Lesson 2)
- Sticky notes (at least 10 per student)
- Word-catcher (from Lesson 2; students may need a new copy of this word-catcher if they have filled the one they have)
- Dictionaries (enough for students to reference quickly while reading)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)
- Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
### Opening

**A. Engaging the Reader: Chapter 20 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma (6 minutes)**  
- Remind students that they were to read Chapter 20 and begin their Food Chain graphic organizer for the hunter-gatherer food chain for homework.
- Select students to share what they recorded on their organizers. See the Hunter-Gatherer Food Chain graphic organizer (answers, for teacher reference) to guide students toward the information their notes should include. Invite students to add to and revise their organizers where they think necessary based on what they hear from other students.

**B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)**  
- Invite students to read the learning targets with you:
  * “I can find the gist of pages 240–245 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.”
  * “I can read closely to answer questions about pages 240–245 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.”
- Remind students they have seen these learning targets in previous lessons and what the *gist* means.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes students accountable for completing homework. You can also monitor which students have not been completing their homework.
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
A. Reading for the Gist: Pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (20 minutes)

- Focus students on the description of the hunter-gatherer food chain on page 5 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Invite students to read that food chain again to refresh their memories.

- Tell students they will read pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for the gist. Remind students that they should have already done a first read of these pages when they read Chapter 20 for homework.

- Remind students of the Topic, Information, and Ideas on the “Questioning Texts” row of the Reading Closely: Guiding Questions handout.

- Tell students they will reread from “My Pig” at the top of page 240 to “Things as They Are” at the bottom of page 245 for the gist.

- Remind students to write annotations of the gist of each paragraph on sticky notes to stick in the margin of the book. Remind students to use their word-catchers to record any new vocabulary. Remind students that if they aren’t sure what the word means after looking for context clues, and looking in dictionaries, they should leave the definition column blank to be discussed with the whole group.

- Pair students and invite them to work together to find the gist and record unfamiliar words on their word-catchers for pages 240–245.

- Circulate and support students as they read. For those who need more support, ask them to practice telling you the gist of a section before they write it in the margin.

- Invite students to pair with a different student to compare what they wrote and to help each other with unfamiliar vocabulary they haven’t been able to figure out.

- Refocus whole group and invite them to share unfamiliar vocabulary words they found on pages 240–245, along with the definition. Where students were unable to work out the definition from the context or find it in a dictionary, encourage other students to assist them. If no one knows what the word means, tell students what it means.

- Be sure to address words students may struggle with here: flank, embankment, prosciutto, wholly, crest, remorse, carcass, rig, hide.

- Remind students to record new words on their word-catcher.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language. Consider letting students grapple with a complex text prior to the explicit teaching of vocabulary. After students have read for the gist, they can identify challenging vocabulary. Teachers can address student-selected vocabulary as well as predetermined vocabulary upon subsequent encounters with the text. However, in some cases and with some students, pre-teaching selected vocabulary may be necessary.

- Inviting students to say the gist aloud to a partner or the teacher before writing can give them the confidence to record their ideas and ensure they know what to write.
Work Time (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B. Text-Dependent Questions, Pages 240–245 (14 minutes)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Ask students to get back with the partner they found the gist with. Tell them now that they’ve got the gist of pages 240–245, they are going to dig deeper into this section of the text to understand it fully.</td>
<td>• Text-dependent questions can only be answered by referring explicitly back to the text being read. This encourages students to reread the text for further analysis and allows for a deeper understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Distribute <strong>Text-Dependent Questions: Pages 240–245 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tell students they are going to work through the questions on this handout. Remind them to discuss the answers with their partner before they write and to use details from the text in their answers.</td>
<td>• Some students may benefit from having access to “hint cards,” small slips of paper or index cards that they turn over for hints about how/where to find the answers to text-dependent questions. For example, a hint card might say: “Check back in the third paragraph on page 2.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Circulate to assist students in answering the questions. Ask questions to encourage students to refer to the text:</td>
<td>• Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “How did you come to that answer? Can you use a detail from the text to support your answer? Can you point out to that answer in the text?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to pair with a partner to discuss and compare their answers. Invite students to revise their answers if they think necessary based on what they see in their partner’s answers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Closing and Assessment

**A. Determining the Author’s Claim (3 minutes)**

- Ask students to discuss in their triads:
  - “What claim is Michael Pollan making on pages 240–245?”
  - Students who determine a claim can record it on a sticky note. As this is the homework, students who don’t get that far can continue for homework.

### Homework

- Reread pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and identify a claim Michael Pollan makes and any relevant evidence he uses to support his claim. Write the claim on a sticky note and use evidence flags to mark the claim and supporting evidence.
- Read Chapter 21 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and continue to fill in your Food Chain graphic organizer for the hunter-gatherer food chain. Remember to record any new vocabulary on your word-catcher.


Additional Information

- Some people hunt for sport and others hunt to make their own food. (Ch. 20)
- This food chain is not man-made. The hunter is just a part of the food chain, like an animal. (Ch. 20)
- Gathering: “We didn’t create the forest. It does not exist for us. The morels would just as soon I pass them by.” (Ch. 21)
- After a fire damages the pine trees where morels live, the fungus sends up morels to release spores to grow somewhere else. The morels help the forest grow back by attracting flies which lay eggs. Birds come to eat the larvae that hatch from the eggs. Birds drop seeds that help the forest grow back. (Ch. 21)

1. Inputs: What resources are used to grow the food (crops and animals)?
- Sunlight for the oak tree to grow (Ch. 20)
- Oak tree makes acorns which the pigs eat (Ch. 20)
- Chanterelles come up after the rain (Ch. 21)
- Trees/plants give sugars (carbohydrates) that make the mushrooms grow (Ch. 21)

2. Growing (crops and animals): Describe where the food grows. What does it look like? What happens to make the food grow? How is the food harvested?
- Pigs root (dig) at the base of oak trees for acorns, roots, and grubs (Ch. 20)
- Hunters wait for the wild pigs and then shoot them with a rifle (Ch. 20)
- Chanterelles live on the roots of old oak trees; morels grow after forest fires (Ch. 21)
- Most of fungus is underground; thin threadlike cells (Ch. 21)
- Fungi break down organic matter with powerful enzymes (Ch. 21)
- Fungus act as roots for plants, giving them what they need from soil; plant gives the fungus sugars (Ch. 21)
- To harvest mushrooms, people keep track of when they are ready and then search the forest (Ch. 21)

3. After the Harvest: Where does it go next? How is it processed?
- Animal carcass is hung on a tree and the guts are removed (Ch. 20)
- Animal is “dressed” (skin is taken off) (Ch. 20)
- Animal is butchered to take out pieces that will be used as food (Ch. 20)

4. Transportation: How is it moved from the farm to the factory or from the factory to the consumer?

5. Consumers: What is the product they get? How does it impact them?
- Hunted animal is dragged by the hunter to his/her car (Ch. 20)

6. Unintended Outputs: Besides the actual food, what else is produced?
- Boar prosciutto, salami (Ch. 20)
- Might feel bad about killing a living creature (Ch. 20)
- Chanterelles cooked with butter and shallots (Ch. 21)
- Mushrooms don’t have much nutritional value for people (Ch. 21)

• None
Text-Dependent Questions:
Pages 240-245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

I can determine a theme or the central ideas of an informational text. (RI.8.2)
I can determine the meaning of words and phrases in text (figurative, connotative, and technical meanings). (RI.8.4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What emotions did he feel as soon as he’d killed the pig? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What was the one emotion he expected to feel, but did not feel immediately?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why did he find seeing the inside of the pig more disturbing than the chicken guts on Joel’s farm?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Why did he tell Angelo he wanted to take a picture?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Text-Dependent Questions:
Pages 240-245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Why was he so disgusted? How does he explain his disgust?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What does he feel after looking at the pictures? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What new dilemma is he faced with?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. What is his final feeling about killing the pig? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What does he say hunters ought to be aware of?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Text-Dependent Questions:
Pages 240-245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Answers for Teacher Reference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What emotions did he feel as soon as he’d killed the pig? Why?</td>
<td><em>He felt pride for doing it and he felt “relief too, that the deed was done, thank God, and didn’t need to be done again.” He also felt “thankfulness” for good fortune in being successful, to Angelo for helping him and to the pig. He also felt “absolutely terrific.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What was the one emotion he expected to feel, but did not feel immediately?</td>
<td><em>“Sorrow or remorse.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why did he find seeing the inside of the pig more disturbing than the chicken guts on Joel’s farm?</td>
<td><em>“Because the pig’s internal organs looked exactly like human organs.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Why did he tell Angelo he wanted to take a picture?</td>
<td><em>Because he began to feel sick and needed “a breath of fresh air.”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Why was he so disgusted? How does he explain his disgust?</td>
<td><em>Because it reminds us of our own death.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What does he feel after looking at the pictures? Why?</td>
<td><em>He feels “ashamed” that he took pleasure and felt “joy” over killing another creature.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What new dilemma is he faced with?</td>
<td><em>“What exactly is the joy of hunting?”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. What is his final feeling about killing the pig? Why?</td>
<td><em>“I felt regret about killing that pig.” He explains that he feels regret because the pig was a living creature just like himself.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What does he say hunters ought to be aware of?</td>
<td><em>“The seriousness of what they are doing and never treat it lightly.”</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 11
Evaluating an Argument: The Joy of Hunting
Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)
I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can evaluate a spoken argument for sound reasoning, and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> for sound reasoning and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text.</td>
<td>• Food Chain graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Agenda

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Opening</td>
<td>A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work Time</td>
<td>A. Evaluating an Argument in an Interview (13 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Evaluating an Argument: Pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (15 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Identifying Irrelevant Evidence (10 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Closing and Assessment</td>
<td>A. Synthesizing Learning (5 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Homework</td>
<td>A. None for this lesson.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Teaching Notes

- This lesson is very similar in structure to Lesson 9. In this lesson, students build on the learning from Lesson 9 about evaluating an argument; however, to address SL.8.3, students begin by evaluating the claims in a spoken argument.
- In advance: Read the Interview with an Organic Farmer, as you will be reading this aloud to the students.
- Read pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and review the answer key for the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer to familiarize yourself with what students will be doing and the answers you will be guiding them toward (see supporting materials).
- Post: Learning targets; What Makes a Strong Argument? anchor chart.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson Vocabulary</th>
<th>Materials</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| evaluate, argument, claim, relevant, irrelevant, sound, sufficient | • Interview with an Organic Farmer (for teacher reference)  
• Lined paper (one piece per student)  
• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245 (one per student)  
• Evaluating an Argument task card (one per student)  
• *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)  
• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245 (answers, for teacher reference)  
• Example of Irrelevant Evidence: Page 245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* Rewritten (one per student and one for display) |
## Opening

### A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)
- Review the posted learning targets:
  * “I can evaluate a spoken argument for sound reasoning, and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.”
  * “I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 240–245 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning, and sufficient relevant evidence to support the claim.”
  * “I can identify irrelevant evidence in a text.”
- Remind students that these are similar targets to those in Lesson 9; they just deal with a different excerpt of text. Explain that today they will practice the skill of evaluating an author’s argument.
- Remind students of what relevant, irrelevant, and sufficient evidence means.
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “Why is evaluating an argument an important skill?”
  * Cold call two to three students to share their thinking with the class.
- Listen for students to say something along the lines of: “It is a way to think deeply about the text” and “it will prepare them to make their own argument.”

## Meeting Students’ Needs
- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
- Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
A. Evaluating an Argument in an Interview (13 minutes)

- Tell students they will hear you read aloud an interview by an organic farmer about why organic food is important.
- Read aloud the Interview with an Organic Farmer to the students, but don’t show them the text, as they can practice evaluating what they hear.
- Ask students to discuss in triads:
  - "What claim is the farmer making?"
- Select volunteers to share their answers. Listen for students to explain the claim is that organic food is important because it is healthy and good for you.
- Distribute lined paper. Invite students to fold their paper into four (in half and in half again—this may need modeling). Tell students you will read the interview again and they should take notes about the following (record list on the board). Invite students to record each of these as a heading in a section of their folded paper:
  - Relevant evidence
  - Sufficient evidence
  - Irrelevant evidence
  - Sound reasoning
- Read the interview two more times.
- Cold call students to share their thinking whole group. Go through each section at a time. Listen for students to explain that there isn’t any relevant evidence, and as a result, there isn’t sufficient evidence. The irrelevant evidence is the information about fruits and vegetables. This is irrelevant because not all fruits and vegetables are organic. The reasoning is not sound because the evidence isn’t relevant— the evidence needs to be relevant for the reasoning to be sound.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Use of protocols (like Teammates Consult) allows for total participation of students. It encourages critical thinking, collaboration, and social construction of knowledge. It also helps students to practice their speaking and listening skills.
### Work Time (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B. Evaluating an Argument: Pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (15 minutes)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Distribute the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students that for homework they reread pages 240–245 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>, identified a claim that Michael Pollan makes, and flagged supporting evidence. Select volunteers to share their claim and evidence. Listen for claims and evidence to be similar to the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245 (answers, for teacher reference) and guide students in that direction.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Distribute the Evaluating an Argument task card. Read the directions with students. Explain to students they will work in triads following the Teammates Consult protocol, using <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> to complete the graphic organizer.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Circulate to assist students. Ask:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “How is this evidence relevant?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “How is the evidence connected to the claim? Has the author explained this?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for pages 240–245 (answers, for teacher reference). (In the supporting materials, provide an idea of how to answer each question.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to follow the task card’s final directions to share their graphic organizer with someone from another triad and then to return to their triad to revise their graphic organizer.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C. Identifying Irrelevant Evidence (10 minutes)

- Invite students to look at the second part of their graphic organizers: “Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence.” Remind students that irrelevant evidence is that which doesn’t support the claim or make sense in support of the claim. It may also be evidence that has been deliberately added to mislead the reader or listener. Remind students that one piece of irrelevant evidence from the interview with the organic farmer was: “Seventy-five percent of overweight children who ate five servings of fruits and vegetables per day lost weight to be in a safer weight zone,” and that it is irrelevant because it isn’t about organic food at all—not all fruit and vegetables are organic.

- Tell students that, as in Lesson 9, the excerpt they will analyze for irrelevant evidence is a rewritten piece of the Michael Pollan excerpt they have been reading and analyzing in the previous two lessons. Remind students that this will help because they have already identified a claim in this excerpt; it will also help them see why Michael Pollan’s actual writing is a good example of a strong argument.

- Ask students to close their The Omnivore’s Dilemma books. Display and distribute Example of Irrelevant Evidence: Page 245 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma Rewritten and read it aloud as students follow along silently in their heads.

- Remind students that they have already figured out a claim that they think Michael Pollan is making in this excerpt (something similar to: “Hunters should be aware of the seriousness of killing a living creature and not take it lightly”); now they will work in triads to identify any irrelevant evidence in this excerpt of text and record it on Part 2 of their organizers.

- Give students no more than 5 minutes to identify the irrelevant evidence and record it.

- Cold call students to share the irrelevant evidence whole group. Refer to the answers for teacher reference to guide students toward appropriate answers and invite them to revise their graphic organizers accordingly.

- Invite students to review the original paragraph on page 245 of their books. Ask them to discuss in triads:
  * “How is the rewritten excerpt different to the original? How is Michael Pollan’s better?”
  
- Select volunteers to share their responses whole group. Listen for them to explain that Michael Pollan doesn’t provide irrelevant details about pigs.
A. Synthesizing Learning (5 minutes)

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “Did Pollan make a strong argument in this excerpt? Why or why not?”
- Cold call students to answer. Listen for them to say something along the lines of: “The argument was strong because his evidence gave examples of both the joy and the pain he felt after hunting, his evidence was sufficient, and his reasoning was sound.”
- Review the day’s learning targets with students.
- Use the Fist to Five protocol to have them assess themselves on evaluating an argument.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- Checking in with learning targets helps students self-assess their learning. This research-based strategy supports struggling learners most.

Homework

- None for this lesson.
Why is organic food important?

Organic food is important because it means that people who eat organic food aren’t eating a lot of harmful chemicals like pesticides and fertilizers on their foods. Pesticides and fertilizers sprayed on crops when they are growing kill pests and make the crops grow faster, but they can cause illnesses like cancer. I don’t spray any chemicals on my crops and, as a result, I might not produce such a big harvest or make as much money as farmers who do spray their crops with pesticides and fertilizers, but the food I produce is much safer to eat. Obesity is still a problem in the U.S. and eating a lot of fruit and vegetables can prevent obesity, particularly in children. Seventy-five percent of overweight children who ate five servings of fruits and vegetables per day lost weight to be in a safer weight zone. Children need to learn at school that eating too much fast food can lead to health problems and that fruit and vegetables are much healthier. Everyone should eat organic food for these reasons.
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)

### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Speaker’s Claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**

- Relevant Evidence 1
- Relevant Evidence 2
- Relevant Evidence 3
### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 4</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 5</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence

What irrelevant evidence did the author/speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.
Evaluating an Argument Task Card

1. Discuss your claim and the relevant evidence you flagged with your partner.

2. Add the claim to the graphic organizer.

3. Add the relevant evidence you flagged to the graphic organizer.

4. Explain how each piece of relevant evidence you have recorded supports the author’s claim.

5. Answer the questions about sufficient evidence and sound reasoning.

6. Meet with a new partner to share work.

7. Report back to original partner and make revisions.
### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

**Author/Speaker’s Claim:**

*Hunters should be aware of the seriousness of killing a living creature and not take it lightly.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I wasn’t ready to see it as meat, though. What I saw was a dead wild animal, its head lying on the dirt in a widening circle of blood. I kneeled down and pressed the palm of my hand against the pig’s belly above the nipples. Beneath the dusty, bristly skin I felt her warmth, but no heartbeat” (241).</td>
<td>“A scale attached to the rig gave the weight of the animal: 190 pounds. The pig weighed exactly as much as I did” (242).</td>
<td>“I’d handled plenty of chicken guts on Joel’s farm, but this was different and more disturbing. That was probably because the pig’s internal organs looked exactly like human organs” (243).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:** This emphasizes the seriousness of hunting because it emphasizes that the pig he killed was a living creature with a heartbeat rather than just meat to eat.

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:** Again this emphasizes the seriousness of killing an animal because by comparing the weight of the pig to the author’s own weight, it makes us realize that the pig is a living creature rather than just meat to eat.

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:** Comparing the pig’s internal organs to human internal organs makes the killing of the pig seem more serious because it emphasizes that a pig is a living thing rather than just meat to eat.
### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 4</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 5</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“When we kill an animal, especially a big mammal like a pig, it can’t help reminding us of our own death. The line between their bodies and ours, between their deaths and ours, is not very sharp” (244).</td>
<td>“No matter how I looked at it, I felt regret about killing that pig. The animal is at once different from me and yet as a living creature it is in some ways the same.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:** Comparing the killing of a pig to our own death makes the action seem very serious. Again it emphasizes that a pig is a living thing rather than just meat.

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:** Again he is comparing pigs to humans, emphasizing that they are living creatures rather than just meat.

**Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.**
Yes, he did provide sufficient evidence because he gave multiple detailed examples emphasizing how pigs are living creatures, like us, which makes hunting seem more serious.

**Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.**
Yes, the reasoning is sound, although it is all based on personal beliefs and interpretations of the hunting experience. He certainly provides multiple examples of how a pig is a living creature comparable to a human being; however, someone else may not feel those same emotions when hunting and killing an animal, so they may not agree with the claim.
### Part 1: Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comparing the killing of a pig to our own death makes the action seem very serious. Again it emphasizes that a pig is a living thing rather than just meat.</td>
<td>Again he is comparing pigs to humans, emphasizing that they are living creatures rather than just meat.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.**
Yes, he did provide sufficient evidence because he gave multiple detailed examples emphasizing how pigs are living creatures, like us, which makes hunting seem more serious.

**Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.**
Yes, the reasoning is sound, although it is all based on personal beliefs and interpretations of the hunting experience. He certainly provides multiple examples of how a pig is a living creature comparable to a human being; however, someone else may not feel those same emotions when hunting and killing an animal, so they may not agree with the claim.

### Part 2: Irrelevant Evidence

**What irrelevant evidence did the author/speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.**

The evidence the author provides about pigs is not linked to the claim—it gives us facts about pigs, but it doesn’t emphasize the seriousness of killing a living creature. He says, “Pigs can run up to 11 miles per hour, and they like to bathe in water or mud to keep cool, although they actually prefer water to mud.”
I was confronted with yet another dilemma. What exactly is the joy of hunting? I know what made me feel good when I was out in the woods. I enjoyed feeling totally alive and a part of nature. I enjoyed discovering new abilities that I didn't know I had. I enjoyed succeeding in my difficult task.

However, I also knew what made me feel bad about hunting. No matter how I looked at it, I felt regret about killing that pig. The animal is at once different from me and yet as a living creature it is in some ways the same. Pigs can run up to 11 miles per hour, and they like to bathe in water or mud to keep cool, although they actually prefer water to mud. So when a hunter kills a pig, they ought to be aware of the seriousness of what they are doing and never treat it lightly.
Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively: Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)  
I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

## Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can develop a claim about which food chain I would choose to feed my family—local sustainable or hunter-gatherer—and support it with evidence.</td>
<td>• Students’ comments regarding how to develop a claim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I can advocate persuasively about my claim.</td>
<td>• Developing a Claim graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Agenda

1. **Opening**
   - A. Unpacking Learning Targets (5 minutes)

2. **Work Time**
   - A. Mini Lesson: Modeling Developing a Claim (15 minutes)
   - B. Independent Work: Developing a Claim to Answer the Question: “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” (20 minutes)

3. **Closing and Assessment**
   - A. Partner Share (5 minutes)

4. **Homework**
   - A. Finish your Developing a Claim ticket and be ready to advocate persuasively in the next lesson’s Fishbowl.

# Teaching Notes

- This lesson introduces students to what it means to advocate persuasively and how to prepare to advocate persuasively by outlining a claim, points, and evidence. The lesson is designed to prepare students for a practice Fishbowl discussion and a Fishbowl assessment (Part 2 of the end of unit assessment). Note that this lesson addresses both RI and SL standards that NYS added to the CCLS. Both standards require the identical cognitive work for students.

- The question used to model advocating persuasively is similar to the question students advocate persuasively about. The difference is that in the model, you make a claim, choosing between the industrial and organic food chains to feed your family; and when the students work independently, they will make a claim choosing between the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains to best feed their families.

- As students prepare their claim, circulate to determine which food chain each student advocates for so you can think about how to group students for the practice Fishbowls in the next lesson. Depending on the size of your class, you need to group your students into two or three groups, and mix up the groups to have students advocating for both food chains in each group to encourage listening to each other, to deepen their thinking and to make their own argument more thoughtful. It also ensures students have counterclaims to respond to.

- In advance: Review the Developing a Claim: Model and the Model Fishbowl script to familiarize yourself with the claim you will use to model advocating persuasively and the way it should sound when you present it to the students.

- Post: Learning targets.
## Lesson Vocabulary

- advocate, persuasively

## Materials

- Developing a Claim: Model (one for display)
- Model Fishbowl Script (for teacher reference)
- Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart (new; teacher-created; see Work Time A)
- Developing a Claim (one per student)
- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Developing a Claim: Sample Student Response (for teacher reference)
### A. Unpacking Learning Targets (5 minutes)
- Review the posted learning targets:
  - “I can develop a claim about which food chain I would choose to feed my family—local sustainable or hunter-gatherer—and support it with evidence.”
  - “I can advocate persuasively about my claim.”
- Circle the word *advocate*. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - “What does advocate mean?”
- Select volunteers to share their ideas with the whole group. Listen for them to explain that to advocate means to publicly support an idea or cause. Record this definition above the word *advocate*.
- Circle the word *persuasive*. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  - “What does persuasive mean?”
- Cold call students to share their responses. Listen for them to explain that to persuade means to convince an audience to take your viewpoint on an issue. Note that speakers persuade us with mostly what they say, but how they say it is also important. Record this definition above the word *persuasive*.
- Describe the end of unit assessment to students. Explain that it has two parts. In the first part, students evaluate an argument for a speech and another excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* using the graphic organizer with which they have been practicing. In the second part, they advocate persuasively about which food chain they would use to feed their family. They will develop their claim and supporting evidence in class in Lesson 14 and for homework, and then participate in a class discussion in the following lesson, where they advocate persuasively for their claim.
- Tell students they have practiced evaluating arguments; today’s lesson will help them prepare for the advocating persuasively section of the assessment.
### Work Time

**A. Mini Lesson: Modeling Developing a Claim (15 minutes)**

- Tell students that you are going to model how to advocate persuasively to answer the question. Make it clear that this is just an example of how to advocate persuasively and that students will answer a similar question, but not the same:
  
  Which food chain would you choose to feed your family, the industrial food chain or the industrial organic food chain?

- Set up the Fishbowl situation with a circle of about eight students on the inside and everyone else sitting on the outside. Display the **Developing a Claim: Model** and explain that you used this ticket to organize your ideas and now you will use it to advocate persuasively. Refer to the **Model Fishbowl Script** for how to outline the ideas, but try not to make it sound like you are reading a script, as students will not be writing a script to read when they advocate persuasively. As you model, speak loudly and clearly and make eye contact with students in the room.

- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  
  * “What did you notice?”
  * “What do you wonder?”
  * “How did I advocate persuasively? How did I try to make you think that I chose the best food chain?”

- Select volunteers to share their ideas whole group.

- Record student responses to the third question on **Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart**. Ensure the following are included:
  
  - Made a claim.
  - Provide clear reasons for making that claim.
  - Provided strong supporting evidence for reasons from research.
  - Provided sound reasoning.
  - Responded to a claim made by someone else in the Fishbowl.

- Remind students of their work on conflicting viewpoints in the first half of the unit. Explain that a counterclaim is like a conflicting viewpoint—which is a viewpoint that goes against another viewpoint. In the same way, a counterclaim is a claim that goes against another claim. In the Fishbowl model, you listened to the claims of others and argued against someone else’s claim that was different from your own. Remind students of the counterclaim from the Fishbowl model.

### Meeting Students’ Needs

- Modeling provides a clear vision of the expectation for students.
- Anchor charts serve as note-catchers when the class is co-constructing ideas.
## Work Time (continued)

**B. Independent Work: Developing a Claim to Answer the Question: “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” (20 minutes)**

- Distribute *Developing a Claim* and invite students to read the directions with you.
- Refer to the displayed *Developing a Claim: Model* to help students determine what kind of information they need to record in each box as follows:
  - The claim is your answer to the question.
  - Reasons 1 and 2 are your main reasons for making your claim.
  - Evidence is taken from the book and supports your claim and your reasons for making the claim.
- Explain that students will advocate persuasively in a practice Fishbowl in the next lesson, in which they will answer a similar question to the model “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” They will use their Food Chain graphic organizers for the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains, and the relevant sections of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* to support their claims and fill in the *Developing a Claim* ticket to help them in the Fishbowl.
- Using the Fist to Five protocol, ask students to share how well they understand how to complete the *Developing a Claim* handout themselves. Notice students who hold up fewer than four fingers and concentrate on assisting them when the class begins to work.
- Tell students that as this is a decision for their own family, they will do this independently; however, they can talk to other students if needed, as this isn’t the assessment.
- Circulate to assist students in making a claim, determining reasons, and finding evidence. Refer to the *Developing a Claim: Sample Student Response* for an example of a response. Ask students questions to guide their thinking:
  - “Which food chain would you choose?”
  - “Looking at what you know about both of the food chains, why would you choose that food chain? What two reasons can you give?”
  - “What evidence can you find in the text to support your reasons?”
- As you circulate, try to discern which of the food chains for which each student advocates, as this will help with groupings in the next lesson.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Providing models of expected work supports all learners, especially challenged learners.
### Closing and Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Partner Share (5 minutes)</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students of the criteria on the Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart.</td>
<td>• Having students pair up with someone else to compare their work can help students gain a deeper understanding, learn from peers, and improve their own work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to pair up and verbally share their claim, reasons, and evidence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Homework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Finish your Developing a Claim ticket and be ready to advocate persuasively in the next lesson’s Fishbowl.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Make a claim based on the question: *Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the industrial food chain or the industrial organic food chain?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Claim</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>I would choose the industrial organic food chain to feed my family.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason 1</th>
<th>Reason 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My family struggles with weight and diabetes, so food from the industrial organic food chain is healthier for my family.</td>
<td>My family cares about the environment, and food from the industrial organic food chain is better for the environment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p. 104 “Judith, Isaac and I together consumed a total of 4,510 calories at our [McDonald’s] lunch, which is about two-thirds of what the three of us should eat in a day.”</td>
<td>p. 134–135 “The study showed that the organic fruits and vegetables contained higher levels of Vitamin C. They also had a wider range of natural chemicals called polyphenols. Polyphenols are a group of chemicals made by plants that seem to play an important role in human health.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p. 124 “If you include all the farmland growing fruits and vegetables for Earthbound, it comes to a total of 25,000 organic acres. The Goodmans estimate that this has eliminated some 270,000 pounds of pesticide and 8 million pounds of petrochemical fertilizer that would otherwise have been applied to those fields.”</td>
<td>p. 105 “Growing corn and nothing but corn has damaged the soil of our farmlands, polluted the water, and threatened the health of all the creatures downstream.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I would choose food from the industrial organic food chain to feed my family for two important reasons. First, my family struggles with weight and diabetes, so food from the industrial organic food chain is healthier for my family. Industrial food can cause obesity and diabetes. When Michael Pollan describes his meal from McDonald’s, which is a meal from the industrial food chain, he says, “Judith, Isaac and I together consumed a total of 4,510 calories at our [McDonald’s] lunch, which is about two-thirds of what the three of us should eat in a day.” I do not want my family to eat that many calories in one meal. Michael Pollan also points out that organic food is healthier because it contains more nutrients when he says, “The study showed that the organic fruits and vegetables contained higher levels of Vitamin C. They also had a wider range of natural chemicals called polyphenols. Polyphenols are a group of chemicals made by plants that seem to play an important role in human health.” I think it would be good for my family’s health to eat industrial organic food.

The second reason I would choose industrial organic is that food from the industrial organic food chain is better for the environment. Michael Pollan points out how much better industrial organic is for the environment: “If you include all the farmland growing fruits and vegetables for Earthbound it comes to a total of 25,000 organic acres. The Goodmans estimate that this has eliminated some 270,000 pounds of pesticide and 8 million pounds of petrochemical fertilizer that would otherwise have been applied to those fields.” Imagine how many chemicals are eliminated in our environment if we add up all the industrial organic farms in the country! Michael Pollan also says that “Growing corn and nothing but corn has damaged the soil of our farmlands, polluted the water, and threatened the health of all the creatures downstream.” My family would really like our food choices to have a positive impact on the environment, so I would choose industrial organic.

I hear you suggesting that the industrial food chain would be better to feed your family because the food is cheaper and your family doesn’t have a lot of money to spend on food, but I wonder if the health of your family isn’t worth finding money to spend on industrial organic food. If your family eats industrial organic food, they are more likely to be healthy and so will need to spend less on medical bills.
Developing a Claim

Name: 

Date: 

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

Make a claim based on the question:

**Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?**

Directions:

1. Review your Food Chain graphic organizers for the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains. Use the information you have recorded on your food chain to refer back to the relevant sections of your text.
2. Decide which food chain you would choose to feed your family.
3. Think of two reasons why, based on what you know about those food chains.
4. Find evidence in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* to support those reasons.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Claim</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason 1</th>
<th>Reason 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Developing a Claim:
Sample Student Response for Teacher Reference

Based on the evidence gathered in the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer and other evidence you have learned over the course of this unit, make a claim based on the question:

*Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Claim</th>
<th>Reason 1</th>
<th>Reason 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I would choose local sustainable to feed my family.</td>
<td>Local sustainable grows in ways that preserve the environment.</td>
<td>It is important to me and my family to support local farmers and businesses instead of big corporations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“To Joel, sustainable organic farming means using free solar energy instead of fossil fuel energy” (153).</td>
<td>“If local food chains are going to succeed, customers will have to get used to eating [what is in season]” (189).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Out of every dollar spent on food in this country, ninety-two cents goes to non-farmers. By selling directly to consumers, Joel gets to keep more of that money” (190).</td>
<td>“[Joel Salatin] sees his farm as part of a local food economy. He wants the sale of his eggs and meat to help other local businesses, like small shops and restaurants” (182).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 13
Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl: Practice
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively.

(SL.8.2a)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively.

(RI.8.9a)

## Supporting Learning Target

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Target</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can advocate persuasively for either local sustainable or hunter-gatherer to feed my family.</td>
<td>• Developing a Claim graphic organizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Advocating Persuasively Checklist</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Agenda

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Opening</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Unpacking the Learning Target (2 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Work Time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Mini Lesson: How to Advocate Persuasively (8 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Students Prepare to Advocate Persuasively (8 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Practice Advocating Persuasively Fishbowls (20 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Closing and Assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Peer Feedback (7 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Homework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Read the Afterword, “Vote with Your Fork” (pages 279–283). Answer this: “Name one way you can ‘vote with your fork.’”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Teaching Notes

- The Fishbowl in this lesson and the subsequent self-assessment prepare students for the end of unit assessment in Lesson 15, when they are graded on their ability to advocate persuasively in another Fishbowl.
- Depending on the size of your group, you may need to conduct two or three Fishbowl discussions. You may also need longer than the time allocated; consider this when planning.
- In this lesson, you will not be assessing students formally on the Advocating Persuasively Checklist. Instead make general notes about patterns you see across all of the Fishbowls to share with students at the end of the lesson.
- Students will be peer critiquing during the Fishbowls; ensure they are familiar with the Peer Critique protocol. Set up the peer critiquing so students remember to be kind and constructive with their feedback.
- In advance: Plan the groupings for the Fishbowls. Where possible, mix up the groups so that they contain students advocating for both food chains to provide students with the opportunity to respond to a counterclaim.
- Post: Learning target.
Lesson Vocabulary | Materials
--- | ---
advocate, persuade, convince | • Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart (from Lesson 12)
• Developing a Claim: Model (from Lesson 12)
• Model Fishbowl Script (from Lesson 12)
• Advocating Persuasively Checklist (one per student; one for display)
• The Omnivore’s Dilemma, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
• Fishbowl protocol (one for display; see supporting materials)
• Peer Critique protocol (one for display; see Appendix)
• Homework: Vote with Your Fork (one per student)

Opening

A. Unpacking the Learning Target (2 minutes)
• Remind students that in the previous lesson, they made their own claim based on the question “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” And for homework they completed the Developing a Claim graphic organizer with their main reasons and evidence.
• Tell students that today they will practice advocating persuasively for their claim by participating in a Fishbowl.
• Read the target aloud:
  * “I can advocate persuasively for either local sustainable or hunter-gatherer to feed my family.”
• Remind students that to advocate means to publicly support an idea or cause and that to persuade means to convince an audience to take your viewpoint on an issue.

Meeting Students’ Needs

• Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
• Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.
• Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.
## Work Time

A. **Mini Lesson: How to Advocate Persuasively (8 minutes)**

- Focus students’ attention on the *Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart* and remind them of the criteria they developed in Lesson 12.
- Explain to students that these criteria are about the content, but when advocating persuasively, it is also important to consider the speaking skills involved.
- Set up the Fishbowl situation again with a circle of about eight students on the inside and everyone else sitting on the outside.
- Invite students to watch and listen carefully to your speaking skills. Repeat the model Fishbowl using the *Developing a Claim: Model* and the *Model Fishbowl Script* for guidance in outlining ideas, but try not to make it sound like you are reading a script, as students will focus on your speaking skills. As you model, make sure you speak loudly and clearly and make eye contact with students in the room.
- Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:
  * “What did you notice?”
  * “What do you wonder?”
  * “How did I advocate persuasively? How did I speak? What did I do?”
- Add to the anchor chart:
  - Make eye contact with multiple audience members.
  - Speak clearly and slowly enough for everyone to hear and understand.
  - Use appropriate volume.
  - Speak respectfully and politely.
- Display and distribute the *Advocating Persuasively Checklist*. Explain that you’ll use this to assess students when they advocate persuasively in their Fishbowls and they’ll also use it to assess each other. Invite students to read the criteria with you.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Modeling provides a clear vision of the expectation for students.
- Anchor charts serve as note-catchers when the class is co-constructing ideas.
### B. Students Prepare to Advocate Persuasively (8 minutes)
- Tell students they have 10 minutes to prepare to advocate persuasively using their Developing a Claim graphic organizer. They may also use their text *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Remind them to refer to the criteria on the Advocating Persuasively Checklist, as this is what they will be assessed on. Tell them that their presentations need to be about 1 minute long.

### C. Practice Advocating Persuasively Fishbowls (20 minutes)
- Explain that students will use what they have just learned to practice advocating persuasively in a Fishbowl. Display the Fishbowl protocol and read it aloud with students.
- Ask students to give a thumbs-up if they fully understand the protocol, a thumbs-sideways if they have a question about the protocol, or a thumbs-down if they have more than one question. Clarify where necessary.
- Display the Peer Critique protocol and invite students to read it with you. Remind students to be kind and constructive in their feedback when peer assessing. Pair students with someone from another Fishbowl group. Tell them to write the name of their partner at the top of their Advocating Persuasively Checklist as they will be responsible for assessing their partner.
- Begin Fishbowl 1. Organize the first group of students in the middle of the Fishbowl. Remind students of time as needed, keeping each presentation to about 1 minute. Remind students on the outside to assess their partner (in the center of the Fishbowl) on their Advocating Persuasively Checklist. After all students in the center have presented, ask the first group to respond briefly to their peers’ claims, since they will not have had the chance to respond to another viewpoint.
- Rotate students into the center of the Fishbowl until everyone has had a chance to present in the Fishbowl.
- Provide general feedback; for example, patterns of success you noticed (stars), such as students’ consistent use of eye contact within the group, or the clarity of their claims, relevancy of their evidence, etc. Comment on some areas of improvement (steps) as well, such as students’ tendency to speak too quickly or quietly.
- Thank students for their participation in the Fishbowls and their attention to the anchor chart throughout the process. Encourage students by telling them their practice will pay off during the upcoming end of unit assessment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Providing models of expected work supports all learners, especially challenged learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing and Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Peer Feedback (7 minutes)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invite students to share their peer feedback with their partner using their Advocating Persuasively Checklist notes. Remind students to ask questions of each other where they don’t understand the feedback their partner has given.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Distribute <strong>Homework: Vote with Your Fork.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Homework</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Read the Afterword, “Vote with Your Fork” (pages 279–283). Answer this: “Name one way you can ‘vote with your fork.’”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Advocating Persuasively Checklist**

**Directions:** Place a check next to each item the speaker demonstrates in his/her speech. In the comments column to the right, add any relevant details, questions, or suggestions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>if yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Makes a strong claim.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides clear reasons for making that claim.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides strong supporting evidence for reasons from research.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responds to a counterclaim made by someone else in the Fishbowl.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presentation</th>
<th>if yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact with multiple audience members.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaks clearly and slowly enough for everyone to hear and understand.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaks at an appropriate volume.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Fishbowl Protocol**

**The Inner Circle – Discuss!**
One voice at a time, for one minute each
Present your claim, points and evidence
Respond to others’ claims, points and evidence
Practice eye contact
Use appropriate volume
Respectfully listen to others
Use appropriate volume
Respectfully listen to others

**The Outer Circle—Listen and Learn!**
Observe others’ arguments and presentation
Take note of counterclaims and how you would respond to them
After reading the Afterword, “Vote with Your Fork,” in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, name one way you can you “vote with your fork.”

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
**Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Supporting Learning Targets**

- I can determine the speaker’s argument and claims and evaluate the reasoning and evidence she has used to support her claim in the interview clip.
- I can identify irrelevant evidence that the speaker has used in the interview clip.
- I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 73–75 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* for sound reasoning and sufficient, relevant evidence to support the claim.
- I can identify irrelevant evidence.

**Ongoing Assessment**

- End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech
- End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*
## Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening</th>
<th>Teaching Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Reviewing Homework: Voting with Your Fork (3 minutes)</td>
<td>• In preparation for this assessment, make sure you’ve watched the video clip (<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xYYQGA3Jh-Y">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xYYQGA3Jh-Y</a>) and read the excerpt from pages 73–75 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</td>
<td>• The portion of the clip for Part 1 of the assessment is 0:36–3:00.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Time</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech (17 minutes)</td>
<td>• When Part 1 of the assessment is over, either collect the Part 1 graphic organizers from the students so they can focus on Part 2 OR allow them to have both so that they can use any additional time to finish up work on either part. This depends on your judgment of your students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt from <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> (18 minutes)</td>
<td>• At the end of the lesson, students work on their claim in preparation for advocating persuasively in the final part of the end of unit 1 assessment in the next lesson. As students prepare their claim, circulate to determine which meal each student is advocating for so you know how to group students for the final assessment Fishbowls in Lesson 15.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Closing and Assessment | • Depending on the size of your class, group your students into two or three groups, and mix up the groups to have students advocating for different meals in each group so that they have counterclaims to respond to. |
| A. Developing a Claim (5 minutes) | • Assess student responses on the end of unit 1 assessment using the NYS 2-Point Rubric—Short Response. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Homework</th>
<th>• Post: Learning targets.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Finish filling in the End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 3: Developing a Claim and practice using it to advocate persuasively to be ready for the assessed Fishbowl discussion in the next lesson. Refer to the Advocating Persuasively Checklist filled in by your peer in Lesson 13 to help you improve the way you advocate persuasively. Remember to try to keep your presentation to about 1 minute.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Lesson Vocabulary

Do not preteach vocabulary in the assessment.

## Materials

- End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech (one per student)
- “Organic Eggs vs. Conventional Farm Eggs, Free Range Chickens, & Ethical Animal Treatment Vital Farms” interview clip 0:36-3:00, and the technology to play it to the whole group: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xYYQGA3Jh-Y
- End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (one per student)
- End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech (answers, for teacher reference)
- End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* (answers, for teacher reference)
- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 3: Developing a Claim (one per student)
- Advocating Persuasively Checklist (filled in for students by peers in Lesson 13)
- NYS 2-Point Rubric—Short Response (for teacher reference).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opening</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Reviewing Homework: Voting with Your Fork (3 minutes)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students of their homework focus: Name one way you can you “vote with your fork.”</td>
<td>• Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework holds students accountable. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which students aren’t completing their homework.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Select volunteers to share their ideas with the whole group.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explain to students that today they will complete the first part of their end of unit assessment and that this assessment is directly related to the learning targets. Invite students to read the targets with you:</td>
<td>• Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “I can determine the speaker’s argument and claims and evaluate the reasoning and evidence she has used to support her claim in the interview clip.”</td>
<td>• Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “I can identify irrelevant evidence that the speaker has used in the interview clip.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “I can evaluate Michael Pollan’s argument on pages 73–75 of <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em> for sound reasoning and sufficient, relevant evidence to support the claim.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* “I can identify irrelevant evidence.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Remind students that they have seen similar learning targets earlier in the unit when evaluating arguments and claims.</td>
<td>• Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Work Time

#### A. End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech (17 minutes)
- Tell students they are about to hear/watch an audio/video clip of someone being interviewed about organic eggs versus conventional farm eggs and that they are going to determine her argument and claims and evaluate the evidence and reasoning she has provided.
- Distribute the **End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech**. Give students 2 minutes to familiarize themselves with the organizer again. Make it clear that students will hear the excerpt multiple times, so they shouldn’t try to record everything at once.
- Play the “**Organic Eggs vs. Conventional Farm Eggs, Free Range Chickens, & Ethical Animal Treatment Vital Farms**” interview clip once. Start at 0:36 and stop at 3:00.
- Give students time to add any relevant information to their graphic organizers. Remind students they are to work independently without discussing their ideas.
- Play the excerpt more times if students request it. Give students the rest of the time to finish completing the graphic organizer.
- Circulate to support students, but as this is an assessment, they must complete this independently.
- Collect Part 1 of the end of unit 1 assessment from students.

#### B. End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt from The Omnivore’s Dilemma (18 minutes)
- Distribute the **End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 2: Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt from The Omnivore’s Dilemma**.
- Invite students to turn to pages 73–75 of **The Omnivore’s Dilemma**. Tell students they will be evaluating the argument, reasoning, and evidence in this excerpt of the book, just as they have done in previous lessons.
- Remind them they are to work independently without speaking to any other students.
- Circulate to support students, but as this is an assessment, they need to complete this independently.
- Collect Part 2 of the end of unit 1 assessment from students.

### Meeting Students’ Needs
- If students receive accommodations for the assessment, communicate with the cooperating service providers regarding the practices of instruction in use during this study as well as the goals of the assessment.
- For some students, this assessment may require more than the time allotted. Consider providing students time over multiple days if necessary.
## Closing and Assessment

**A. Developing a Claim (5 minutes)**

- Tell students that in the next lesson they will participate in the second part of this end of unit assessment, which will involve advocating persuasively in a Fishbowl, just as they have done previously in the unit. Remind students that to help them prepare for this Fishbowl exercise, they need to develop their claim, reasons, and evidence.

- Distribute **End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 3: Developing a Claim**. Invite students to read the question at the top of the organizer with you:
  
  * “Now that you have read a lot of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, which of the four meals you were invited to choose from at the beginning of the unit would you choose to feed your family? Why?”

- Make it clear that students do not have to choose the same meal they chose before, but they can if they want to. Remind them to use their Food Chain graphic organizers and evidence from *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* or any other documents in preparation for this claim. However, during the Fishbowl, they will only have access to this graphic organizer.

- As students fill in their graphic organizers, circulate to get an idea of which meal each student is advocating for, as this will help with groupings in the next lesson.

## Homework

- Finish filling in the End of Unit 1 Assessment Part 3: Developing a Claim and practice using it to advocate persuasively to be ready for the assessed Fishbowl discussion in the next lesson. Refer to the **Advocating Persuasively Checklist** filled in by your peer in Lesson 13 to help you improve the way you advocate persuasively. Remember to try to keep your presentation to about 1 minute.
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech

Name: 

Date: 

I can determine a speaker’s argument and specific claims. (SL.8.3)
I can evaluate the reasoning and evidence presented for soundness and relevance. (SL.8.3)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (SL.8.3)

**Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker’s Claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Evidence 4</td>
<td>Relevant Evidence 5</td>
<td>Relevant Evidence 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did the speaker provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech

Irrelevant Evidence

What irrelevant evidence did the speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.
I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)
I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

### Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page numbers of excerpt:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author/Speaker’s Claim:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 2:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in an Excerpt of
*The Omnivore’s Dilemma*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 4</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 5</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
<td>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example of Irrelevant Evidence:
Page 74 of The Omnivore’s Dilemma Rewritten

Companies can also try to convince us that their food is healthier, even a sort of medicine. We’re used to having vitamins added to our food. (Of course, manufacturers wouldn’t need to add them if they hadn’t been removed during processing.) And some manufacturers are going even further than adding vitamins. One company, called Tree Top, has developed a “low moisture, naturally sweetened apple piece infused with a red-wine extract.” Natural chemicals in red wine called flavonoids are thought to fight cancer. Flavonoids are also found in many fruits and vegetables, including citrus fruits, berries, onions, parsley and pulses. Over 5,000 naturally occurring flavonoids have been found in various plants. Tree Top has added value to an apple by injecting it with flavonoids from red wine.”

Irrelevant Evidence

What irrelevant evidence did the speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 1:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech
Answers For Teacher Reference

I can identify the argument and specific claims in a text. (RI.8.8)
I can evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text (assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims). (RI.8.8)
I can identify when irrelevant evidence is used. (RI.8.8)

### Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

**Speaker’s Claim:**
*Organic eggs are better for you nutritionally than eggs from caged hens.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I’m sure there’s commercialized industries out there that can’t afford the organic layer ration so they go for the cheapest thing possible, which is just cracked corn. I mean, if you give an animal cracked corn, does that animal really get nutrition out of that cracked corn? Does that animal really get the full nutritional benefits that animal needs?”</td>
<td>“So we’re not pumping them with antibiotics or chemicals or pumping our feed with chemicals or anything like that. It’s real natural food at its best and, like I said, it’s not pumped with chemicals or anything of the sort, so therefore the egg is just more nutritional because the chicken gets its nutrition how it should get its nutrition; so therefore the egg is more nutritional for you.”</td>
<td>“Our cholesterol is way better in a pasture-raised organic egg versus a caged system setup.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**
*This implies that because hens in the commercialized industry eat cracked corn, they aren’t getting all the nutrition they need.*

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**
*It explains how the chickens are being given the nutrition they need and aren’t being given chemicals or antibiotics; therefore the eggs they produce are better for you.*

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**
*It explains how organic eggs are better for you—they contain less cholesterol.*
Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td>There isn’t enough evidence about how the eggs are better for you. She mentions lower cholesterol, but that is it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.</td>
<td>I don’t think she linked the nutritional value of the egg with the chemicals. How do chemicals affect the nutritional value of the egg or make the egg healthier? She needs to explain that more clearly.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Irrelevant Evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What irrelevant evidence did the speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.</td>
<td>The evidence about how often chickens lay eggs and how long they rest after laying an egg isn’t linked to the claim. It doesn’t support the claim. To make it support the claim, she would need to explain how organic hens are given the rest they need.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 2:
Evaluating the Argument, Reasoning, and Evidence in a Speech
Answers For Teacher Reference

### Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

**Speaker’s Claim:**
*Companies can charge more money for their foods by claiming that they have added some kind of value to the food.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Evidence 1</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 2</th>
<th>Relevant Evidence 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Consumers will only pay so much for an ear of corn. But they can be convinced to pay a lot more for the same corn if it has been turned into a funny shape, sweetened, and brightly colored” (73).</td>
<td>“Companies can also try to convince us that their food is healthier, even a sort of medicine” (74).</td>
<td>“One company, called Tree Top, has developed a ‘low-moisture, naturally sweetened apple piece infused with a red wine extract.’ Natural chemicals in red wine are thought to fight cancer. So Tree Top has added value to an apple by injecting it with flavonoids from red wine” (74).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:**
- This explains how people will pay more money for food if they think it has some kind of “added value.”
- This is an example of “added value” and how companies can charge us more for food by claiming it contains additional health benefits.
- This is a specific example of a company that has “added value” to a food item.
### Relevant Evidence 4

“It seems that an old-fashioned apple just isn’t enough anymore. We need an apple that fights cancer! We need orange juice with calcium that builds strong bones. We need cereal that keeps us from having a heart attack.” (74)
## Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
<th>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>These are examples of “added value” and how companies can charge us more for food by claiming it contains additional health benefits.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.

The author provides a lot of general examples of how companies can add value to food, but to make it more sufficient I think it needs additional specific examples and more proof that companies actually charge more money for food when they have “added value” to it.

### Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.

Yes—the argument makes sense because he explains how all the evidence he provides is relevant to the claim.

## Irrelevant Evidence

### What irrelevant evidence did the speaker provide? Explain what makes this evidence irrelevant.

The evidence about where flavonoids are found and how many different flavonoids there are is irrelevant because it doesn’t support the claim that companies can charge more money by claiming they have added some kind of value to food. It says, “Flavonoids are also found in many fruits and vegetables, including citrus fruits, berries, onions, parsley and pulses. Over 5,000 naturally occurring flavonoids have been found in various plants.” These are facts about flavonoids, but the excerpt isn’t about flavonoids—that was just an example of how companies make money by claiming they add value to food.
Based on the evidence gathered in the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer and other evidence you have learned in this unit, make a claim based on the question:

Now that you have read a lot of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, which of the four meals you were invited to choose from at the beginning of the unit would you choose to feed your family? Why?

**Meal 1**
- McDonald’s cheeseburger
- Large fries
- Large Coke

**Meal 2**
- Roasted organic chicken
- Roasted organic veggies (yellow potatoes, purple kale, and red winter squash)
- Steamed organic asparagus
- Spring mix salad
- Organic ice cream with organic blackberries

**Meal 3**
- Brined and applewood-smoked barbecue chicken
- Roasted sweet corn
- Rocket (arugula) salad
- Chocolate soufflé

**Meal 4**
- Fava bean toasts and Sonoma boar pâté
- Egg fettuccine with power fire morels, braised leg, and grilled loin of wild Sonoma pig
- Wild East Bay yeast levain
- Local garden salad
- Fulton Street Bing cherry tart
End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3:
Developing a Claim

Name:_____________________________________________________________________

Date:_____________________________________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Claim</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason 1</th>
<th>Reason 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
<th>Evidence A</th>
<th>Evidence B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>Response Features</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2 Point | The features of a 2-point response are  
• Valid inferences and/or claims from the text where required by the prompt  
• Evidence of analysis of the text where required by the prompt  
• Relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text to develop response according to the requirements of the prompt  
• Sufficient number of facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text as required by the prompt  
• Complete sentences where errors do not impact readability |
| 1 Point | The features of a 1-point response are  
• A mostly literal recounting of events or details from the text as required by the prompt  
• Some relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, and/or other information from the text to develop response according to the requirements of the prompt  
• Incomplete sentences or bullets |
| 0 Point | The features of a 0-point response are  
• A response that does not address any of the requirements of the prompt or is totally inaccurate  
• No response (blank answer)  
• A response that is not written in English  
• A response that is unintelligible or indecipherable |

If the prompt requires two texts and the student only references one text, the response can be scored no higher than a 1.
Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 15
Assessment Part 3: Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl
## Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

## Supporting Learning Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Learning Targets</th>
<th>Ongoing Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I can advocate persuasively for one of the four meals Michael Pollan introduces in <em>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</em>.</td>
<td>• End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Developing a Claim (from homework)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Agenda

1. **Opening**  
   A. Unpacking the Learning Target (2 minutes)

2. **Work Time**  
   A. End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl (35 minutes)

3. **Closing and Assessment**  
   A. Exit Ticket: Which Meal Would You Choose to Feed Your Family? (8 minutes)

4. **Homework**  
   A. Read “The Omnivore’s Solution: Some Tips for Eating” on pages 287–290 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and answer this question:  
      - What three tips would you give to people about eating now that you have read most of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*?

## Teaching Notes

- During this assessment, students advocate persuasively in a Fishbowl using the End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Developing a Claim they started in Lesson 14 and completed for homework.
- Depending on the size of your group, you may need to conduct two or three Fishbowl discussions. You may also need longer than the time allocated; consider this when planning.
- Assess each student advocating persuasively in the Fishbowl using the Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric (see supporting materials). This rubric is based on the Advocating Persuasively Checklist from Lesson 13.
- As a celebration at the end of the unit, consider bringing in food students may not have tried before to sample from the meal choices.
- In advance:  
   - Plan the groupings for the Fishbowls. Group students to provide them with the opportunity to respond to a counter claim.
   - Post: Learning target.

## Lesson Vocabulary

- advocate, persuade, convince

## Materials

- *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)
- Fishbowl protocol (from Lesson 13)
- Advocating Persuasively Checklist (from Lesson 13)
- Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric (one per student)
- Exit Ticket: Which Meal Would You Choose to Feed Your Family? Why? (one per student)
- Homework: Tips for Eating (one per student)
## Opening

### A. Unpacking the Learning Target (2 minutes)

- Remind students that in the previous lesson and for homework, they made a claim on their End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Developing a Claim based on the question:
  - “Now that you have read a lot of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and know a lot more than you did in the beginning, which of the four meals you were invited to choose from at the beginning of the unit would you choose to feed your family? Why?”
- Tell students that today, for the final part of their end of unit 1 assessment, they’ll be assessed on their ability to advocate persuasively for their meal by participating in a Fishbowl, just as they practiced in Lesson 13.
- Read the target aloud:
  - “I can advocate persuasively for one of the four meals Michael Pollan introduces in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*.”
- Remind students that to *advocate* means to publicly support an idea and that to *persuade* means to *convince* an audience to take your viewpoint on an issue.

## Meeting Students’ Needs

- Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.
- Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.

## Work Time

### A. End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Advocating Persuasively in a Fishbowl (35 minutes)

- Remind students that they practiced advocating persuasively in a Fishbowl in Lesson 13.
- Be sure students have their text, *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*. Display and review the *Fishbowl protocol* with students. Display and review the *Advocating Persuasively Checklist*. Remind them of the criteria you’ll assess them against.
- Remind students that they should refer to their End of Unit 1 Assessment, Part 3: Developing a Claim to advocate persuasively and that they should also be prepared to respond to a counterclaim by someone else in their Fishbowl discussion.
- Begin Fishbowl 1. Organize the first group of students in the middle of the Fishbowl. The first student will not be able to respond to a counterclaim immediately because no one has gone before; after all students in the center have presented, ask the first student who presented to respond briefly to a counterclaim. All other students should respond to a counterclaim at the end of their presentations.
- Rotate students into the center of the Fishbowl until all students have had a chance to present in the Fishbowl.
- Repeat for Fishbowl Two and for as many fishbowls as you need for the size of your class.
- As students advocate persuasively, assess each one against the *Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric*.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Closing and Assessment</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **A. Exit Ticket: Which Meal Would You Choose to Feed Your Family? (8 minutes)**  
- Remind students that listening to other people advocate persuasively can sometimes make us change our minds. Ask them to think quietly for a minute about the following:  
  * “Did participating in and listening to other Fishbowls cause you to change your minds about your original claim of the meal you would choose?”  
- Distribute copies of the Exit Ticket: Which Meal Would You Choose to Feed Your Family? Why? and ask students to complete them.  
- Collect students’ exit tickets. Thank students for their thoughtful participation in the Fishbowls.  
- End by telling students that in Unit 2 they will explore Michael Pollan’s four food chains further by extending their research to resources away from The Omnivore’s Dilemma book.  
- Distribute Homework: Tips for Eating. | • Using exit tickets allows you to get a quick check for understanding of the learning target so instruction can be adjusted or tailored to students’ needs. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Homework</th>
<th>Meeting Students’ Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Read “The Omnivore’s Solution: Some Tips for Eating” on pages 287–290 of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* and answer this question:  
  – What three tips would you give to people about eating now that you have read most of *The Omnivore’s Dilemma*? |
## Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The speaker …</td>
<td>Makes a strong claim.</td>
<td>A strong claim is made in response to the question to open the presentation.</td>
<td>A claim is made in response to the question to open the presentation.</td>
<td>A claim is made but it doesn’t respond directly to the question or it isn’t presented at the beginning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides clear reasons for making that claim.</td>
<td>Two clear reasons have been provided for making that claim.</td>
<td>Two reasons have been provided for making that claim.</td>
<td>One reason has been provided for making that claim.</td>
<td>No reasons have been provided for making the claim.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides strong supporting evidence for reasons from research.</td>
<td>Two pieces of strong evidence have been provided to support each reason.</td>
<td>Two pieces of evidence have been provided to support each reason.</td>
<td>There is at least one piece of evidence to support each reason.</td>
<td>No evidence is provided to support the reasons presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responds to a counterclaim made by someone else in the Fishbowl.</td>
<td>There is a clear response to a claim made by another student in the Fishbowl.</td>
<td>There is a response to a claim made by another student in the Fishbowl.</td>
<td>There is some evidence of a response to a counterclaim.</td>
<td>There is no response to a claim made by another student.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Advocating Persuasively Checklist Rubric

#### Name:

#### Date:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The speaker …</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact with audience members.</td>
<td>Eye contact is made with many different people in the audience throughout advocating persuasively.</td>
<td>Eye contact is made with a number of people in the audience throughout advocating persuasively.</td>
<td>Eye contact is made with one or two people.</td>
<td>Eye contact is not made with anyone in the audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaks clearly and slowly enough for everyone to hear and understand.</td>
<td>Speaking is paced perfectly throughout—slow and clear enough for everyone to understand.</td>
<td>Speaking is paced well for a majority of the time—slow and clear enough for most people to understand.</td>
<td>Speaking is paced well for some of the time—slow and clear enough for some people to understand.</td>
<td>Speaking is too rushed and not clear enough. It is very difficult for most people to understand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate volume was used.</td>
<td>Volume is appropriate for everyone to hear—not too loud and not too quiet.</td>
<td>Volume is appropriate for most people to hear.</td>
<td>Volume is appropriate for some people to hear.</td>
<td>Volume is challenging for most people to hear.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Exit Ticket: Which Meal Would You Choose to Feed Your Family? Why?

Name:

Date:

Which meal did you choose at the beginning of the unit? Why?

Which meal did you advocate persuasively for? Why?

Which meal would you choose now? Why?
Homework: Tips for Eating

Name: ____________________________

Date: ____________________________

What three tips would you give to people about eating now that you have read most of The Omnivore’s Dilemma?

1. ____________________________

2. ____________________________

3. ____________________________